

THE EXPERIENCE OF REGENERATION AND
EROSION OF CERTAINTY IN THE THEOLOGY
OF SECOND-GENERATION QUAKERS:
NO PLACE FOR DOUBT?

Nikki Coffey Tousley
University of Dayton, Ohio, USA

ABSTRACT

The convincement accounts of first- and second-generation Quakers reveal changes in the implicit, narrative theology of regeneration and revelation, despite a relatively consistent articulated theology. Early Friends experienced one, overarching grace that encompassed justification, sanctification and the restoration of creation, emphasizing the culminating experience of regeneration. Anxiety about election, inherited from Puritanism, was replaced with assurance grounded in an experience of victory over sin that both justified and sanctified, and conferred a new, immediate understanding of the truth. This understanding was a subjective, relational knowledge of God's presence that was only secondarily propositional.

Without the broad vision linking justification and sanctification, which dissipated with the passing of the historical moment, second-generation Friends were left with the expectation of victory over sin, but with no explicit teaching on justification and an experience that suggested the struggle with sin was ongoing. For some, regeneration was easily reduced to individualized ethical perfection without the assurance of forgiveness, which was compounded by the problem of communicating the experience of grace. Second-generation experience left greater room for doubt; and although immediate revelation remained authoritative, Friends began to raise the question of discernment and draw on secondary sources of knowledge.

KEYWORDS

convincement; eschatology; justification; sanctification; authority

I. INTRODUCTION

The Divine essential Truth was now self-evident; there wanted nothing else to prove it. I need not reason about Him; all reasoning was superseded and immersed, by an intuition of that Divine and truly wonderful evidence of that light which proceeded from Himself alone, leaving no place for doubt or any question at all.

*Thomas Story, c. 1738*¹

Seventeenth-century Friends held that knowledge about God must be unmediated. Other sources of authority, such as Scripture or tradition, were not rejected outright, but Friends held that their authoritative appropriation required the experience of regeneration. Because of this emphasis on experience, narrative writings provide a potentially rich source for historical theology of the period. This article explores the theology expressed in Quaker autobiography across the first two generations, drawing on narratives tracts of the 1650s and retrospective journals of the first and second generations.² The analysis focuses on the theology of perfection, knowledge and revelation. It shows that later Friends' experience of regeneration differs from that of the first generation and, therefore, they are less confident about their understanding of, and witness to, the 'truth'. While Thomas Story found 'no place for doubt or any question at all', many of his contemporaries are less certain.

A. HISTORICAL CONTEXT

Quakerism emerged out of the English Civil War, a period of unrest and widespread religious seeking. Gwyn argues that the promise of the Puritan covenant of grace had broken down at the moment of victory, disappointing the hopes of those who had expected a transformation of society.³ First-generation Friends understood themselves to be the true church gathered out of apostasy to complete the failed English reformation. Their prophetic rhetoric and ecstatic worship were rooted in an immediate Presence of the Spirit; however, within two decades, this early enthusiasm was defused. Internal conflict, and concern to distance Quakerism from ranterism and outward warfare, tempered the more extreme forms of witness.⁴ In 1689, the Act of Toleration was passed, providing a new security, and Friends had established their Holy Experiment in Pennsylvania. The vibrant, confident style of early Quaker writing gave way to more measured discipline and reflection on doctrine, and Friends began to develop the boundaries of a sectarian Quakerism that dominated the next century.⁵

B. PREVIOUS SCHOLARSHIP

Most historians of Quakerism describe a transition between the first and second generation of Friends, from an enthusiastic movement with few structural controls to a well-organized religious body with clear boundaries. While the first generation grounded spiritual authority in a sense of immediate revelation by the Spirit, the second generation began to form a new Quaker identity with a distinct communal practice and authority. There seems to have been an intentional development of new structures by leaders, such as George Fox and Margaret Fell, in response to the pressures of internal controversy, persecution and accusations of heresy.⁶

Most research on early Friends has focused on the first generation or, more specifically, on the first decade of the movement, and there is surprisingly little work on the late seventeenth century. Theological studies on the early movement often conclude with a general description of future trends, yet only two studies attempt to examine the period in depth. The most detailed studies of this

transition are Leachman's work on the transformation of Quakerism between 1650 and 1689 and Vann's sociological study of Friends between 1655 and 1755, both of which describe increasing organizational control.⁷ Leachman argues that the primary change was the curbing of enthusiastic worship and moderation of claims to moral perfection that had marked Friends as social radicals.⁸ Her study does not address theology in depth, but outlines important changes such as the emphasis on reason and understanding of perfection as a gradual process among second-generation Friends. Vann's study outlines the social pressures that changed the meaning of conversion and membership as Quakerism became transmitted through the family, with an emphasis on conformity to plain dress and other peculiarities.

While Douglas Gwyn's work on the roots of Quakerism within the seeker movement does not set out to describe transitions, his final chapter addresses changes in Quaker epistemology between early Friends and the second generation. Gwyn's work will be discussed in detail in the conclusion.⁹ Damiano's historical theology of eighteenth-century Friends also looks at the late seventeenth century, although not in detail. She suggests that eighteenth-century Friends understood hedged Quakerism to be a realization of the Reign of God, in which the community served as a place of spiritual formation.¹⁰

Theological studies by Wilcox, Jones and Creasey all focus on aspects of the theology of early Friends. Wilcox presents a general overview of the theology of early Friends as it impacted women, and although an excellent summary, it is less informative for the purposes of this study.¹¹ Dissertations by Jones and Creasey, which focus on early Friends understanding of salvation and Christology, respectively, are most relevant to the present work. Both deal with crucial issues of justification, sanctification and the nature of God, and will be taken up in the final section.¹² Rosemary Moore's thesis is a comprehensive overview of publications of the first decade of Quakerism, and is thus an invaluable bibliographic reference, although it sometimes suffers from an oversimplification of Christian thought.¹³

These studies all form a background for the present work, particularly in developing a baseline for the comparison of first- and second-generation Friends. Yet none analyses in detail early Friends' epistemology and understanding of revelation. There are a few works that deal with Quaker epistemology in brief, generally as part of a discussion of the Quaker understanding of immediate revelation and the Light.¹⁴ Trowell's work on the late seventeenth-century controversy between George Keith and Philadelphia Friends focuses on the nature of Christ, but secondarily deals with epistemology, as does Creasey's study of the use of the terms 'inward' and 'outward' among early Friends.¹⁵ Dobbs' thesis on the concept of authority presents a useful discussion of one aspect of knowing, but his primary focus is the manifestation of authority, rather than the underlying theology of revelation.¹⁶ The present study fills a gap in the study of seventeenth-century Friends, both in its attention to the second generation and in the focus on revelation and theological epistemology as they relate to soteriology.

C. SPIRITUAL AUTOBIOGRAPHY

Spiritual autobiography blossomed in the mid-seventeenth century¹⁷ as a result of the emphasis on self-examination, personal piety, and experience in the English Reformation,¹⁸ which stressed inward confirmation of belief over intellectual assent. Watkins says of Puritanism, 'doctrines which they had learned became almost simultaneously embodied in personal experience and afterwards articulated through narrative and testimony'.¹⁹ Friends took this trend further, prioritizing experience over received doctrine, and thus autobiographical narrative is an important source of early Quaker theology.

Friends were the most prolific writers of spiritual autobiography in the period, publishing short conviction narratives in first decades and journals at the end of the century.²⁰ The first narratives were short tracts addressed to the public, written by new converts to spread the Quaker message by displaying its effect on the life of the author. By the mid-1680s, journals of leaders such as Caton began to appear, and were typically addressed to the next generation of Friends.²¹ The journal became the predominant form, and there are few conviction tracts published after the 1660s that are written at the time of conviction.²² This probably reflects the growing concern to nurture the new movement, an emphasis on the example of elders²³ and the turning inward of the Quaker community.

Joseph Pike says that he writes his journal, c. 1722, because,

It hath, for a long time, lain with some pressure on my mind, to write something of my pilgrimage in this world...not only for the benefit of my own children, for whom it is chiefly intended, but for others also into whose hands it may come.²⁴

Watkins argues that spiritual autobiography gave ordinary Christians a 'language and theory' with which to 'analyze and communicate their religious experience'.²⁵ Although he is not explicit, this 'theory' is a theology of human nature and spiritual development that emerges implicitly in a standard format, although with individual variations. According to Watkins, Puritan doctrine dictated a two-fold experience of law and gospel, in which the Christian must learn, through experience, that justification cannot be earned. Thus, Puritan narratives describe an initial legalistic stage characterized by conviction of bondage to sin and an unfruitful attempt to conquer sin through religious duties. This stage ends with an experience of grace, in which the authors realize that legalism must be abandoned and, as one of the elect, they are justified in spite of sin. Through this experience of the gospel, old truths are understood in a more immediate way, and the assurance of forgiveness is known 'in the heart as well as with the understanding'.²⁶ Puritanism held that it is only after this experience that sin can be resisted, with the assistance of the Holy Spirit. Thus, justification ushered in an ongoing struggle between flesh and Spirit, described using the scriptural language of spiritual warfare, and only an exceptional few were expected to gain victory in this life, even among the elect.²⁷

Similarly, the form, language and dominant metaphors of Quaker autobiography reflect Friends' theology. Although Friends shared much with Puritan contemporaries, they differed on crucial issues, particularly the possibility of victory

over sin. Many had been Puritans, but their stories suggest that they did not find the promised assurance in Puritan teaching, desiring a resolution of the inward warfare that they discovered among Friends. The following outlines five spiritual stages typically reflected in early Quaker narratives: Childhood Religious Experience, Seeking and Youthful Estrangement, Conviction or Day of Visitation, Spiritual Warfare and Regeneration.²⁸ Subsequent sections more fully describe the narratives and develop the theology expressed within them.

D. STRUCTURAL FORMS OF QUAKER NARRATIVES

The convincement tracts written in the first decade of the Quaker movement vary, but contain elements that became typical of later journals. By the early eighteenth century, second-generation narratives have a shared structural form. The earlier narratives may lack some elements, or allude to them briefly, but reflect an idealized spiritual path. There are individual variations, as well as differences between the narratives of the first and second generations, which will be discussed. The stages of spiritual growth in Quaker narratives are outlined below, and examples and a more involved analysis will be given in the following sections.

1. *Childhood Religious Experience*

While Calvinist theology dictated childhood experiences of reproof, the Quaker experience generally includes both law and grace, reflecting the belief in the presence of the inward Seed of Christ from birth.²⁹ Childhood understanding is partial, and full awareness awaits regeneration. Descriptions of childhood experiences of 'tenderness',³⁰ divine comfort and reproof for youthful folly are found in most journals, although reproof is emphasized in the second generation. Birthright Friends also point to the suffering of earlier Friends as an example. The narrative tracts of the first decade often omit childhood, focusing instead on seeking.

2. *Seeking and Youthful Estrangement*

a. *First Generation: Seeking and Doctrinal Convincement.* The first Friends were part of a generation caught up in a search for authentic religion, and describe years of seeking before finding rest within Quakerism. They may have experiences of grace and openings of understanding, but these are temporary or incomplete. Gwyn, who has discussed this period in detail, argues that the Spiritualist concept of 'standstill', a cessation of liturgical forms, was important to many of the seeking groups. They anticipated a new revelation that would resolve the ongoing debates over the Eucharist, often using a form of silent waiting.³¹ Whether or not they are part of such a group, the culmination of the seeking experience for many first-generation Friends is a personal standstill in which they give up seeking in weariness. They may turn to private devotion, although a few indulge in ranterism.

b. *Second Generation: Youthful Estrangement.* Second-generation Friends may describe thirsting after God, but only a few non-birthright Friends undergo a seeking stage like that of the first generation. Most describe youthful indulgence

in play or jesting that leads to a feeling that God's comfort has been withdrawn, often when the author first leaves home. Feelings of distance from God may develop into a period of solitary seeking, though rarely outside of Friends. Most authors describe only minor sins, reporting that God preserved them from 'gross evil'. A few continue to experience both reproof and moments of grace, often struggling with inherited Quaker practices which they had not claimed for themselves.³²

3. *Conviction or Day of Visitation.* Both the standstill of early Friends and the youthful estrangement of later Friends culminate in a new experience of grace that brings hope to the disheartened writer. This may be referred to as a 'day of visitation', and is often described as an experience of God's Presence and opening of the understanding, although the opening may be only partial. Paradoxically, dwelling in this Presence exposes the author's separation from God. This conviction of sin ushers in the next stage, an internal battle in which sin is revealed and, eventually, conquered. Different authors may emphasize either comfort or the conviction of sin, but the latter is most common in second-generation narratives.³³

For some, the experience of Presence is a recognition of the indwelling Christ, although others continue to seek an external God until they receive a further understanding. The initial moment of grace and ensuing spiritual warfare may be temporally distinct in first-generation narratives, and some authors return to seeking as the visitation experience fades, only later experiencing internal struggle.³⁴ The visitation brings comfort and peace, and may come as a tangible voice or through individual devotion.³⁵

The second generation sometimes portrays conviction, warfare and regeneration as a continuous event, with emphasis on the illumination of sin and subsequent judgment.³⁶ Few dwell on the initial experience of Presence, and it typically comes as an abrupt break in which they are 'touched by divine power', or 'the power of the Lord breaks in', followed immediately by spiritual warfare.

The visitation, and other experiences of grace, may open the understanding to some degree prior to regeneration. Many authors not raised as Friends claim that they were convinced of the doctrinal elements of Quakerism prior to conviction. They emphasize direct revelation from God, who shows them Truths, such as the abandonment of liturgy and rejection of the paid ministry, and often describe 'openings' of Scripture during their seeking stage. Some, particularly the leaders writing in the early 1650s, do not mention the influence of Quaker thought, describing only an individual encounter with God through a day visitation, spiritual warfare and regeneration.

In contrast, if conviction of doctrinal principles is discussed by authors raised among Friends, it is generally a result of regeneration rather than a precursor.³⁷ They may describe new inward conviction of the principles they had received by tradition. Although second-generation Friends also insist on direct revelation, they are more likely to describe encounters with leading Friends as 'nursing mothers and fathers' who played an important role in their conviction.

4. *Spiritual Warfare*. For both generations, the day of visitation leads to an internal struggle in which sin is overcome, although there may be a period of further seeking or waiting. As in Puritan writing, Friends use Pauline language of spiritual warfare and other biblical metaphors of threshing or burning, and victory. Many write in the passive tense, as witnesses to a battle between the Seed and evil that occurs within them. Watkins argues that in Puritan thought, only the regenerated person could undergo this experience of warfare, and there was no final assurance except for a few, extraordinary Christians.³⁸ For Quakers, conviction of sin was only an initial step toward regeneration, and a final assurance was both possible and expected.

Conviction of sin may relate to specific transgressions, but more often is cast in terms of indulgence in self-will and pride. For the first generation, particularly those who had been religious leaders, the struggle may be to surrender worldly wisdom. In both generations, the humility of crying out to God, rather than relying on human works, is crucial to restore the relationship with God and overcome sin.

5. *Regeneration*. Following the threshing experience, early Friends describe an experience of regeneration and rebirth in which sin is finally conquered and the author recognizes that Christ is immediately present rather than in a distant heaven. The imagery of the first generation suggests a completion of creation and return to the state of Adam before the fall. They often use highly sensory language to describe new understandings and additional openings of Scripture. Regeneration may lead a call to travel in the ministry, and provides the strength to suffer persecution.³⁹

Regeneration in the experience of the second generation is seldom the complete victory reported by early Friends, and many authors have an ongoing struggle to remain faithful. They often report an immediate knowledge of the truth of Quaker principles that have previously been only known by tradition. A few do not experience a clear rebirth, and seem more like their Puritan contemporaries who experienced an ongoing warfare and held a more distant view of God. This change in the experience of regeneration demands a corresponding shift in the theology of revelation, which will be discussed in detail. There may be a new understanding, including a personal conviction of inherited principles; however, the emphasis is generally on accepting the cross of Quaker discipline.⁴⁰

E. METHODS

Approximately twenty narratives from each generation were used in this study, and an attempt was made to obtain writing from men and women, leaders and non-leaders, and from differing social classes.⁴¹ The generations were defined by the date of conviction, rather than birth date or date of publication. 'First-generation Friends' were those convinced before 1660, while 'second-generation' Friends were convinced between 1675 and 1700 or entered adulthood during this time.⁴² Two thirds of the second-generation Friends had Quaker parents. Some

manuscripts discussed here were not published until the nineteenth century or later, perhaps because they were not known or did not fit the theology of eighteenth-century Friends. These provide insights into the lives of Friends not involved in the ministry. The second generation will be discussed in more detail, as there has been little academic study of this period. For both generations, the lives of selected individuals will serve as examples, followed by a general discussion based on the conviction narratives of other individuals.

F. TERMINOLOGY

Seventeenth-century Friends distinguished between the experiences of ‘convincement’ and ‘conversion’ in order to reinforce the necessity of spiritual rebirth. In this dichotomy, conviction refers to acceptance of Quaker belief, while conversion refers to acceptance of the Quaker discipline as the result of a threshing experience that leads to a new birth. In practice, the terms are not used consistently, and some authors use other expressions to describe these experiences.⁴³ The attempt to categorize experience can result in an imposed structure, and the degree to which early Friends themselves imposed a structure is one of the questions of this article. Yet in order to provide a clear terminology, terms such as conviction, regeneration, and conversion must be defined. The following usage is followed, and all except the first, which has been coined for this study, approximate the most common early Quaker usage:

<i>Doctrinal conviction</i>	The acceptance of Quaker doctrine and belief, whether a result of a cognitive process or a response to immediate revelation.
<i>Day of Visitation</i>	An experience of God’s Presence that offers hope and comfort, but also exposes sin and leads to an internal battle. It may be refused. The term conviction may also be used to describe this experience, but will be used to describe the awareness of sin that is one aspect of the day of visitation. Here, the day of visitation is distinguished from ensuing spiritual warfare, although early Friends use the term to describe both the initial experience of grace and the ensuing struggle. ⁴⁴
<i>Regeneration</i> ⁴⁵	The experience of rebirth, following a day of visitation and a period of spiritual warfare, that leads to a sense of transformation and enables conversion.
<i>Conversion</i> ⁴⁶	The acceptance and living out of a purified life, including specifically Quaker testimonies such as plain speech.
<i>Convincement</i>	The term conviction, without a qualifier, will be used to refer to the entire process of becoming a Quaker, which includes doctrinal conviction, visitation and internal warfare, and regeneration and conversion, although some authors may not describe all experiences. This is the most common use of the term among early Friends.

The relationship of these terms to the theological categories of justification and sanctification, and a third experience of the Spirit is discussed in the final section.⁴⁷

G. OUTLINE

The remainder of the article is divided into three sections. Sections II and III describe first-generation and second-generation experience, respectively. Each presents a detailed description of representative narratives, and then gives a more general discussion of the theology of regeneration, knowledge and sources of knowledge that is implicit in the accounts. The final section draws out general conclusions about seventeenth-century Quaker soteriology and theology of revelation.

II. FIRST-GENERATION EXPERIENCE

A. THROUGH THE FLAMING SWORD: FRIENDS EXPERIENCE IN THE 1650S

The narratives of the 1650s describe the conviction experiences of first-generation Friends, but are not autobiographical in a broad sense. Most describe a period of anxiety over sin and search for authentic religion (seeking), an experience of God (day of visitation) that leads to an internal spiritual warfare, and a victory in which sin is conquered (regeneration), but may emphasize one aspect of the spiritual journey. Description of childhood and early religious experience is often missing in the tracts, though not in journals, and there may be other experiences of grace prior to conviction. The earliest narratives were written as part of a tract, or are letters published because they had value for others.⁴⁸ This section will look in detail at accounts from tracts by Richard Hubberthorn, Isaac Penington and William Dewsbury, and then the theology implicit in these and other narratives of the first decade of the Quaker movement will be discussed. A few journals are quoted in this discussion, but differences between journals and earlier tracts will be discussed in the final section.

Richard Hubberthorn (c. 1628–1662),⁴⁹ a yeoman farmer from Yealand Conyers in northern Lancashire, was among the leaders of a group of seekers in Westmoreland when Fox first visited the area in 1652. He became an active Quaker minister in Norwich and London, writing several tracts before he died in prison in 1662,⁵⁰ and his works were published as a collection the year following his death. Hubberthorn wrote one of the earliest autobiographical tracts in 1653 as a justification of his ministry to the authorities, while held in prison at Chester.⁵¹ He seems to have been held under the laws against vagrancy, and argues that Elisha, Amos, Paul and Jesus left their homes to prophesy, implying he has the same authority from God.⁵²

Hubberthorn's narrative gives little detail of his life, instead emphasizing his day of visitation, spiritual warfare and subsequent calling to preach, with only brief references to seeking and regeneration. He says that as a youth he girded himself, 'and went wether I would, and then I yeilded obedience to myself, and to the will of man and was a man pleaser, but the Will of God I knew not, neither was obedient to his commands'.⁵³ By his own account, he was considered knowledgeable about religion, and his primary struggle seems to be giving up the

temptation to worldly wisdom. This is reflected in the following account of his day of visitation, which is quoted at length to give a sense of the oratory style of the period.

...But when the Lord was pleased to reveal his Son in me, and make known His will unto me, to enlighten me with his true Light which hath enlightened everyone that cometh into the World, and by it let me see myself to be a stranger to him, and knew him not, though I was grown mighty in the *Aegyptians* Wisdom, and was in love with the World, and in the favour of men, and in a profession and words of men's wisdom exceeded others, being in a form of godliness, but was ignorant of his Power and his Word; but when his Power was made manifest, and his Word spoke within me, which Word was in my heart, and was as a fire or hammer; and this Word being made manifest within me, & my Conscience being awakened by the Light of God, which did convince me of sin, and did testifie against all my words and actions, and that *just* judgments of God were revealed from Heaven against that Nature I lived in, and the Trumpet of the Lord Sounded within me, and the Earth did tremble, and the Vials of the Wrath of the Almighty were poured down upon me, and the Powers of the Earth were terribly shaken, the foundation of Earthly Wisdom and Earthly knowledge was shaken, and the Judgements of God were upon the outward man.⁵⁴

The visitation experience is a revelation of the indwelling Christ, which exposes the separation from God caused by Hubberthorn's intellectual pride. This conviction of sin leads to an internal battle, and he continues with an even longer account of internal warfare. He says his flesh wasted from his bones, his bones smote together and his pride and lusts were both hammered down and burned up.⁵⁵ The description of judgment concludes with a brief account of regeneration, 'and the Lord raised me up in a love to his Word, by which all of the powers of the Earth did tremble, and the Earth itself was shaken by it, and by this Word I was called to go and declare it'.⁵⁶

Hubberthorn does not dwell on regeneration, merely saying that he was raised up to love the Word, but goes on to justify his ministry. He says the Word has the power to shake the earth, suggesting he carries with him the authority to make the earth tremble. This authority is rooted in submission to the hammer of God, and obedience brings him close to a spiritual power that is far greater than the false wisdom and pride that he surrendered. He does not explicitly say that regeneration brought a new understanding, but suggests this implicitly in his claim to the same power that inspired the prophets. Through this power he declares the truth to his earthly authorities, writing, 'I do witness the same Word of God the true prophets of the Lord were commanded by to declare against all sin and ungodliness'.⁵⁷ Hubberthorn is not claiming divine power, though it is easy to see why Friends were accused of doing so.

The sense of authority is also heightened by his rhetoric. As Bauman notes, the writing of the early Quaker movement has an exhortative and incantational style, in which scriptural phrases and metaphors are combined and recombined.⁵⁸ This style may reflect the preaching style and oral testimonies of early Friends, and conveys a sense of immediacy and God's activity in the historical moment.

William Dewsbury (c. 1621–1688),⁵⁹ from Allathorp, Yorkshire, was a clothier's apprentice who enlisted in Cromwell's army. He joined Friends in 1651 when Fox visited Balby, becoming an important leader and pamphleteer and spending almost half of his adult life in prison for the faith.⁶⁰ His narrative, written in Northampton prison in 1655,⁶¹ describes childhood awareness of God followed by a period of seeking. His experiences of redemption, inward warfare, and regeneration occur over six years beginning in 1648. He dates the culminating experience to the year he met Fox, but does not mention external influences in his convictionment.

Unusually, Dewsbury expresses a Puritan view of childhood, opening his account with the words 'I was conceived in iniquity', adding that the Light opened his conscience at eight, exposing his sinful condition.⁶² This childhood experience leads to an extended period of seeking. As he tried to satisfy God's justice in outward observances, a flaming sword repeatedly cut him down. The sword, which appears at different stages of his journey, is a reference to the sword placed at the entrance to the garden after Adam and Eve were expelled, 'which turned every way, to keep the way to the tree of life'.⁶³ He equates the sword with the Law:

I found no rest nor peace to my weary soul, but the flaming sword, the Righteous Law of God, cryed in me for a perfect fulfilling of the Law of God, and did meet me where-ever I was, that I could find no peace in that worship of God that the world had built up.⁶⁴

As an apprentice, Dewsbury continued to try to satisfy the law, looking for answers among the 'professors' of various faiths. He joined Cromwell, extending his seeking as far as Edinburgh because he heard of a reformed Church there, but was disappointed. Coming to a standstill, he returned home to 'wait upon the Lord in the way of his judgments'.⁶⁵

Dewsbury's description of his convictionment is structured around the scriptural story: seeking with Israel, the coming of Christ in a day of visitation, the spiritual warfare of the book of Revelation and, finally, regeneration described as a return to the garden of Eden. Over six years he 'witnessed' the fulfilment of Scripture within himself, from the condemnation of Cain and plagues of Egypt, the promise of redemption given by the prophets and the anticipation of Christ declared by John. He says he

breathed and thirsted after Christ to save me freely with his blood or I perished for ever, in this condemned estate I lay waiting for the coming of Christ, who in the time appointed of the Father appeared to my soul...and my dead soul heard his voyce, and by his voyce was made to live, who created in me a lively hope.⁶⁶

He is sealed to the covenant through Christ's blood, but is shown that sin and death still reign over creation until 'Christ be manifest'. His complete release from the burden of the law awaits the final battle of Revelation. He watches as the beast slays God's witnesses,⁶⁷ and he experiences the war of the Spirit and flesh, identifying with Jesus and Paul:

Then I was led by the Spirit into the wilderness and tempted of the Devill, that the Scripture might be fulfilled, *Luke 4.1*. In that day and hour of temptation...I witnessed these scriptures fulfilled in me of *Paul's* condition, wherein he complained as I then did, who found a war in my members raging against the Law of my mind.⁶⁸

Again he waited, 'groaning under the body of sin in the day and hour of temptation, until it pleased the Lord to manifest his power to free me'.⁶⁹ He stands with the other witnesses slain by the beast, as they are resurrected, and the earth shakes with judgment, purging all in him that does not know God. Finally, he is freed of the condemnation of the law, and thus of the sword which has blocked his way into the garden.

[My] garment is washed, and made white in the blood of the Lamb, who hath led me through the gates of the city into the New *Jerusalem*...where my soul now feeds upon the tree of Life... I witness that I am regenerated and born again of the immortal seed, and hath partaked on the first resurrection, on whom the second death hath no power.⁷⁰

Dewsbury ends his account without a justification of his call to minister, but the authority is implicit in his concluding declaration of Quaker principles.

*Isaac Penington (1616–1679)*⁷¹ was a prolific writer and important leader of the first generation, although not convinced until 1658. Mary and Isaac Penington, a wealthy couple from Chalfont, Buckinghamshire, had been seekers since the early 1640s. He wrote on religion extensively before joining Friends, at one point building an independent congregation. The couple lost his estate to persecution, and he died after falling ill in prison in 1679. His narrative was written in 1659, and includes 'a Few Words concerning the Way of Knowing' that are relevant here.

Penington's spiritual trajectory is more complex than most, but includes discussion of childhood experiences of grace, seeking, a day of visitation that approximates regeneration and a second experience of regeneration when he is able to turn to the inward Christ, though the purification continues gradually after regeneration. The day of visitation occurs well before his final experience of regeneration, and there is little language of spiritual warfare, although he is brought to a state of complete vulnerability before God prior to regeneration.

Penington begins by describing a fear and longing for the Lord in his tender years, during which the 'seed of eternity...balanced my Spirit almost continually; but I knew it not distinctly, so as to turn to it, and give up to it, entirely and understandingly'.⁷² He yearned for knowledge of God, and as a youth became entangled in concerns about election. Over several years of seeking he remained troubled over the possibility of being separated from God's love for eternity, becoming depressed and physically ill. He grappled with 'secret corruptions and temptations', until abruptly a day of visitation came when

the Lord my God owned me, and sealed his love unto me, and light sprang within me, which made not only the Scriptures, but the very outward creatures glorious in my sight, and everything was sweet and pleasant and lightsome around me.⁷³

Penington's new perception suggests an experience of regeneration; however, overwhelmed, he prayed for the grace of this initial visitation to be taken away, writing

my mind did not yet know how to turn to and dwell with that which gave me the savour, or rightly read what God did daily write in my heart, which sufficiently manifested itself to be of him, by its living virtue and pure operation upon me... and [I] durst not receive anything from God immediately.⁷⁴

The experience gave him some peace from his seeking, 'I had sweetness, comfort and refreshment for a long season. But I did not then know how to turn to and dwell with that which gave me the savour'.⁷⁵ During this time, he says that God daily opened Scripture and taught him, and he became a leader of an Independent congregation. Yet as abruptly as his day of grace came, it was removed, and he was

smitten and, broken, and distressed by the Lord, confounded in my worship, confounded in my knowledge, stripped of all in one day (which is hard to utter) and was a matter of amazement to all that beheld me. I lay open and naked to all who would enquire of me... I desired to pray as I had formally done; but I found I knew him not, and could not tell how to pray, or in any-wise to come near him, as I had formerly done.⁷⁶

He does not use the language of warfare, but is brought to a state of complete vulnerability and bewilderment in which his previous knowledge and leadership fails. Abandonment, rather than warfare, is the primary metaphor. The experience is analogous to the apocalypse that Dewsbury witnesses, but he experiences sin as separation rather than guilt. He says 'I had no sense of guilt within me, but was sick with love towards [the Lord], as one violently rent from the bosom of his beloved'.⁷⁷ Release finally came through another sudden, sensory experience of grace, but this time it was lasting:

The Lord opened my spirit, the Lord gave me the certain and sensible feeling of the pure seed, which had been with me from the beginning; the Lord caused his holy power to fall upon me, and gave me such an inward demonstration and feeling of the seed of life, that I cried out in my spirit '*This is he, this is he; there's not another, and never was another. He was always near me, though I knew him not*'.⁷⁸

This time he was able to surrender to this Presence, and he describes being conformed to it, though without the imagery of spiritual warfare. 'And so in the willingness, which God had wrought in me...I gave up to be instructed, exercised, and led by him'.⁷⁹

Penington emphasizes a new understanding of the Lord who is with him. He had previously tasted the Love of God during an initial day of visitation, but was not ready to receive Christ immediately. Through regeneration, he now knows a Christ who dwells, and has always dwelt, intimately within him. Although he does not emphasize a struggle for obedience, Penington's new sight comes only with the confounding of his false knowledge and recognition of his utter vulnerability when separated from God.

There is also an outward change, or conversion, required, and he describes the public shame of Quaker discipline as a cross that he must bear. Like Hubberthorn,

Penington is enabled for ministry by his experience, saying that ‘having met with the true way...I cannot be silent’.⁸⁰ He urges others to wait for this experience if they would know Christ, who is the only way to knowledge:

retire inwardly, and wait to feel somewhat of the Lord, somewhat of his Holy Spirit and power, discovering and drawing from that which is contrary to him, and into his holy nature and heavenly image. And then, as the mind is joined to this, somewhat is received, some true life, some true light, some true discerning; which the creature not exceeding (but abiding in the measure of it) is safe; but it is easy erring from this, but hard abiding with it, and not going before its leadings. But he that feels life and begins in life, Doth he not begin safely? And he that waits, and fears, and goes on no further than his captain goes before him, doth he not proceed safely? Yea very safely, even till he cometh to be so settled and established in the virtue, demonstration and power of the truth, as nothing can prevail to shake him.⁸¹

Penington struggles with describing what it is that is conferred in the moment of grace, but is clear that its fruit is true knowledge. There is a less immediate sense of victory than in Hubberthorn and Dewsbury’s account, but assurance comes with time and the Presence of Christ is what enables him to submit. Penington admits of the possibility of erring, but the difficulty is abiding in Christ, not discernment. In abiding, one is drawn into and conformed to the image of God, sharing in the life and light. Knowledge, election and righteousness belong to Christ; yet by turning to and waiting in the Presence of Christ, they can be claimed with assurance by regenerated humanity. Penington is writing in 1668, and his greater emphasis on the need to continue to abide in the Seed may be a reflection of a shift in Quaker thought, as the community, and the individual, was faced with ongoing temptation and struggle.

B. COMMON THREADS

The life stories of these first-generation Friends provide insight into the way in which experience both shapes and is shaped by communal theology. There is little explicit theological reflection in the narratives, but they display common perceptions and theological commitments. The final section will discuss theology in detail, but this section will draw out the common threads in areas which are crucial to early Friends’ understanding of revelation: regeneration, knowledge and the use of Scripture and tradition.

1. *Regeneration.* Almost all first-generation narratives describe an initial experience of grace leading to an internal struggle and final victory, though these may be temporally distinct. Some authors, like Hubberthorn, emphasize spiritual warfare and obedience, while others, like Penington, emphasize a new relationship with God. Yet for both, the fruits of regeneration are fulfilment of the quest for authentic religion and the commission to bring others to the same experience.

Hubberthorn only touches on the more positive aspects of grace, which may reflect the difficulty of describing this new experience. The language of spiritual warfare was already in currency among Puritans, and easily appropriated,⁸² but the Quaker experiences of the immediate Christ and regeneration required a new

language, or at least a new appropriation of old language. Penington struggles to express the 'somewhat' that he discovers; however, he is clear there is an experience in which he is first drawn toward God and then is joined to God as he abides in that relationship.⁸³ Gotherson says that the experience is 'too difficult to utter',⁸⁴ and Crook writes in his journal, 'Oh! the gloriousness and blessedness of that day! How, or wherewith, shall I demonstrate it?' He manages to express something of the new relationship, writing that he was 'broken, melted and overcome with the love of God'.⁸⁵ This difficulty with expressing the experience is real, but also served to create a distance from worldly wisdom. Friends use a variety of scriptural passages pointing to the inability of the un-regenerated to comprehend the experience, and to their own partial understanding prior to regeneration.⁸⁶

First-generation Friends used a variety of interconnected metaphors in the attempt to describe conviction, most of which are based on the apocalyptic imagery of Revelation.⁸⁷ The metaphor of death and resurrection/second birth is most common, and is often coupled with the language of spiritual warfare.⁸⁸ Although there is debate about the degree to which Friends in the 1650s expected an outward apocalypse or revolution, they describe an inward experience of judgment and purging that led to a new identity.⁸⁹ Regeneration required the crucifixion of self-will, or 'inward cross', as well as the more outward 'cross' of Quaker discipline and ensuing persecution, although the call to preach is emphasized over ethics by the earliest writers.⁹⁰ For some, such as Penington and most second-generation authors, conversion was the result of regeneration and a gradual process of conformance to God's image, but others suggest a complete conversion at the moment of regeneration.

Less common are references to the historical crucifixion, although Naylor insists that it was his faith in the outward cross that prepared him to receive the experience of an inward Christ.⁹¹ Dewsbury experiences a day of visitation in which he is sealed to God by Christ's blood, but is shown that it is insufficient. This suggests that the day of visitation may be equated with the Puritan experience of the gospel, or justification, but that justification cannot be separated from sanctification, which may occur simultaneously. Complete assurance was contingent on the eradication of sin accomplished through waiting in the Presence and submitting to the purging of spiritual warfare. John Burnyeat makes this distinction between the justification of past sins and the possibility of victory over sin in the future. Waiting in the Light that has been revealed to him, he says 'Then I saw there was need of a Saviour to save from sin, as well of the blood of a sacrificed Christ to blot out sin... Then began the warfare of true striving to enter the kingdom'.⁹² Jones, in his study of Fox's soteriology, argues that early Friends held that justification and sanctification are inseparable. This did not necessarily imply that perfection was instantaneous. According to Jones, Fox argued for a single work of grace that justified and enabled perfection, but perfection might occur over time.⁹³ The experience of the early writers seems to be of immediate perfection, though there is recognition that it must be maintained with diligence.

Two other metaphors are significant, though less common: the return to the garden and the opening of the senses. These point to a transformed relationship with creation that is accomplished alongside spiritual rebirth. Dewsbury, having been sealed to God, waits groaning for a new creation, until Christ is manifest.⁹⁴ Through this power he is resurrected, and comes to the tree of life that had been blocked by the sword of the law. George Fox's journal, probably dictated c. 1675, contains similar imagery.

Now I was come up in spirit through the flaming sword into the paradise of God. All things were new, and all the creation gave another smell unto me than before, beyond what words can utter. I knew nothing but pureness, and innocence, and righteousness, being renewed up into the image of God by Christ Jesus, so that I say I was come up to the state of Adam which he was in before he fell.⁹⁵

Fox's vibrant description of a new smell is unusual, but many authors describe an opening of the eyes or, less often, the ears, and may claim to know 'sensibly' or 'experimentally'.⁹⁶ This sensory language is not explicitly scriptural, but is often related to creation imagery, as it is here. It serves to highlight the unmediated nature and certainty with which Friends held their beliefs. Gwyn suggests that Friends believed that Adam's primeval dominion over creation was restored through spiritual rebirth.⁹⁷ This does not necessarily refer to an outward restoration of creation, but to a new understanding of the existing creation. This is suggested by the revelation received by Dewsbury that death has reigned over creation, which parallels the inward manifestation of the Seed that reveals sin.⁹⁸ Although generally Friends do not claim revelation of specific knowledge, his sense of dominion leads Fox to the startling claim that after his regeneration experience, 'I was at a stand in my mind whether I should practice physic... seeing the natures and virtues were so open to me by the Lord'.⁹⁹

While not all Friends claim a new relationship to creation, almost all describe a transformed, intimate relationship with God.¹⁰⁰ This 'somewhat' of God, to use Penington's description, is most often referred to as the Seed, Life or Light of Christ.¹⁰¹ This pre-existent Seed is revealed at a day of visitation, but learning to abide in and submit to it is essential to the complete assurance of God's Presence and love, in which Penington rejoices. Martha Simmons uses the intimate language of Song of Solomon, saying '[God] now has given me a resting place with him; *this is my beloved, and this is my friend, O daughters of Jerusalem*'.¹⁰² Burrough also expresses the joy and completion in relational terms.

Praised, praised be the Lord for evermore, who hath separated me from the World and Worldly glories, and hath made me a partaker in his Love, in whom my Soul hath full satisfaction, joy and content. Thus have I travelled through the world, even unto the end, and am now come to the beginning of that which shall never have end'.¹⁰³

The result of this new relationship was assurance of God's presence and empowerment, whether for public ministry, resistance to social and familial pressures or enduring persecution. Paradoxically, surrender led to the imperative and power to proclaim the gospel, but the power remained Christ's. Friends often used the

passive voice in describing their experiences, in order to convey this tension between complete obedience and limitless power. In the excerpts above, both Hubberthorn and Dewsbury are *witnesses* to the power that shakes the earth and conquers sin within them. The biblical metaphor of the clay vessel is used by some Friends to describe this reality, although it is more common in the longer narratives. The vessel contains the Spirit, but remains a clay jar.¹⁰⁴ Dewsbury also uses the Pauline language of the battle between the flesh and spirit, which suggests a more intimate involvement in the struggle.

Although a few Friends point to the need to remain diligent in abiding in the Light, few express doubt or spiritual struggle after conviction.¹⁰⁵ Penington is the only one among the three Friends discussed who speaks specifically about bearing the cross of the conversion that is required. More important is the power that allows all three men to declare the truth of their new found relationship to the world. They describe the Christ they have come to know as an indwelling Teacher, and few raise questions of discernment or uncertainty, particularly in the initial years of the movement.

While Puritanism provided a language to describe internal warfare and obedience, Friends had to develop a new way to describe their experience once they had turned to Christ. They found an assurance and understanding through waiting and abiding in the Seed of an ever-present God. Although few express it as well as Penington, this suggests complete certainty of the love of God.¹⁰⁶ Abiding in the relationship, Friends describe being conformed to the image of God and being brought to a new awareness of the world. Although they find a new language in the promises of a new creation in the book of Revelation, the usage varies greatly between writers. Some emphasize obedience and the language of spiritual warfare that lead up to the new creation, while others stress a transformed relationship with God, and with creation, that come with the victory over sin. This may reflect some differences in theology, but all of the earliest writers experience a sense of assurance and victory.

2. *Knowing.* Knowledge and the possibility of understanding Truth is intimately linked with regeneration in early Quaker thought. Although the authors are occasionally given concrete knowledge, often through the 'opening'¹⁰⁷ of Scripture, the central experience is the revelation of Godself, present immediately. Secondly, it is the revelation of who the writer is in relationship to God and creation, and ushers in the judgment that transforms and restores these relationships. Truth is a characteristic of Christ, shared with humanity through the relationship with the indwelling Seed or Light. This occurs only with a rejection of human wisdom and reliance on the inward teacher, which in turn confers authority and the call to witness.

Puritans argued giving up the legalistic search was necessary to experience grace, and some seekers called for a standstill of liturgical forms; however, Quakers urged a complete surrender of all forms of seeking in a rejection of worldly wisdom and human constructions of God. They were part of a generation that sought authentic knowledge and drew on Protestant scholasticism, but found that

they must give up the search, wait and learn to be taught by Christ. The emphasis on submission of the human will as a step toward regeneration is not unique to Friends, but unusually, they cast this struggle in terms of the attempt to know God.

The importance of giving up human constructions is evident in several narratives. Although some first-generation Friends describe a general struggle to be obedient,¹⁰⁸ the struggle with pride, and particularly pretensions to human wisdom, is predominate. Many of the earliest writers had been religious leaders before encountering Friends, and intellectual pride might be expected to be a central issue. For them, though probably not for all Friends,¹⁰⁹ pride was rooted in human notions about God and a reputation for wisdom in the world's eyes. Thus, they dichotomize false worldly wisdom with the true wisdom that comes, immediately, from Christ, and appear to reject reason as a way to know God.¹¹⁰ This true wisdom only comes when one is willing to give up, wait and become a fool in the world's eyes.¹¹¹

Underlying this theology is the understanding that authority, righteousness and knowledge belong only to Christ, but are shared with humanity through the Presence of Christ as indwelling Seed.¹¹² Any attempt to claim them for humanity is in vain outside of this relationship, and all knowledge must come from knowledge of Christ. Crook says, 'The true saving Christ of God, is indeed Life, Power and Virtue, whom to know as such is the Knowledge of the Truth'.¹¹³ Penington, in a treatise written in the early 1670s, related knowledge of Christ and other knowledge, 'And doth not Christ, our High Priest and Apostle, keep all the people's knowledge?... How is he the truth? How is he the life? Is he so by any literal or outward or knowledge of him; or by the inward, spiritual and living knowledge of him?'¹¹⁴

Although the earliest writers do not often ask questions of discernment, knowledge is confirmed by a sense of comfort and peace within the relationship with God. This is particularly evident in later journals of some first-generation authors, particularly women, who initially resist a call to the ministry.¹¹⁵ They describe a growing concern and weight as they resist, which is relieved as they are obedient. Although they occasionally report a vision or hearing a tangible voice, these direct experiences are not given particular weight. Thus, revelation confers the ability to recognize that Truth as that which is consistent with the life of God, rather than communicating information from God.

Thus, rather than knowledge *about* God, Friends found a new relationship to Godself, present as a Seed. They found that new relationship opened up Scripture, knowledge of God and creation itself, but only within the relationship as they become conformed to God's image. Nesti concurs, saying that early Friends did not argue for special revelation but found that 'The "content" of revelation consisted essentially in man's interior non-conceptual awareness of God'.¹¹⁶ Knowing required giving up human constructions about God, and recognizing that all knowledge is a gift of grace. Because knowing is relational, discernment was through a sense of Peace that reflected a consistency with the Life of God experienced in the relationship. Susannah Blanford, writing in 1698 of the early years of the movement, summarizes,

*Christ Jesus the Rock, the Mystery hid from Ages and Generations, is made known to us, of which knowledge I have learned... which is the Key of David, which opens and shuts, and gives the true Understanding of the Mystery of the Kingdom of Heaven.*¹¹⁷

From this foundation, early Friends were able to proclaim the truth with authority.

3. *Scripture, Reason and Tradition.* The experience of regeneration also placed first-generation Friends in a new relationship with other sources of knowledge. Rhetorically, early Friends often rejected reason and tradition outright, while Scripture was subordinated to immediate revelation. In reality, they drew on other sources in constructing their theology, including Puritan doctrine, but maintained the primacy of immediate revelation to authenticate and bring a new perspective on other sources. Thus, although Friends insisted that Scripture not be 'interpreted', which they saw as a purely human endeavour, they, in fact, appropriate Scripture boldly to describe their experience.

Early Friends' use of Scripture is typically literal and direct in discursive writing,¹¹⁸ but in relating the inward appearance of Christ they turn to typology, in which their experience is read into the unfolding and fulfilment of the scriptural story. Within the new relationship to Christ, they believed they were inheriting the blessings of Israel and the same spirit that inspired the prophets and apostles. Almost all report an 'opening' of Scripture after regeneration, in which they now understood texts through the Spirit, and often refer to those who try to interpret Scripture without this experience as 'thieves'. Although they rejected 'interpretation', they readily used Scripture to relate their experience. Rather than argue a point from the text,¹¹⁹ they placed themselves within the scriptural tradition. Palmer argues that they were immersed in the scriptural world to the point of living out the stories.¹²⁰ One of the most striking examples is Dewsbury's narrative account, outlined above, in which he is a witness to the sweep of salvation history.

While there are descriptions of explicit revelatory experiences within early Quakerism, such as Fox's vision of a people to be gathered at the beginning of his ministry,¹²¹ Friends drew even more extensively on Scripture as a source of doctrine. Dobbs argues that Fox had so absorbed the scriptural tradition that his new revelations were really an illumination of Scripture.¹²² While Scripture was the primary source, Christian tradition and reason also served as sources for early Quaker theology.¹²³ For instance, the practice of silent worship and Friends' language of new covenant were derived from other groups,¹²⁴ and, as has been shown, their understanding of justification and sanctification was an elaboration on Puritan doctrine. Yet they minimized these continuities, and the use of reason, in order to distinguish Friends from the apostasy and separation from God they saw in the churches around them. Regardless of the source of knowledge—Scripture, tradition, reason or experience—Friends insisted that these sources were *opened* only through regeneration and the renewed relationship with God.

C. TRANSITIONS: THE EMERGENCE OF THE QUAKER JOURNAL

William Caton's journal was probably the first published by Friends, appearing in 1689 as 'both an example and a testimony of truth' to Friends.¹²⁵ The memoirs of several other leaders followed, almost always posthumously, including Fox's journal published in 1694.¹²⁶ The journals typically include a retrospective account of youth, seeking, conviction and calling to the ministry, prefacing a more concise record of subsequent religious life.¹²⁷ Much of the theology implicit in the journals is consistent with the earlier tracts, but there are shifts which anticipate the second-generation narratives.

Journals often have a less oratorical style than the earlier tracts, although they utilize exhortative language to emphasize key experiences, particularly spiritual warfare.¹²⁸ The structure reflects the stages found in the narrative tracts, but more consistently includes childhood experiences of grace and describes the call to ministry in depth. The remainder of each text typically describes travels in the ministry, disputations with non-Friends and sufferings. The portions of the journals describing the period after conviction vary in style and the degree of biographical detail, and may be less scriptural than the conviction account in the same text.¹²⁹

The overall theology of most of these narratives is similar to the earlier tracts, and the journals of Burnyeat, Fox and Crook are quoted in the discussion above. There is some discussion of the role of elders among the journals, as well as the difficulties of conversion and the need for diligence in abiding in the Light. As was argued above, Penington's relatively late tract also has this emphasis, which reflects a growing concern among Friends with discernment and the possibility of erring. The journalists, like the writers of the tracts, experience an initial day of visitation that leads to spiritual warfare and regeneration, with an experience of assurance and certainty. Some, like Hubberthorn, emphasize spiritual warfare, while others, like Penington, stress the new perception and relationship with God.¹³⁰

The call to ministry may present an additional spiritual test for some, as has been discussed, and a few, like Penington, see conversion as a cross. Most describe imprisonment and other sufferings alongside travels in the ministry, but few relate major spiritual struggles following conviction and the call to ministry. Watkins says of Fox, suggesting it was true of the era, 'His theology did not allow for growth in grace after conviction and so it is only in the opening section that any sort of spiritual progress is recorded'.¹³¹ He says Fox emphasizes his timidity prior to conviction, and authority after he has met the inward Christ. There are exceptions. The journals of Caton and Thomas Ellwood are unusual among first-generation Friends, in that they do not describe a period of seeking.¹³² Both men were relatively young when convinced, in 1652 and 1658, respectively, and were nurtured by influential Friends who served as patrons.¹³³ They were at least twelve years younger than Fox and the other leaders, thus it is not surprising that they are in some ways more typical of second-generation Friends.

Caton spends only a few pages on his life prior to conviction, which is often true of second-generation Friends, but was a devout youth who found

spiritual nourishment in the Fell household. His convincement narrative has neither an experience of seeking nor youthful estrangement from God, but otherwise seems to follow a typical pattern.¹³⁴ He says that he found the truth of Fox's message inwardly, but at first was envious of the experiences of others, saying, 'I desired very much to be one with them in it, that I might delight with them therein'.¹³⁵ This suggests a yearning to be part of the communal experience that is probably at work among birthright Friends, and, perhaps, among some in the first generation. Caton does come to a state of regeneration, but his description unusually oscillates between the singular and plural, including the household, and the corporate experience was clearly an important aspect of his experience.¹³⁶ He initially resists a call to the ministry, but then goes forward in confidence, becoming the key figure in the formation of Quaker communities in Holland.

Ellwood, like many second-generation Friends, indulged in fencing and other frivolities typical of wealthy young men of the period. His writing offers a great deal of detail, and is not as explicitly written for the spiritual edification of others. He describes his day of visitation as 'stirrings in my breast, tending to the work of the new creation in me',¹³⁷ and undergoes a spiritual purging, that results in the reception of 'an inward law superadded to the outward'.¹³⁸ Yet he does not seem to describe a new relationship with God or empowerment, and goes through successive ethical crises after convincement as he is challenged to take up the cross of his new faith. Thus, he emphasizes conversion, the ethical component of Quakerism, rather than the experience of rebirth.¹³⁹ He did not become a minister, but was imprisoned for his faith and was respected as a writer and editor.

The first journals published were by prominent, often male, ministers, but other journals survived in manuscript and were passed down in families. The latter give insight into the spiritual trajectory of more typical Friends. Examples include Edward Coxere's account of his life as a sailor, with a short account of his convincement and sufferings, and Mary Penington's reflections, written in stages beginning in 1668, which are addressed to her children.¹⁴⁰ Coxere's description of convincement is short, and does not give a clear impression of his theology. He focuses on ethics, questioning his participation in outward war as a merchant seaman. He does not become a minister, but is imprisoned, during which he says God sustained him.

Mary Penington describes her period of seeking in great detail, and says she was reached by the authority with which Friends preached. Like Ellwood, her description of convincement stresses judgment, but she does come to a new relationship with God. She says that God enabled her to 'give up my whole strength, yea to swim in the life which overcame me that day. Oh! Long had I desired to worship him with acceptance, and lift up my hands without doubting'.¹⁴¹ Her longing was fulfilled, and she found empowerment to withstand persecution, although she did not become a minister. Yet her account raises questions of discernment¹⁴² and she stresses the importance of remaining watchful.

While many first-generation journals suggest a similar spiritual development and theology to the earlier tracts, there are shifts that anticipate changes in the

next generation. Many stress the need for diligence in maintaining the state of regeneration, and the importance of elders and ministers may be mentioned. A few journals are further departures, emphasizing judgment and ethical conversion with little sense of victory, and describing spiritual struggles after conviction. The writing style of the journals may also be prosaic and less scriptural, although the conviction accounts are written in the oratorical style of the first decade.

D. SUMMARY

The conviction experience of early Friends was initiated by a new awareness of God's Presence. Waiting in this Presence ushered in internal warfare and judgment, surrender and discovery of a new, immediate relationship with God. They read this as the fulfilment of the promises of Scripture, and found themselves participating in the immanent completion of salvation history that was shaking the earth. It is this inward experience and relationship with God that gave Friends complete confidence in their understanding of truth, although they recognized it was contingent on abiding in the Presence they had come to know. The following are some of the key theological positions implicit in their narratives.

- First-generation Friends did not stress one aspect of regeneration, although individuals may place emphasis on the initial experience of the day of visitation, spiritual warfare or the final climatic experience of regeneration.
- There are a variety of metaphors used to describe regeneration, and first-generation Friends relate the experience of conviction to both completion of salvation history, and to a new perception of the world. Through the experience the person was placed in a new relationship with God and creation, discovering the immediacy of God and being conformed to the image of God.
- Knowledge is essentially a new relational understanding of God, and discernment is a matter of resting in this relationship. Clarity, assurance and empowerment for ministry grew out of this relationship, with a sense of peace being one of the marks.
- Knowledge and righteousness are characteristics of Christ that are shared with humanity through the indwelling Seed such that there is a real change in the regenerated person.
- Despite their insistence that immediate revelation was more authoritative than Scripture, early Friends drew heavily on scriptural imagery. They speak from within Scripture, reading their experience as an unfolding and fulfilment of salvation history, and their own authority as continuous with that of the apostles. They largely reject both reason and tradition as sources of knowledge, though in reality may draw on both.

The following section describes the experience of second-generation Friends, using a similar format, and stressing the difference between the two generations.

III. SECOND-GENERATION EXPERIENCE

A. THE THRESHING FLOOR: LIFE STORIES OF SECOND-GENERATION FRIENDS

The journals¹⁴³ of second-generation Friends typically describe childhood and early religious experience, followed by a period of indulgence in pastimes that create distance from God (youthful estrangement). As with first-generation Friends, this is followed by an experience of God (day of visitation) that leads to an internal struggle (spiritual warfare), and at least a partial victory in which sin is conquered (regeneration). Yet in contrast to earlier Friends, the last three stages are more often described as a single experience, with a focus on spiritual warfare and little elaboration on the more positive aspects of grace. This section will look in detail at the journals of James Dickinson, Thomas Story, Samuel Bownas and John Fothergill, and then develop the theology implicit in the narratives of second-generation Friends.

James Dickinson (1659–1741),¹⁴⁴ a birthright Friend from Cumberland, was a fellmonger by trade, but travelled extensively in the ministry after his conviction c. 1678. His spiritual development is typical, with an emphasis on spiritual warfare, although the inward appropriation of Quaker doctrine is not explicit. Dickinson's journal is one of the earliest by birthright Friends, and appears less concerned with the problem of 'traditional' Quakerism.¹⁴⁵

Dickinson begins by describing early experiences of grace, saying 'The Lord, by his Power, did reach unto me when very young, and often broke my Heart in true Tenderness, that many times I had a secret Delight to be inwardly retired to feel the Virtue of it'.¹⁴⁶ This pleased his parents, who taught their children 'to fear the Lord, and mind this Light and Grace that secretly reprov'd us'.¹⁴⁷ Both parents died before Dickinson was ten, after which he was drawn into 'vain Plays, Customs, Fashions, and Will-Worships of the World'.¹⁴⁸ Yet he says God repeatedly called him back to the measure of power that he had felt tendering his heart as a young child.

He continued in rebellion until 'The Lord in his Mercy did visit my Soul by his Righteous Judgments, and thereby turned my Mirth into Mourning, and Joy into Heaviness, and deep Sorrow was my Portion'.¹⁴⁹ His day of visitation is an experience of judgment, with no initial peace. He says that the enemy was in his own house, 'and as I was careful to keep in the *Light*, I came to see the Kingdom rent from *Saul*, and given to *David*, tho' there was a long war between the House of *Saul* and the House of *David*, yet as I kept my eye on the Lord, I came to see the House of *Saul* grow weaker and weaker'.¹⁵⁰ Dickinson uses other metaphors from the Hebrew Scriptures, such as the struggle between Jacob and Esau. He yearned to find peace with God, who mixed mercy with judgment, and his faith increased. He says

My soul began to delight to wait upon him in the way of his judgment...and as I kept here, I felt the Love of God increase in my Soul...and a Hunger increased in

my Heart after the enjoyment of the Lord's Power... I found (as David had) *his rod and his staff comforted me*, and the Lord did often overshadow me with his Love.¹⁵¹

Dickinson then describes a vision of the good shepherd striving against a thief who threatened the sheep. The good shepherd wins, but this does not end Dickinson's trials. He continued to struggle with the 'Power of Darkness', and says that when he had almost lost hope 'the Lord appeared by his mighty Power and rebuked the Enemy...and brought my mind to true stillness'.¹⁵² Regeneration did not confer a new sense of self or opening of the understanding, but he came to a place of peace in which he knew the shepherd was victorious.

He soon felt a call into the ministry, although he recognized his weakness and the weight of accepting the call. He says, 'the Lord, in his great Love, filled my soul with the Emanations of his Power, which strengthened and encouraged me'.¹⁵³ He initially resists, but finds peace when he is obedient to the call. After his first public ministry, he says, 'I came away in great Peace of Mind, being sensible of the Over-Shadowing Love of God'.¹⁵⁴

This is the beginning of his travels in the ministry, during which he is able to speak with authority and appears to have a supernatural power that few recognize. He says that when he interrupted a Baptist meeting by preaching, 'Great was the Confusion that soon appeared, many of them speaking all at once; some asking *what Beast was that, which was come amongst them?* Others answered, *it was none, but a Man or a Boy:* But the Lord was with me in my Testimony, and by Effusion of his Power gave me Dominion over Unclean Spirits; and the Witness of God in the Hearts of several was reached'.¹⁵⁵ Again, he has a feeling of clarity and peace when he is obedient, and several were convinced. It is this sense of peace that authenticates his ministry, and he does not struggle with discernment.

Thomas Story (c. 1663–1742)¹⁵⁶ was a convert to Friends. He trained as a lawyer, first in a country practice and then in Carlisle in 1687. His family had the means for his education in fencing and other 'fashionable and manly accomplishments',¹⁵⁷ although he does not describe their circumstances. After a period of solitary seeking, Story was convinced in 1689, before he encountered Quakers, and initially thought he was alone in his new faith.¹⁵⁸ Like Penington, he stresses his alienation from God and new knowledge, rather than justification for sin.¹⁵⁹ Story says he was inclined toward God and solitude from an early age. He felt reproof in childhood, but was drawn away from God in preparation for the 'genteel profession' of the law. Yet he was preserved from 'gross evil' by being put to the study of law with a Presbyterian counsellor in a country practice, where there were few temptations.¹⁶⁰

Story's journal contains two complementary conviction accounts, one of which may have been written much earlier. The first describes his gradual conviction of the doctrinal elements of Quakerism, while the second relates his struggle with sin. In the first, he recalls going to hear various preachers, once attending a Quaker meeting, although he remained in the Church of England. He emphasizes the intellectual integrity of the Quaker faith, although there is a divine

influence that adds to his discomfort with Anglican teaching. At a christening he found his 'mind agitated in an unusual manner, and a secret aversion to that ceremony'.¹⁶¹ Over a period of about two years, he became increasingly uncomfortable with the doctrine of the church, including use of creeds, formal prayers and sacraments, and withdrew to private worship.

The second account focuses on Story's struggle with sin. Despite his seeking, he continued to enjoy fencing and other 'fashionable accomplishments', taking pride in his abilities until they 'became irksome, disagreeable, and exceedingly heavy and oppressive'.¹⁶² God reproved him, but his understanding was incomplete. He reaches a crisis after a riding accident, searching his soul and finding he is not ready for judgment. He says,

Hitherto I had known the Grace of God in me, only as a manifestor of evil and of sin; a word of reproof...by which Divine Grace I was, in some good degree, enlightened, reformed, and enabled to shun and forbear all words and acts thus known to be evil... And yet I did not know the Divine Grace in its own nature, as it is in Christ; not as a word of faith, sanctification, justification, consolation and redemption; being yet alive in my own nature; the Son of God not yet revealed me, nor I by the power of his holy cross yet mortified and slain.¹⁶³

God does not leave him in this legalistic state, and Story goes on to describe a day of visitation, giving the exact date in which God broke in on him as an 'all-powerful, all-knowing, and sin-condemning Judge'.¹⁶⁴ Unlike most Friends, he does not use a biblical metaphor to describe the experience, but stresses his utter alienation from God. He says that his mind was separated from his body, and he was plunged into darkness toward the North Star. As in many first-generation accounts, this required the confounding of worldly wisdom, despite the role of reason in his doctrinal conviction.

And being in perfect despair of returning any more, eternal condemnation appeared to surround and inclose me on every side...in the midst of this confusion and amazement, in which no thought could be formed or any idea retained, save grim, eternal death possessing my whole man—a voice was formed and uttered in me, as from the centre of boundless darkness: 'Thy will, Oh God! Be done'.¹⁶⁵

Through this act of submission his fears vanished and he found the One for whom his soul had longed.

My mind became calm and still, and simple as a little child; the Day of the Lord dawned, and the Sun of righteousness arose in me...and He became the centre of my mind... I lost my old self, and came to the beginning of the knowledge of Him, the Just and the Holy one.¹⁶⁶

He says through this experience, he had a taste of the agony of Christ on the cross and knew his sins were forgiven. This brought an end to his intellectual understanding: 'all my carnal reasonings and conceivings about the knowledge of God, and the mysteries of religion were over; which had long exercised my mind'. The truth was now self-evident and he knew, as he had not before, that God is Love.¹⁶⁷ Yet his understanding continued to grow, and he reports being taught

through dreams, visions and prophecies, and through creation and humanity, although primary was 'the effusion of [God's] own goodness' which revealed the 'Son of his Love'.¹⁶⁸ Withdrawing in silence was essential, and he says that as

the Divine essential Truth increased in my mind, it wrought in me a conformity to itself...reducing my mind to a solid quietude and silence, as a state more fit for attending to the speech of the Divine Word, and distinguishing it from all other powers, and its Divine influences from all imaginations and other motions.¹⁶⁹

He says in silence he was 'daily fed with the fruit of the tree of life and desired no other knowledge'.¹⁷⁰ This suggests a return to the state of Adam before he ate from the tree of knowledge and that Story must learn to be content with revelation.

Story continued in private devotion for two years, thinking he was alone in his new faith, until he found the same divine power he had experienced alone while attending a Quaker meeting with an acquaintance.¹⁷¹ This challenged him to conversion, and he committed himself to 'lay aside every business or thing that might hinder or veil in me the enjoyment of the presence of the Lord, whether among his people or alone'. Story speaks with complete certainty, and describes both the truth of God's divine presence and the integrity of the meeting for worship as self-evident after his regeneration. He experiences continued spiritual development after regeneration, as his mind was opened by degrees and Scripture became clear, but he does not recount spiritual struggles or the withdrawal of God's presence.

Issues of discernment and authenticity do arise, but not for himself. Attending a first meeting for church affairs, he found divisions among Friends over structure.¹⁷² He left the meeting in silence, and God resolved the concern by showing him that the true church 'should be preserved by the love of uniformity and unity among themselves'. He says he was shown that some might come to the church in imitation, rather than through the real experience of God's presence.¹⁷³ Thus, Story is shown inwardly that unity with the true church is a mark of authenticity, and those in disagreement are outside of the experience of regeneration.

It is unclear at what point Story became a minister, but he began travelling as a companion to a friend. He argues that the Spirit gives the authority to preach, but his regeneration does not bring the urgency to evangelise described by early Friends, and he initially resisted preaching.¹⁷⁴ The resistance retarded his growth, and when he yielded, the joy was unspeakable. He says the drawing of the meeting under the canopy of God's presence was the authentication of the message.¹⁷⁵

Samuel Bownas (c. 1676–1749)¹⁷⁶ was a birthright Friend from Westmoreland, although his father, a shoemaker, died in prison immediately after Samuel's birth. Bownas was apprenticed to a Quaker blacksmith and had little schooling, but became an important leader and writer among eighteenth-century Friends. His journal is somewhat atypical, with a minimal account of spiritual warfare and emphasis on incomplete understanding, rather than alienation from God or sin.

Bownas stresses the role of his mother and his father's memory in his early religious life, and does not describe early experiences of grace. His mother admonished him to fear the Lord and grow up worthy of his father's name. He says this 'frequently brought me into great tenderness, being afraid that she would die before I was capable to live in the world'.¹⁷⁷ He visited Friends in prison with his mother, and wondered at how they were 'tender and broken' in worship, but was not yet able to understand these expressions.

He continued to attend meeting as an apprentice, but took no interest in religion and slept at worship, as he 'knew not how to employ [his] thoughts'.¹⁷⁸ Although he was preserved from 'gross vice', he was known as a 'witty, sensible young man' and indulged in 'jesting and turns of wit to provoke mirth'.¹⁷⁹ Bownas remained within the hedge of Quakerism, but had not experienced the faith for himself. There were moments of regret, in which he ruminated at night with a heavy heart, but fell back into jesting and frivolity afterwards.

Bownas' conviction, at age 20, was triggered by the preaching of a young woman named Ann Wilson.¹⁸⁰ Wilson pointed to him, saying, 'A traditional Quaker, thou goes from the meeting as thou comes to it; and thou comes to it as thou went from it, having no profit by doing so; but what wilt thou do in the end thereof?'.¹⁸¹ Her words pierce him, and he, like Saul, asked God what he might do. He heard a voice 'as it were spoke in [his] heart, saying *Look unto me, and I will help thee*'.¹⁸² Bownas was broken in tears, and now understood the tenderness and weeping he had witnessed among adult Quakers as a child.

Unlike most Friends, Bownas does not describe an internal battle, although he says he was broken and left meeting with a heavy heart. He altered his conduct, and waited anxiously for the next meeting. He describes an experience of presence and opening the next week in worship, such that he could not fathom how others might not see the truth of the gospel. He says,

my mind was soon fixed and staid upon God, and I found an uncommon enjoyment that gave me great satisfaction, my understanding being opened, and all the faculties of my mind so quick, that I seemed another man; a divine and spiritual sweetness abiding within me night and day, for some time, and I began to see and understand the Scriptures and the nature of preaching the doctrine of the gospel in the power and spirit, plainly feeling a difference between a preacher of the letter and of the spirit, which till then I was wholly ignorant of...now I understood it clearly...that all divine knowledge is from divine light which we cannot comprehend, until we are assisted to do so by a visitation from heaven.¹⁸³

This suggests rebirth, but without the rich imagery of early Friends. He says he *seemed* another man, and although he is cautious about making an outright claim to rebirth, says now he saw the difference between unregenerate and regenerate humanity.

Now I plainly saw a distinction between the children of light, and of this world; the spiritual, and the natural man; and that the natural man could not receive the things of the spirit of God, being foolishness to him; because they are known only by the Spirit.¹⁸⁴

He adds that although he was brought up with plainness of habit and speech, this did not make him a Christian, and it was made evident that the only way to true knowledge and the things of God was to be born from above.¹⁸⁵

Bownas' call to the ministry followed immediately, and he was shown that he might be qualified to speak if he was 'faithful and obedient to the holy vision'.¹⁸⁶ He says it was not long before he felt 'the power of the Spirit strong upon me, to speak a few sentences'. He initially resisted, primarily because of the presence of his old companions in meeting. He says, 'but oh! the trouble and uneasiness which I afterwards went through, made me enter into covenant, that it ever the like offer was made me, I would give up to the heavenly vision'.¹⁸⁷ The weight initially left, but a double weight returned later in the week, making him weep with fear that his disobedience had offended God, and he would be 'cast off forever'. His master reassured him, and he spoke in the next meeting four weeks after his original day of visitation. He says, 'what sweetness and joy I felt afterward I cannot express'.¹⁸⁸

Despite the seeming clarity of his call, Bownas struggles during his subsequent ministry with dark periods in which he feels shut out by God, or poor and low. He does not describe his recovery from these periods or give any reason why they might occur. They are attributed to God, and he argues that the trials qualified him to speak to others in a similar condition. During the worst of these times, while travelling in the ministry, he heard the words 'thou runs, and God has not sent thee, thou speaks, but God doth not speak by thee; therefore thou shall not profit the people'. He was tempted to turn and go where no one knew him, but says the meeting's decision to give him a certificate would have been put in question. Bownas even considers committing suicide, making it look like an accident. Ultimately, he decides the voice is the spirit of Antichrist, and through prayer and tears is able to continue in his ministry.

The Quaker community plays an important role both in Bownas' childhood and ministry. He describes being healed by deep worship in Meeting after his suicidal period, despite his uncertainty, and says that his vocal prayer brought many of those present to tenderness. He often speaks of relying on elders, at one point altering vocal ministry that was critical of older Friends, and stresses the importance of companions in the ministry. Scripture is less central, although he does describe preaching from texts and is given a new understanding of Scripture after he enters the ministry.

*John Fothergill (1676-1744)*¹⁸⁹ was born to well-known Friends with land in Yorkshire, and Quaker visitors frequented their home. He describes his parents as faithful Friends who regularly attended meeting and trained their children in the faith. His mother was particularly influential, though she died when he was 12. The couple seem to have suffered little persecution, although his father was imprisoned for non-payment of tithes when John was 18, leaving John to manage the estate. He was convinced at 19, shortly after his father's death, and became an important writer and minister among second-generation Friends.¹⁹⁰ He emphasizes

the struggle with sin, and, as with most second-generation authors, victory is incomplete.

Fothergill stresses the importance of older role models in childhood, which suggests a growing concern with transmission of the tradition.¹⁹¹ Like Bownas, he does not recount experiences of grace, but witnessed it among adults. He says that his mother's reverent obedience in meeting, and her sacrifice of a broken heart to God, 'had, very early, a deeply affecting Impression in my Consideration: So that I was convinced fully, when very young'.¹⁹² This led him to fear God, and he experienced reproof when he rebelled against the Quaker principles of refusing oaths and plain dress.

Despite the example of his elders, Fothergill fell away as a youth. His father's servants incited him to 'airiness and loose conduct', and his desire for sports and play stifled his attentiveness to God.¹⁹³ This caused him sorrow, and he made, and broke, repeated covenants to be more sober. Release came slowly, over several years, and there is no single moment of visitation. He says he was

kept low and watchful to this principle of Truth, which let me see my sin, and the Danger of it, I was favoured with the Springings of Hope for Mercy and Salvation; and then my Cry was frequent and strong to be purged thoroughly... Thus I wrestled several Years, and durst not believe I had gained any effectual Victory; and as the Baptism of Christ by his Spirit had begun to operate in me...I had some hope that the Fan in his Hand would thoroughly purge me'.¹⁹⁴

Yet this hope is tenuous, and he says, 'the winnowing, refining work of Judgement, and of Burning, now kindled to take away my Dross, was so heavy upon me, that I was often tempted to conclude I was forsaken'.¹⁹⁵ God aided him, giving him the resolve to 'wait as at the Almighty's footstool...and wait for his Arising for my Salvation'.¹⁹⁶

His regeneration also occurs gradually, and the victory remains partial. He says the Lord 'brought forth judgment into Victory by degrees, and caused the Sun of Righteousness at Times to arise upon me, with healing in his wings; yet he often saw fit to hide his face again'. He says he sometimes lost hope of redemption, 'but the blessed Presence of the Saviour of the World, which at times filled and overshadowed my soul...is never to be forgotten by my soul'.¹⁹⁷ The knowledge of God, experienced in powerful moments, sustained him in periods of doubt.

Despite the partial victory, Fothergill seems to have a new inward confirmation of Quaker principles. While his father was in prison, a non-Quaker uncle urged John to pay the tithes to free his father. Fothergill was tempted, but then says, 'my Understanding was of a suddain fully satisfied, that it was the Mind and Cause of God that this Testimony against Tithes in this Dispensation be borne... Truth itself...both cleared my Judgement and brought a holy Boldness'.¹⁹⁸ He stood up to his uncle, yet also suffered an inward loss, because his father's absence permitted him to keep company with the 'loose and airily disposed' servants.¹⁹⁹

The period leading up to his entry into the ministry suggests a similar tension. Fothergill continued to pray for purging, and attempted to 'sit down under [God's] chastising Hand and Power', which brought moments of an overwhelming sense

of Love and Presence. He says, 'sometimes the Brightness of the Salvation of God, and Enlargings of his Love were so abundant in my Soul, that I could scarce (nor did I always) keep from falling Down upon the Ground to adore and worship his glorious Presence'.²⁰⁰ This led him to think he might be called to the ministry. He resisted for over a year, concerned that self-will might lead him to the mere show of religion, until a time came when 'it was so indisputably clear, that I had no Scruple of its being certainly the holy Requiring'.²⁰¹ Fothergill continued to have periods of doubt, though never suicidal, but also experienced grace and confidence in his ministry, which was contingent on submission to God's judgment. Gradually, the doubts faded, and in retrospect he points to them as a necessary test to ensure the authenticity of his ministry.²⁰²

B. COMMON THREADS

As in the first generation, second-generation convincement accounts convey an implicit, narrative theology, despite the lack of explicit theological reflection. Their understanding of convincement is similar, but not identical, to that of first-generation Friends, but their experience often differs significantly. Not all Friends fit the ideal of the regenerated Christian, but their attempt to fit their experience to a standard form is itself informative. The following section will discuss theology in more detail, but this section will describe the common elements, making comparisons with the work of the previous generation.

1. *Regeneration.* Story, a convert to Friends, represents a transition between first- and second-generation narratives, describing a spiritual journey similar to that of the first generation, but with key differences. He was a devout youth seeking authentic religion, but also indulged in fashionable recreation that drew him away from God. He places more emphasis on the reasonableness of Quaker doctrine than earlier Friends, yet his regeneration still required the confounding of human wisdom. He found that he must look for an experience of crucifixion and rebirth beyond the legalism that troubled his conscience, and is released only through experiencing a day of judgment. Waiting in the face of judgment is crucial to the experience of regeneration, which, for Story, is a return to the garden and childlike simplicity.

The convincement narratives of second-generation Friends follow the form of early Friends, but emphasize struggle with sin rather than the victory of regeneration. This is particularly true for birthright Friends, who may describe only judgment, and, like Fothergill, find that purging is an ongoing process. Knowledge also develops gradually, and is contingent on obedience and waiting on God. Pike says that after the experience of judgment, 'I delighted to turn my mind inward, and diligently to wait upon him, by the help of his Holy Spirit, by which I gradually grew in experience and knowledge of the things of God'.²⁰³

Whereas Story, and many earlier Friends, come to an exhausted standstill where human wisdom is confounded, most second-generation Friends describe a moment of surrender and a tenacious resolve to remain in the Light. This may reflect an emphasis on waiting and submission in the pastoral writing of older

Friends, and anticipates the Quietism that will dominate Quakerism in the next century.²⁰⁴ Like early Friends, second-generation Quakers held that both an inward cross, or crucifixion of self-will, and an outward cross of a converted life were essential. For most, regeneration leads to unexpected openings of the understanding, but these are discreet events, not a new identity that confers a complete opening of creation and immediate certainty described by Story and the first generation. More common is the gradual growth to spiritual maturity described by Pike, quoted above, which is placed in contrast with the incomplete understanding of religious experience in childhood and youth.²⁰⁵ Most second-generation Friends also describe experiences of God's presence, but few reach the intimacy with God described by early Friends.

As in the first generation, the metaphors utilized to describe regeneration by the second generation are instructive. Although they occasionally draw on the book of Revelation, images from Malachi are more common, emphasizing threshing and the refiner's fire. While these metaphors convey the experience of being cleansed from sin, there is no reference to a new identity and opening of creation. Moreover, this imagery fails to place the author in the midst of the completion of salvation history, instead focusing on individual spiritual change.²⁰⁶ Second-generation Friends also compare their journey with the struggle of Israel to remain faithful to the covenant and with the suffering of her heroes.²⁰⁷ Earlier Friends may use these analogies; however, the more common use in the later generation suggests an ongoing struggle for perfection, rather than an accomplished victory. Like Jacob, they are afflicted and wrestle with sin; like Israel, they experience seasons of favour and disfavour in God's sight, crying out in lamentation. Second-generation Friends do argue that rebirth is necessary, and may describe their regeneration in these terms. For instance, Alice Hayes says that she became a new creature, yet she also continued to pray daily that she would be kept holy.²⁰⁸ Only Story describes a new creation in which he feeds on the tree of life.²⁰⁹

The crucial discovery of first-generation Friends was an immediate sense of God's presence, and it has been argued that the primary revelation they experienced was a revelation of Godself.²¹⁰ Second-generation Friends continue to hold an ideal of immediate revelation, and sometimes use relational imagery to describe regeneration. Dickinson experienced an 'overshadowing of God's Love', while Bownas describes 'a divine and spiritual sweetness'; yet these are fleeting experiences. Other second-generation accounts depict God as a stern judge, with little sense of intimacy. There are a variety of experiences in both generations, but even those early Friends who emphasize spiritual warfare, such as Hubberthorn, seem to come through regeneration to a more lasting experience of God's love and peace. These changes might reflect a difference in how the story is told, rather than an actual difference in experience, but in either case there is a shift in the underlying theology.

As was argued in the previous section, some early Friends seem to have an immediate experience of justification and sanctification, which brings assurance and enables obedience, although there is the recognition that this requires ongoing abiding in the Light.²¹¹ Rhetorically, second-generation Friends argue that

justification and sanctification are inseparable, as did the earlier generation,²¹² yet whether the experience of gradual growth that later Friends describe constitutes justification and sanctification is questionable. Superficially, second-generation experience is consistent with the theology of early Friends; however, the first generation's understanding of justification was integrated into a broader context of the inward experience of the fulfilment of salvation history. The shift to the language of purification may weaken the link between sanctification and justification, such that some authors strive for perfection without experiencing the assurance of grace. This shift may also lessen the powerful metaphor of rebirth, which if taken from its first-generation context of restoration of creation, can be redefined in terms of ethical perfection. Some in the second generation do seem to find assurance, and Richardson describes himself as being cleansed by the blood of Christ,²¹³ but the powerful language of Fox and his contemporaries had faded.

Of the twenty-one second-generation narratives studied, only six authors appear to claim a full victory over sin, and of these, only Dickinson was raised as a Quaker. Even more striking is the lack of explicit references to empowerment for the ministry within later narratives. While all Quaker authors attribute their ministry to God, only two of those coming into the ministry after 1685 have an experience of empowerment that Dickinson describes as 'emanations' of God's power. Fothergill finds a 'holy boldness' to confront his uncle, but this is a unique occurrence.²¹⁴ A sense of empowerment and urgency to spread the gospel is common among first-generation Friends and the earliest second-generation narratives, but disappears by the end of the century.²¹⁵ This probably reflects the turning inward of the Quaker community, and a concern to insure the integrity of the ministry. Later Friends, like Bownas and Fothergill, are more likely to protest their humility, and the calling to the ministry, rather than conviction, becomes the key spiritual struggle.²¹⁶

As in the first generation, second-generation authors struggle with sin, seeking assurance in the midst of a theological legalism. Even when indulging in recreation, they know their separation from God and have moments of regret. The seeking of first-generation Friends was driven by a concern for their election within the Puritan framework. In contrast, some second-generation Friends seem entrenched in ethical perfectionism. Both are potential sources of anxiety, and many second-generation Friends do not seem to find the complete assurance that released their predecessors.²¹⁷ Thus, spiritual warfare becomes the primary focus of second-generation narratives, rather than the release that comes through grace. Fothergill may be typical in looking to the temporary moments of grace to provide enough assurance that God's presence is 'never forgotten' in the midst of ongoing struggle after regeneration.

2. *Knowing.* For early Friends, the heart of the regeneration was giving up seeking and human constructs of faith to experience the revelation of Godself, which in turn illumined Scripture and other sources of knowledge. Only a few second-generation Friends emphasize knowing, but they continue to insist that all knowledge must be confirmed inwardly, suggesting revelation is essentially relational

and subjective.²¹⁸ Almost all describe openings of Scripture, and birthright Friends may receive an inward confirmation of traditional Quaker beliefs. Yet the more gradual regeneration and incomplete transformation experienced by many in the second generation strains their dependence on immediate revelation. They make greater use of other sources of knowledge than their predecessors, provided ultimate authority rests in revelation. In addition, there is more explicit discussion of discernment and the nature of knowledge, although an expectation remains that truth is self-evident to those who are regenerated, and there may be an emerging emphasis on the unknowability of God among some more intellectual Friends.

Birthright Friends are explicit that through regeneration they receive an inward knowledge of what they formerly knew only by education, and are no longer merely 'traditional' Quakers. Bownas is particularly articulate in describing his new insight, which is significant given his later depression in which he feared God might have cast him off. As with early Friends, knowing is contingent on the relationship with God, and Bownas makes a direct link between new understanding and abiding in God's sweetness. This suggests that second-generation Friends continued to hold early Friends' formulation of immediate revelation as a relational knowledge of God, which is only secondarily objective. Some Friends do receive clear objective revelation, in the form of dreams, visions or voices,²¹⁹ but, as with early Friends, these are not given disproportional weight. Rather, relational knowing and intimacy with God are primary, and illumination comes from knowing the inward teacher. Pike says that 'the more we keep inward to this school, the more we learn of Christ; and the less we keep inward, even when about lawful things, the less we learn of Christ'.²²⁰ Similarly, Chalkey describes an opening of the Scriptures and sense of peace following regeneration, 'And the Word of God was as a Seed in My Heart, growing and opening in me, speaking to me, and making my understanding fruitful in the Things of his Kingdom'.²²¹ Like their predecessors, second-generation Friends describe these openings using both Johannine imagery of illumination and sensory metaphors, particularly the Pauline metaphor of unveiling.²²²

There are second-generation Friends, notably Thomas Story and Richard Claridge, who emphasize the limits of human constructs of God. This is consistent with early Friends' experience of the confounding of human wisdom, but goes further, to suggest that the divine is beyond speech. Claridge says that he was struck dumb by his experience of regeneration,²²³ while Story was brought to a state in which thoughts were impossible, beyond the awareness of his sinful state. Coming through this experience, Story says that he reached a new awareness in which he was beyond doubt.²²⁴ Both are silenced by their experience of God's presence, which is supremely self-evident, yet beyond words. This emphasis on the inexpressibility of the encounter with God, rather than the confounding of intellectual pride and obedience to the inward teacher, may suggest the development of a negative theology that stresses waiting and the unknowability of God, rather than the knowledge of God that is the gift of an inward teacher.²²⁵ The inexpressibility of spiritual experience is not the dominant position of second-generation Friends, who continue to articulate an experience of a God that is

knowable through obedience; however, the unknowability of God is an important thread in later Quaker thought.²²⁶

Most of the second-generation authors acknowledge that knowledge is contingent on obedience and dwelling in the relationship with God, although some authors emphasize obedience rather than relationship. In a letter to Quakers in Carolina and Virginia, Wilson urges Friends to 'walk worthy of their vocation where unto ye are called, in all fear and meekness; watching in the light, where you will discern the wiles of the enemy in all his cunning baits and transformations'.²²⁷ Yet if revelation is essentially a disclosure of Godself, then the incomplete victory over sin experienced by second-generation Friends raises the question of discernment and the place of knowledge in an imperfect community. The development of corporate structures and other controls on ministry in the Quaker community has typically been attributed to concern for unity and the need to define Quakerism in the face of external persecution. Yet the individual experience of second-generation Friends, who sometimes struggled with doubt, is also likely to be significant. This may be particularly true of the tradition of pastoral epistles, which address Friends facing individual struggles, as well as communal issues.

Discernment is only occasionally an explicit concern in the narratives; however, there are indications that authority and the role of other sources of knowledge are in question. Some authors describe 'openings' quite casually;²²⁸ however, many indicate that their openings were confirmed by Scripture or other means. For instance, Dickinson notes that he came away from meeting after his first vocal ministry with a sense of peace and God's love, which implicitly authenticates his preaching.²²⁹ In contrast, while first-generation Friends may use external sources as a confirmation of authority, they more often point to experiences of power. The primary mark of authenticity for Friends in either generation is a sense of peace, life or clarity that comes from dwelling within the Presence of God. Damiano's work suggests that the initial act of discernment is self-examination, beginning with the purging of conviction but carried on as a spiritual practice. This awareness, and subsequent avoidance of sin undergirds other discernment.²³⁰ Chalkey suggests this in a discussion about distinguishing between the voice of Christ and the whispering of satan. He argues that the former always speaks to a good end, and there is a 'Devine Life to the Soul in this Speaking'.²³¹ Implicit in his argument is that it is the experience and discipline of waiting in God's presence that enables the regenerate person to distinguish the Life from death.

Story argues that silence is a necessary state for discernment, suggesting that human attempts at knowledge may cloud the truth. He says silence is 'a state more fit for attending to the speech of the Divine Word, and distinguishing it from all other powers, and its Divine influences from all imaginations and other motions'.²³² He adds that on occasions when he engaged in argument beyond what he has been shown, 'I have not had that peace and satisfaction of mind which is to be found in the virtue of Truth alone'.²³³

Secondarily, discernment of leadings may be tested against other sources of knowledge, and the role of Scripture, reason and tradition are discussed below. Friends also use 'post hoc' discernment, looking to the results of an action to confirm that it was correct. This is particularly true of vocal ministry, whether public or inside the Quaker community. For instance, preaching that results in conviction or 'tenderness' among the hearers is validated. It is rare for Friends to seek external signs, but signs are used by some to confirm leadings. For instance, John Croker was reluctant to become a vocal minister, and in prayer told God that if some stranger would encourage him or speak to his condition, 'I would not then consult with flesh and blood any longer'. Ironically, despite this implied rejection of human authority for God's, it is a human being who encourages him to speak in meeting. He says, 'it pleased God to answer my desire; for several spake to me and bid me be faithful'.²³⁴ Arguably, seeking signs suggests a less mature faith, and Croker repeatedly makes, and breaks, deals with God prior to conviction.²³⁵

Story's account of attending a meeting for church affairs, recounted above,²³⁶ places these issues in perspective. God shows him that unity is a mark of the authentic church, and thus those not in unity have come into the church under false pretences. Yet, ultimately, it is God's inward revelation that is authoritative, and unity means nothing outside of the corporate relationship with God. Any other source of knowledge remains secondary, as in first-generation theology. Yet the increased emphasis on discernment in second-generation narratives suggests some Friends, particularly those raised within Quakerism, recognize the limits of this theology in periods of doubt or in a mixed community. That a few experience complete regeneration confirms Story's argument that some come to the church in imitation rather than through a genuine knowledge of God.

3. *Scripture, Tradition and Reason.* As has been discussed, second-generation Friends continue to emphasize immediate revelation of truth that is known only within an intimate relationship with God. Yet in practice, concerns about discernment arise because in the experience of many this relationship is tenuous. Thus, while maintaining the primacy of immediate revelation, second-generation Friends are more willing to draw on other sources of knowledge than their predecessors.

Scripture was an important source of language and inspiration for both generations, and unlike tradition and reason, was not rejected as a source of knowledge by early Friends. Immediate revelation was primary, but Scripture was expected to be consistent. Both generations typically restrict textual arguments to disputational writing, while in narrative accounts they use Scripture as sources of images and metaphors that express their experience.²³⁷ Second-generation narratives have fewer scriptural references than earlier tracts, but all of the authors use Scripture at key points. The primary shift is the way in which Scripture is appropriated. While the first generation writes typologically, as if the scriptural story is being fulfilled within them, second-generation Friends use analogy. The second-generation authors compare their experience to that of biblical heroes, but only a few write

as if they are caught up in an ongoing story in which their personal story echoes the fulfilment of salvation history.

Despite this shift in the use of Scripture, there is an emphasis on experiential understanding that sets Friends apart from other Puritans. John Barcroft²³⁸ has a vision of the pouring out of the spirit 'at the beginnings', which might refer either to creation or Pentecost, which enables him to understand Scripture. This can be read as an oblique claim that interpreting Scripture requires a gift of the Spirit, which is also asserted by first-generation Friends. Most authors of either generation describe an opening of Scripture following conviction, and recognize that this new understanding is contingent on humility, but the second generation are more likely to point out this link.²³⁹ Pike recounts that in seasons in which God seemed to withdraw, he could find no benefit or comfort in Scripture.²⁴⁰

The role of tradition in second-generation Quaker thought has also shifted. Rhetorically, there is a rejection of 'traditional' Quakerism that is not grounded in experience. Yet at the same time, the role of elders is increasingly valued, and unity is viewed as a mark of authenticity. The narratives suggest that imitation is a valid concern, particularly as the crucial Quaker experience of God's presence is difficult to transmit. Without this experience, and without the assurance of justification, some second-generation Friends appear to have become caught in a new anxiety over sin and perfection.

Although it has been argued that late seventeenth-century Friends were developing a communal authority, formal authority is only indirectly reflected in conviction narratives. The informal influence of elders and parents is often cited, and some rely on travelling companions for advice.²⁴¹ Yet relatively few authors describe testing their leadings formally, and travel minutes are mentioned only for longer trips abroad.²⁴² While approximately half of the authors report seeking the advice of parents, companions or other elders in a specific instance, these are exceptional cases. Many resort to 'solitary places' during their struggles, suggesting that the direct relationship with God remained primary. Several mention preaching by older Friends, but it is only Crisp, Davis and Claridge, all converts, who cite Quaker writings as crucial in their spiritual development.²⁴³ Other converts, including Richardson, Wilson and Story claim to have been convinced before encountering Friends.²⁴⁴

Despite their arguments to the contrary, even first-generation Friends were not independent of tradition. If theology is a language that develops within a community, then even those who reject a tradition are formed by it. Early Friends experienced an inward confirmation of Puritan and Seeker teachings, and there are both continuities and discontinuities covered by the rhetoric and emerging Quaker discourse. Likewise, the second generation experienced discontinuity as well as continuity with their predecessors, but stress the continuities by adopting similar language, even if the underlying experience may not fit.

The temptation to stretch experience to fit the frame of Quaker teaching, and thus assert a prescribed personal experience, was probably particularly strong among those born into Quaker families.²⁴⁵ The stories of persecution and the powerful preaching of their parents loomed over these first birthright Friends.²⁴⁶

By the end of the century, particularly after the Act of Toleration, there was explicit discussion of the problem of 'traditional' Quakers who were Friends only by education rather than thorough the crucial threshing experience. When the young Samuel Bownas was accused by a visiting Friend of being a 'traditional Quaker' it triggered a genuine conviction, but some birthright Friends probably remained within the community without this experience. John Barcroft, a particularly scrupulous young Friend, seems to have reached a sense of peace and right relationship with God without a threshing experience. Yet God 'shows' him he must continue to seek an experience of new birth, and he does not question whether this message may itself have been received by tradition. His account of the experience is unconvincing and formulaic, particularly in comparison to his descriptions of his religious experience in his youth and childhood. Others, such as John Croker and Uriah Brook, never seem to experience an intimate relationship with God.²⁴⁷

In either generation, there may be a false sense of coherence imposed by the use of shared rhetoric and structural forms. The experience of first-generation Friends probably varied greatly, and it is likely that some were as troubled by doubts as the next generation, just as some second-generation Friends probably experienced a complete victory over sin and sense of assurance. Yet the early structural forms dictated assurance, and did not leave room for the expression of doubt. Second-generation Friends inherited an idealistic view of assurance and perfection, which did not fit the experience of many, and gradually changed the form to present a pastoral concern for those who were struggling.

Where their predecessors had been caught in a Puritan quest for assurance of election, many in the second generation seem to be seeking an ideal of spiritual rebirth that will free them from sin. As was argued in Section II, first-generation Friends had to develop a new language to convey their regeneration experience, whereas the language of spiritual warfare was readily available in Puritan rhetoric. As Jones understatedly says, 'Fox was supremely confident about the fact of regeneration but he defined the actual process rather loosely'.²⁴⁸ Arguably, it is difficult to describe a liberating experience, and even more difficult to lead another person to it. Bownas says he was taught to fear the Lord, but when he wondered at the emotions expressed by adults in worship he was told he would understand when he was a man. This may explain the emphasis on sin in the second generation, rather than the victory of regeneration and restored relationship to God.

The most striking difference between the two generations is their view of reason, which is often rejected outright by first-generation Friends, at least rhetorically. Second-generation Friends are less suspicious of reason, perhaps because the apologetic tradition had become well established, and it may play a role in conviction. Story's narrative suggests that reason, as much as Scripture and tradition, can be a source of understanding, as long as it is confirmed inwardly. While some second-generation Friends condemn reason,²⁴⁹ it plays a major role in the conviction of other Friends. Like early Friends, Story recognizes the potential problems of human constructs, and his regeneration brought him to a childlike innocence in which he was unable to think. He describes openings of

Scripture and his understanding after regeneration, but came to the essentials of the Quaker faith prior to conviction through intellectual arguments. The crucial difference is that he now knew God experientially, and that knowledge confirms his earlier doctrinal conviction.

Story draws a clear distinction between the intellectual conviction of Quaker doctrine and the experience of regeneration, but Crisp merges the two. He says that Barclay, in his *Apology*,

laid Things down so plainly, and proved them with such Ingenuity and Dexterity of Learning, and opened the Scriptures so clearly to me, that without standing to cavil, dispute, raise Argument or Objection, or consult with Flesh and Blood, I presently resigned myself to God, and weeping for Joy that I had found so great a treasure, I often thanked him with Tears in my Eyes for so kindly a visitation of his love.²⁵⁰

This suggests that reason is not necessarily contrary to regeneration, and can be redeemed. Yet like Scripture and tradition, it is useless without inward authentication.

C. SUMMARY

Second-generation Friends do not differ significantly in their explicit theology of salvation and revelation; however, their experience did not fit the optimism of the first decade of the movement. Thus, narratives leave a greater room for doubt and the possibility of error. Although immediate revelation remains authoritative, issues of discernment were raised and Friends began to draw on secondary sources of knowledge.

The most crucial change is that regeneration was no longer placed in the context of the fulfilment of salvation history. Early Friends experienced one, overarching grace that included justification, sanctification and the restoration of creation, and stressed the culminating experience of regeneration. Without the broad vision linking justification and sanctification, second-generation Friends were left with the expectation of victory over sin, but with no explicit teaching on justification and an experience that suggested the struggle with sin was ongoing. For some, regeneration was easily reduced to individualized ethical perfection and a lack of assurance of forgiveness. This problem was compounded by the difficulty of communicating the experience of assurance and grace, particularly in comparison with the readily available language of spiritual warfare.

The following are key points that emerge from the narratives.

- Second-generation Friends stress the experience of spiritual warfare over the more difficult to describe, and more positive, experiences of the day of visitation or regeneration.
- Second-generation Friends continue to understand regeneration as an experience of judgment, but do not place it in the context of the completion of salvation history. Thus, the focus is individual, expressed through metaphors that suggest purification or spiritual struggle. Many portray a more distant God, despite adhering to the belief in God as an inward teacher. They may describe an opening of the understanding and

personal appropriation of Quaker belief, but they rarely describe a new perception of the world.

- Although, ideally, knowing rests in an intimate relationship with an inward revelation of God, second-generation Friends are less sure of this experience. A sense of peace is the primary mark of authenticity and outward teaching must be confirmed inwardly, but in practice they are beginning to stress the importance of elders and the teaching of the community. Formulations of the truth can be drawn from reason, Scripture or from within the gathered community, but must be confirmed through direct experience.
- Rhetorically, most second-generation Friends would argue that knowledge and righteousness are characteristics of Christ that are shared with humanity, and that this sharing results in an outward conversion. Yet many seem to experience less intimacy with God and focus on perfection without a sense of assurance. This may mean that they fail to recognize sanctification as a gift, and in practice, try to earn justification.
- Second-generation Friends are less suspicious of reason and tradition, but continue to hold that all sources of knowledge must be confirmed inwardly. Their appropriation of Scripture is through analogy, and they rarely speak as witnesses to the fulfilment of salvation history.

The final section clarifies the changes between first-generation and second-generation Friends, and presents a general discussion of the soteriology and theology of revelation in the period.

IV. CONCLUSIONS

A. SUMMARY OF FIRST- AND SECOND-GENERATION EXPERIENCE

Spiritual autobiography is a potentially rich source for exploring popular understanding of theology, particularly in a movement such as Quakerism that emphasizes personal experience. This study has drawn on the autobiographies of first- and second-generation Friends in order to show the change in understanding of justification and sanctification, and the resulting epistemological shifts that necessarily follow. While the two generations have a similar explicit theology of revelation and knowing, the experience of second-generation Friends left more room for doubt and their narrative theology suggests greater reliance on other sources of knowledge. Table 1 presents the primary differences in the experience of the two generations.

B. JUSTIFICATION AND SANCTIFICATION

First-generation Friends believed that the Christ of history was immediately present, actively reconciling individuals and the world.²⁵¹ By turning and dwelling in that presence, the Christian was justified and Christ's righteousness was imparted so that sin was conquered. Yet there has been little work on the second generation, or on the ways in which individuals lived out the theology. This study has sought to clarify these issues as a basis for discussion of revelation and knowing.

Table 1. *Regeneration in First- and Second-generation Experience*

<i>First Generation</i>	<i>Second Generation</i>
<p>First-generation Friends did not stress one aspect of regeneration, although individuals may place emphasis on the initial experience of the day of visitation, spiritual warfare, or the final climatic experience of regeneration.</p>	<p>Second-generation Friends stress the experience of spiritual warfare over the more difficult to describe, and more positive, experiences of the day of visitation or regeneration.</p>
<p>There are a variety of metaphors used to describe regeneration, and first-generation Friends relate the experience of conviction to both completion of salvation history, and to a new perception of the world. Through the experience the person was placed in a new relationship with God and creation, discovering the immediacy of God and being conformed to the image of God.</p>	<p>Second-generation Friends continue to understand regeneration as an experience of judgment, but do not place it in the context of the completion of salvation history. Thus, the focus is individual, expressed through metaphors that suggest purification or spiritual struggle. Many portray a more distant God, despite adhering to the belief in God as an inward teacher. They may describe an opening of the understanding and personal appropriation of Quaker belief, but they rarely describe a new perception of the world.</p>
<p>Knowledge is essentially a new relational understanding of God, and discernment is a matter of resting in this relationship. Clarity, assurance and empowerment for ministry grew out of the relationship, with a sense of peace being one of the marks.</p>	<p>Although, ideally, knowing rests in an intimate relationship with an inward revelation of God, second-generation Friends are less sure of this experience. A sense of peace is the primary mark of authenticity and outward teaching must be confirmed inwardly, but in practice they are beginning to stress the importance of elders and the teaching of the community. Formulations of the truth can be drawn from reason, Scripture or from within the gathered community, but must be confirmed through direct experience.</p>
<p>Knowledge and righteousness are characteristics of Christ that are shared with humanity through the indwelling Seed such that there is a real change in the regenerated person.</p>	<p>Rhetorically, most second-generation Friends would argue that knowledge and righteousness are characteristics of Christ that are shared with humanity, and that this sharing results in an outward conversion. Yet many seem to experience less intimacy with God and focus on perfection without a sense of assurance. This may mean that they fail to recognize sanctification as a gift, and in practice, try to earn justification.</p>

<p>Despite their insistence that immediate revelation was more authoritative than Scripture, early Friends drew heavily on scriptural imagery. They speak from within Scripture, reading their experience as an unfolding and fulfilment of salvation history, and their own authority as continuous with that of the apostles. They largely reject both reason and tradition as sources of knowledge, though in reality may draw on both.</p>	<p>Second-generation Friends are less suspicious of reason and tradition, but continue to hold that all sources of knowledge must be confirmed inwardly. Their appropriation of Scripture is through analogy, and they rarely speak as witnesses to the fulfilment of salvation history.</p>
--	--

Jones also points to the relationship between knowledge and regeneration, but does not discuss the implications for second-generation Friends. He says, 'Fox... made a claim to perfect knowledge, as a concomitant of the experience of perfect unity and perfect holiness.'²⁵²

The Reformation teaching on justification had been a relief to overly scrupulous individuals, such as Luther, who were caught up in a legalistic struggle to overcome sin. Yet for some young Puritans, doubts about election and the emphasis on spiritual warfare seems to have brought anxiety, rather than comfort.²⁵³ Many of the first generation of Friends had been Puritans, and some describe worrying over their election during their seeking stage. The Quaker message, and experience, of the possibility of complete victory through God's grace answered a spiritual need for these young seekers. This victory came through recognizing and submitting to the inward presence of God, because, as Creasey says, Friends believed that 'Christ's inward presence is saving in so far as Christ is loved'.²⁵⁴

The children of early Friends became caught in a new struggle, again emphasizing sin and looking for the rebirth experience that would free them. Although they experience judgment, it is not placed within the context of the salvation history. Once this connection is severed, the focus on individual sins and piety overshadows the wider vision of early Friends. In addition, justification becomes disconnected from the historic death of Christ, which leaves second-generation Friends with a concern to eliminate sin, rather than a sense of justification in the midst of sin. In addition, it is likely that the first generation found a ready language to communicate the experience of spiritual warfare in Puritan rhetoric, whereas the liberation they found in Quakerism was more difficult to transmit to their children. Both generations allowed for the possibility of growth and backsliding, even though some of the earliest narratives report instantaneous perfection.²⁵⁵ Thus, the primary difference is the erosion of assurance of salvation, not the more gradual view of perfection held by second-generation Friends.

The first generation of Friends typically recounts a twofold experience of grace, which superficially corresponds to justification and sanctification. As John Burnyeat expresses in his narrative, Friends found the satisfaction for past sins promised by their Puritan contemporaries and the power to live without sin in the future, so long as they dwelt in Christ.²⁵⁶ While this seems to fit the

theological categories of justification and sanctification, Jones and Creasey both argue that Friends were insistent that there is one, universal, though not necessarily instantaneous, grace that both justifies and sanctifies.²⁵⁷ By extension, one might also argue that this one grace includes the third experience of the Spirit claimed by some Christians, as Friends were empowered for ministry,²⁵⁸ and was present in childhood before regeneration but only partially understood. This overarching experience of grace was held together by the bold claim that Friends were witnesses to the completion of salvation history, and thus the unity of grace included not only justification and sanctification, but also creation and its restoration. Grace is one because it is the revelation of Godself, who is one, although Friends do not make this argument explicit.

Although seventeenth-century Friends argued for one grace, they understood it to be experienced in different measures. Some write as if the day of visitation is limited, and God metes out grace, while others seem to suggest that grace is continually offered, but the individual can turn from God in disobedience. Although this point is unclear, the latter view is more consistent with an understanding of the unity of grace, and presents a greater challenge to the Calvinist understanding of election. The view that grace is limited to a moment of visitation may be a holdover, or reintroduction, of Puritan thought.²⁵⁹

This vision began to fade as the individual and corporate experience of the second generation contradicted the claim to complete regeneration. Cause and effect are difficult to untangle, because as experience affects theology, so theology helps form experience; however, it is likely that the changes in soteriology and experience were simultaneous. As a result, despite a stated theology that insisted sanctification and justification were one, the experience of many Friends does not reflect the assurance of the first generation. Without the eschatological vision holding together justification and sanctification, sanctification could be reduced to ethical perfectionism, though some Friends continued to experience sanctification as a gift of grace. This change was heightened by early Friends' minimization of the historic cross, which was included in their vision of salvation history, but could be assumed in the Puritan context.²⁶⁰

It is possible that second-generation Friends are simply more honest about their spiritual doubts, in part because of the more pastoral purpose of later narratives. Certainly, there must have been those in the first generation who continued to encounter spiritual struggles after regeneration. Yet there is a clear change in theology, even if the differences in experience are overstated. Furthermore, that Story and other second-generation converts also express greater certainty suggests that there were real shifts in the experience of birthright Friends, who do not have the same sense of certainty.

Second-generation Friends were confronted with a pastoral concern that probably reflects the typical spiritual journey in any religious tradition. First-generation Friends were part of an unusual historical moment that generated idealism, but this faded with the restoration of the monarchy.²⁶¹ Some second-generation Friends did find peace, regardless of the changes, and it would be misleading to leave the impression that they all became entangled in sin without assurance. The

early Quaker experience of return to the garden where God is known intimately is not dependent on an experience of instantaneous perfection, nor is the understanding of the unity of grace. Damiano presents a somewhat idealistic description of eighteenth-century Quakerism, in which the community becomes the location of the restoration of creation, nurturing its members toward perfection.²⁶² Arguably, she does not sufficiently address the issues of doubt raised by the narratives, but at its best Quakerism maintained the unity of grace, and the community was able to help those struggling under judgment to find an experience of assurance. There is evidence of this in the later narratives, particularly among Irish Friends, who warmly describe the support of older Friends and companions in the faith.²⁶³

C. KNOWING

Gwyn has described early Quaker approaches to the truth using four philosophical models, one of which is correspondence, an inductive approach analogous to the emerging sciences, in which belief must be verified by experience.²⁶⁴ This strains the usual philosophical definition, as Quaker experience was an inward, spiritual experience rather than material fact; however, it is consistent with both the sensory language of early Friends and their experience of a transformed creation.²⁶⁵ This should not be misread as a claim that these experiences are evident outside of the redeemed relationship with God, as Friends were emphatic that there was no natural knowledge of God except by the grace of inward revelation.²⁶⁶

This appropriation of the concept of correspondence is useful in clarifying early Friends' epistemology. Although they drew formulations of the truth from Scripture and, less explicitly, from reason and the context of the Puritan tradition, they insisted on a correspondence between their inward experience of God and these formulations. Thus, experience was not necessarily their primary *epistemological* source of knowledge; however, correspondence between articulated truth and the restored relationship with God was essential for the *authentication* of any source of knowledge, including experience. Jones makes a similar point, arguing that Friends held that 'The living presence of Christ does teach men what to believe in as well as whom to believe in, but faith is propositional only in a minor and derivative sense'.²⁶⁷

Second-generation Friends were faced with the need to defend Quakerism from persecution and clarify internal disagreements, and thus began to articulate the boundaries of a corporate understanding. They continued to ground authority in the correspondence between formulations of truth and the Life that they had come to know in God's self-revelation.²⁶⁸ Yet second-generation experience raised issues of discernment, where the first generation had assumed certainty. Correspondence assumes an intimacy with God, against which other knowledge is judged, and this relationship was often tenuous in their experience. As a result, they began to make greater use of other sources of knowledge, while maintaining a sense of peace and Life is the primary measure of truth. Some look for signs or other experiential knowledge, although this is rare. More often they look to Scripture, as had early Friends, or to the emerging tradition. The latter is reflected in the new organizational structures that provided oversight for the ministry,

marriage and other decisions,²⁶⁹ although the narratives more often refer to the informal transmission of tradition by older role models.

The role of reason was contested. As the modern worldview began to influence some Friends, others retained the early suspicion of reason. Story is clear that the primary activity of the Light or Seed is self-disclosure, and experiences a confounding of reason similar to that of early Friends, yet reason plays a role in his conviction. Leachman and Trowell argue that second-generation Friends believed that the Light acted primarily through the illumination of reason.²⁷⁰ This may be true of intellectual authors like Penn and Whitehead, but is not reflected in most narratives. Only Crisp's account merges reason and direct revelation, as he experienced a 'visitation of God's Love' while reading Barclay's *Apology*.²⁷¹ Many narratives, particularly those from Ireland and the north, suggest an ongoing distrust of reason, even if redeemed.²⁷²

There is an inherent conflict between the correspondence model of truth as understood by early Friends and the use of reason, particularly when coupled with the modern emphasis on objectivity. Barclay's *Apology*, the primary theological treatise of the second period, reflects this tension. As Graves point out, Barclay argues that the Spirit reveals not only subjective knowledge, but also 'objectively presents truth to our minds'.²⁷³ This foundational epistemology prioritizes objective knowledge over the subjective; and contrasts with early Friends' understanding that the content of revelation is God's self-disclosure. In the latter perspective, it is the participation in the life of God that allows one to recognize the truth, whether the formulation is derived from experience, reason, tradition or Scripture. In contrast, Barclay's modern definition of truth defines the Light ontologically, and further disconnects it from the story of salvation. Although Barclay resists the complete objectivity of Locke's *tabula rasa*, he defines truth as objective knowledge perceived through experience, albeit supernatural, rather than the subjective revelation of God's self.

Most narratives provide examples of both objective and subjective revelation, but the crucial conviction account suggests that the subjective was more important. Some Friends may speculate about the interplay between revelation and reason, and there is a new emphasis on corporate structures, but the ideal continues to be a subjective knowledge of God.²⁷⁴ Discernment is primarily through the subjective measure of Light, Life or a sense of peace, despite the subsidiary role played by reason, tradition and Scripture.

It has been argued that well-educated, first-generation Friends tended to be more concerned about epistemology, and their conviction stories often focus on the confounding of reason and new knowledge found within the relationship of God. Other Friends are more likely to focus on sin, and the assurance and perfection that are imparted by Christ. These differences persist in the second generation. For example, Story's experience is similar to that of well-educated, first-generation Friends. Other intellectuals, like Barclay, may be looking for a more objective understanding, though this objectivity remains dependent on regeneration. This suggests an incipient division among Friends that may underlie later separations between evangelicals and liberals in the nineteenth century.

D. FUTURE WORK

This brief study suggests several possible areas of future research. The claims are based on narrative writing, and should be tested against the more explicit theology of doctrinal tracts and pastoral epistles. All three types of writing are crucial in developing an accurate picture of early Friends. While narratives provide insight into the narrative theology lived out within the community, this study has only indirectly looked at what Quakers say they believed. Inclusion of manuscripts would also be useful, particularly in discussing women's experience. A study of how the narratives are used by Friends in developing sectarian social control would be illuminating. For instance, many second-generation narratives were published in the 1740s, at a time when Quakerism, particularly in North America, was undergoing reform.²⁷⁵

Quaker historiography suffers from isolation, and future work should involve both comparisons with other religious traditions and incorporation of anthropological approaches to religious studies. Autobiography from other movements with an emphasis on individual experience and enthusiasm would provide a useful counterpoint for the current study, as would incorporation of theological reflection from these traditions.²⁷⁶ Anthropologists have looked at the process of ritualization and the way in which language both forms and is formed by theology. While Graves and Bauman have made some use of this work, it could provide greater insight, particularly into the process of standardization of autobiographical forms and the use of language.²⁷⁷ Graves examines approximately seventy Quaker sermons, looking at the dominant metaphors and rhetorical techniques, in order to study the interplay between preaching and narrative forms in Quakerism. His identification of the dominant metaphors is too broad for easy comparison,²⁷⁸ and going back to the original sermons would be necessary to determine whether there is a relationship between sermons and narratives. Although there has been work comparing Quakerism with Catholicism and Puritan thought,²⁷⁹ little work has been done with recent theology. A superficial comparison of early Quaker thought and Barth's theology of revelation suggests parallels, particularly in his emphasis on Christ as the content of revelation and rejection of human constructs, and further work might help clarify Quaker thought.

More generally, there is a need for historical and theological analysis of late seventeenth- and eighteenth-century Friends, and particularly of the impact of the emerging modern worldview on Quaker thought. It has been noted that different authors emphasize either issues of epistemology or perfection and the struggle with sin in the narratives, which may reflect an incipient division between liberal and more evangelical worldviews. Analysis of these issues is crucial to understanding the divisions that occurred within Quakerism in the nineteenth century.

E. SUMMARY

This dissertation has shown that the theology of revelation held by first- and second-generation Friends cannot be understood apart from their theology of justification and sanctification. Early Friends came out of a Puritan culture that left them unsure of their election. In Quakerism, they found a liberating experience

of God's presence, which brought together their own salvation and the restoration of creation. Through the experience of Presence they were granted assurance, an intimate knowledge of the divine and the possibility of victory over sin.

Second-generation Friends held a similar understanding of revelation and salvation, but their experience suggested that perfection and knowledge were less certain. They experienced doubt and temptations, and although some likely found assurance in intimacy with God, others feared for their salvation and were caught in ethical perfectionism. Their more individualistic view of conviction is reflected in language of threshing and refining, which replaces first-generation imagery that united the entirety of salvation history. As the relationship with God became less sure, issues of discernment arose, and Friends began to look to other models of knowledge.

APPENDIX A

SUMMARY OF NARRATIVES UTILIZED

The following lists the individuals whose autobiographical narratives were used in this study, whether or not they are quoted. The following Appendix presents short biographies of quoted authors, with the exception of those discussed in depth in the main text. Full citations for each source are given in the Bibliography.

FIRST GENERATION: EARLY TRACTS AND FREESTANDING NARRATIVES

- Burrough, Edward, *True Declaration*, 1661.
 Dewsbury, William, *Discovery*, 1665.
 Gotherson, Dorothea (Scott), *To All Unregenerated*, 1883.
 Howgill, Francis, *Inheritance of Jacob*, 1656.
 Hubberthorn, Richard, *True Testimony*, 1653.
 Lilburne, John, *Resurrection*, 1656.
 Naylor (Nayler), James, *Living Faith*, 1676.
 Penington, Isaac, *Soul's Travel*, 1761.
 Simmons (Simmonds), Martha, *Lamentation*, 1655.

FIRST GENERATION: JOURNALS AND OTHER RETROSPECTIVE ACCOUNTS

- Blaugdone, Barbara, *Account of the Travels*, 1691.
 B., S. (Blanford, Susannah), *Account Given Forth*, 1698.
 Burnyeat, John (Sr.), *Journal*, 1839.
 Caton, William, *Journal*, 1839.
 Coxere, Edward, *Adventures*, 1945.
 Crook (Crooke), John, *Short History*, undated.
 Ellwood, Thomas, *History of Thomas Ellwood*, 1885.
 Fell, Margaret, *Relation*, 1690.
 Fox, George, *Journal*, 1975.
 Penington, Mary, *Experiences*, 1911.
 Vokins, Joan, *God's Power Magnified*, 1691.
 Whitehead, George, *Memoirs*, 1830.

SECOND GENERATION: TRACTS AND FREESTANDING NARRATIVES

Claridge, Richard, *Judgment Seat*, 1757.

Crisp, Samuel, *Two Letters*, undated.

SECOND GENERATION: JOURNALS AND OTHER RETROSPECTIVE ACCOUNTS

Barcroft, John, *Life*, 1730.

Bewley, George, *Christian Experiences*, 1750.

Bownas, Samuel, *Life*, 1795.

Brook, Uriah, *Christian Experience*, 1868.

Burnyeat, Jonathan, *Gospel Labours*, 1857.

Chalkley, Thomas, *Journal*, 1751.

Crocker, John, *Memoir*, 1840.

Davis, John, *Operations of Divine Love*, 1842.

Dickinson, James, *Life*, 1745.

Fothergill, John, *Life*, 1753.

Hall, David, *Memoirs*, 1758.

Hayes, Alice, *Widow's Mite*, 1749.

Holme, Benjamin, *Works*, 1753.

Lampe, Henry, *Autobiography*, 1895.

Pike, Joseph, *Life*, 1837.

Richardson, John, *Life*, 1843.

Story, Thomas, *Life*, 1832.

Stout, William, *Autobiography*, 1851.

Wilson, Thomas, *Journal*, 1847.

APPENDIX B

SHORT BIOGRAPHIES OF QUOTED AUTHORS

This appendix provides additional information on the lives of authors quoted in the text, but whose narratives are not discussed in depth. In some cases, biographies have been consulted for dates and other minor details not included in the first-person accounts, particularly for tracts which give little detail. These are cited at the end of the paragraph. Bibliographic details of the first-person accounts are in the Bibliography.

FIRST GENERATION: EARLY TRACTS AND FREESTANDING NARRATIVES

Edward Burrough (1634–1662), from Underbarrow in Westmoreland, was from a wealthy farming family. Burrough was part of a group of seekers in Westmoreland, having abandoned the Anglican Church for Presbyterian and then Independent churches in his early teens before joining the seekers. He was convinced by Fox, whom Burroughs mentions without naming, in 1652 when Fox first travelled in the area. Burrough became one of the most prolific writers of the first decade of the movement, and was one of the first to take the Quaker message to London. He died at 28 in Newgate gaol in 1662.

Elisabeth Brockbank, *Edward Burrough: A Wrestler for Truth*, London: Bannisdale, 1946.

Dorothea Scott Gotherson (1611–1680) was from the landed gentry, and inherited a family estate in Kent. She describes herself as seeking among the ‘various professors’ of religion in her youth, but gave up to become a royalist, indulging in the lifestyle of the wealthy. Here she says she beheld wickedness among them, ‘but not with such fair colours and large covers as the professors had’ (p. 7). She was married to a major in Cromwell’s army, and they resided at her estate. There is no record of when they joined Friends, though Scull notes that Fox reports converting some people in the area in 1655. She held a regular meeting in her home and was an active minister there, though she does not appear to have travelled in the ministry.

Edward Scull, *Dorothea Scott, otherwise Gotherson and Hogben of Egerton House, Kent*, Oxford: Parker, 1883.

Francis Howgill (1618–1668), a tailor, was born to farmers near Grayrigg, Cumberland and raised in the Church of England. His account is one of the earliest, written in 1656. He describes himself as a serious youth, caught in worries about election. He came to a standstill, joining with other seekers, until he was convinced by George Fox in 1652 on Fox’s first visit to the area. He was an early traveling minister, primarily to London, but later to Bristol and Ireland, and wrote several tracts. Like many, he was imprisoned several times, as was his second wife, and he died after becoming weakened in prison at the age of 50.

Ernest Taylor, ‘Francis Howgill’, *Friends, Ancient and Modern* 7, London: Friends Tract Association, 1908.

John Lilburne (c. 1614–1657) was born in Greenwich but raised on a family estate in Durham, and became a prominent leader of the Leveller movement. He was imprisoned at Dover, suspected of plotting against Cromwell, when he encountered Quakers in 1655. He seems to have been convinced largely through the writings of Dewsbury and other Friends, though he mentions a ‘Priscilla’ (this is likely a biblical reference, not the name of the woman), who first introduced him to Quakerism. His conviction narrative is in the form of four letters, written to his wife and friends explaining his conviction, with no discussion of his earlier life or seeking. The letters are included within a tract defending his new conviction that outward war is fruitless, and, incidentally, he was no threat to Cromwell. There seems to have been skepticism about his conversion among the authorities, though Gibb reports that Hubberthorn visited Lilburne in prison and found him ‘zealous and forward for the truth’ (p. 341). He remained in prison until he was granted a leave shortly before his death in 1657.

M.A. Gibb, *John Lilburne the Leveller: A Christian Democrat*, London: Drummond, 1947.

James Nayler (Naylor) (1618–1660) was a controversial, but important leader among early Friends. He was a yeoman farmer from Wakefield, Yorkshire, where he had a wife and children. The account quoted in the study, written shortly before his death, is a general description of conviction with little personal detail, but stresses humility. Nayler was convinced in 1652 by Fox, and was an early Quaker minister in Bristol and London. He seems to have been a charismatic figure, writing many tracts, and Dobbs, *Authority*, suggests that he had conflicts with Fox. He is most remembered for a 1656 incident in which he, accompanied by followers, enacted the entry of Jesus into Jerusalem by riding on a donkey into Bristol. He was tried for blasphemy, imprisoned and tortured, and died a few years later. He did reconcile with Fox and other Friends, and the preface to the narrative, published by Friends in 1676, is appreciative of Nayler's writing and contributions as a faithful minister, while distancing Friends from his errors.

William G. Bittle, *James Nayler, 1618–1660: The Quaker Indicted by Parliament*, York: Sessions, 1986. See also Gwyn, *Covenant Crucified*, pp. 162–88 for a discussion of Nayler and the importance of his trial.

Martha Simmons (Simmonds) (?) describes a seven-year period of seeking after an honest preacher, followed by seven years of living 'wantonly' after she despaired of finding authentic religion. She does not give dates, but if her seven-year intervals are not metaphorical, she was probably convinced in the mid-1650s. Simmons' brother Giles Calvert and husband Thomas were both London printers who published much of the early Quaker writing. She became a minister in London, and Gwyn (*Seekers*, p. 323) describes her as Nayler's closest ally and suggests there may have been sexual tension between the two. She became the centre of a dispute between the male leadership in London, who wanted Nayler to curb her long sermons, which may have been critical of other central figures. This led to a falling out between Nayler and Fox when the others asked Fox to arbitrate. Simmons accompanied Nayler to Bristol during his re-enactment of Jesus' entry into Jerusalem, and published a tract giving her perspective.

See Gwyn, *Covenant Crucified*, pp. 162–88 and *Seekers*, pp. 322–24 for further discussion of Simmons' seeking, conflicts and relationship to Nayler.

FIRST GENERATION: JOURNALS AND OTHER RETROSPECTIVE ACCOUNTS

Susannah Blanford (c. 1640?–?) became a 'Christian Quaker' and follower of George Keith, who attempted to strengthen the orthodoxy of Friends. She does not describe her early life, except to say she came from good parents, though Anglican, and had a desire for God as a child. She describes her conviction a few years before she met Friends, in the late 1650s, emphasizing the experience of God's power and love. This was followed by a period of seeking for a church where others knew God, until she heard Edward Burrough preach and joined Friends. She was not a public minister, and argues against women speaking in the church. (Dates are estimated based on her title, which says she had been a Christian 'some forty years', and her dating of conviction at age 18. The tract was published in 1698.)

Judith Applegate, 'Journals, Autobiographies, and Travel Narratives, Introduction', in Mary Garman, *et al.* (eds.), *Hidden in Plain Sight: Quaker Women's Writings, 1650–1700*, Wallingford, PA: Pendle Hill, 1996, pp. 151–70.

Barbara Blaugdone (1606–?), a teacher from Bristol, was a travelling minister in Ireland, and the narrative focuses on her ministry. She says little of her early life, and never married, but was convinced by John Audland and John Camm early in their ministry in 1654. She suffered both beating and imprisonment for her faith, and was ultimately banished from Ireland.

Judith Applegate, 'Journals, Autobiographies, and Travel Narratives, Introduction', in Mary Garman, *et al.* (eds.), *Hidden in Plain Sight: Quaker Women's Writings, 1650–1700*, Wallingford, PA: Pendle Hill, 1996, pp. 151–70.

John Burnyeat (c. 1631–c. 1690) was from Cumberland, but became a minister and travelled to Scotland and the New World. He settled in Ireland after marrying an Irish Friend, where he died in 1690 only two years after his wife's death. Burnyeat was convinced by Fox in 1653, and his account, written in the plural, describes the conviction of his generation. He says little about his early life, beginning the account with conviction, and while he mentions following a trade, he does not give details about his life. Burnyeat's son Jonathan was under the care of Pardshaw Friends after the death of his parents, and also became a minister (see below).

Edward Coxere (c. 1633–1694), from Dover, was a merchant seaman, although his parents tried to apprentice him to a cooper. His account is a seaman's journal, with no mention of faith until c. 1660 when he was convinced by Burrough and Samuel Fisher. He was married, but does not mention whether his wife became a Friend. He emphasizes his struggle to give up the violence of privateering, and looking for a Quaker ship where his conscience would not be compromised. The narrative was not published until the nineteenth century, and his adventures, including battles at sea and capture by Turkish privateers, makes entertaining reading. He also gives a detailed account of his imprisonment for the faith in later years.

John Crook (Crooke) (c. 1618–1699) says he was born in the north of religious parents, but gives little other autobiographical detail. He was a scrupulous child, concerned about sin and God's reproof. Crook appears to have come from a family with some means, and was sent to school in London at age 10. He was apprenticed at 17, although he does not say what trade, and settled at Hertford where he married. While at school he boarded with a 'wicked family' but found time alone to pray, continuing to wrestle with sin and seeking among the various traditions. He found Friends through the preaching of Dewsbury in 1654, although his conviction antedates his joining Friends, and he later played a role in Penington's conviction. He became a minister, and wrote several

epistles to Friends. His letter to Penington describing his conviction is appended to one of Penington's works, and he also wrote a later journal.

Frances Anne Budge, *Annals of the Early Friends*, Philadelphia: Longstreth, 1896.

Margaret Fell (1614–1702) was one of the most important leaders of the first generation of Friends. Her home at Swarthmore Hall in Cumbria became a centre for travelling Friends. Her epistles and advice on organizational issues was crucial in the formation of new Quaker structures in the post-restoration period. Fell came from the landed gentry, and married judge Thomas Fell at seventeen, later marrying George Fox after her first husband's death. The Fells were Puritans, inviting radical ministers to their home, including George Fox who convinced Margaret in 1652 when he first visited the area. Thomas does not seem to have joined Friends, but his position provided some protection from persecution in the area.

Judith Applegate, 'Journals, Autobiographies, and Travel Narratives, Introduction', in Mary Garman, *et al.* (eds.), *Hidden in Plain Sight: Quaker Women's Writings, 1650–1700*, Wallingford, PA: Pendle Hill, 1996, pp. 151–70.

Mary Springett Penington (c. 1616?–1682), from a wealthy family, was orphaned at three and raised by Anglicans she terms as 'loose Protestants'. She was a devout child who began to follow Puritan practice, although she was discouraged by the family. In her late teens she began a period of seeking, marrying William Springett, who shared her desire for authentic religion. Widowed at a young age, she married Isaac Penington, with whom she continued seeking until the couple were convinced in 1658. They suffered the loss of Isaac's estate to persecution, and Mary supported the family by the prudent management of her estate. She never became a minister, and her account is written for her children rather than for a broad audience.

Judith Applegate, 'Journals, Autobiographies, and Travel Narratives, Introduction', in Mary Garman, *et al.* (eds.), *Hidden in Plain Sight: Quaker Women's Writings, 1650–1700*, Wallingford, PA: Pendle Hill, 1996, pp. 151–70.

Joan Vokins (?–1690) of Reading gives little biographical detail in her account, which focuses on her travel in the ministry in North America. She says that God showed her the vanity of the world's customs when she was young, and like many was an intelligent and devout youth who quickly learned Scripture and enjoyed discussions of religion. She became dissatisfied with Puritan doctrine, and says she could not take comfort in her marriage or material things because she longed for marriage with the Lamb. She was convinced by some of 'God's messengers', but does not note the date, and says that self-righteousness was her primary failing. After her conviction, she began travelling in the ministry, leaving her family who only later were convinced.

Judith Applegate, 'Journals, Autobiographies, and Travel Narratives, Introduction', in Mary Garman, *et al.* (eds.), *Hidden in Plain Sight: Quaker Women's Writings, 1650–1700*, Wallingford, PA: Pendle Hill, 1996, pp. 151–70.

George Whitehead, (c. 1636–1723), was from a Presbyterian family in Westmoreland who had hoped he would become a minister, and sent him to school. Instead, he became a seeker, and describes an intellectual conviction in 1651, before he met Friends. He says he then indulged in vanity, and although he felt reproof, did not yet know how to follow the light of Christ. He was finally convinced by Fox the next year, and began travelling in the ministry among Friends at sixteen. He was imprisoned multiple times, as was his first wife, but outlived most of the other early leaders.

SECOND GENERATION: TRACTS AND FREESTANDING NARRATIVES

Richard Claridge (?) was trained for the priesthood in the Church of England, but became a Baptist preacher. He appears to have been well educated, and uses Scripture extensively. His account is a collection of four epistles to family and friends, with minimal biographical detail. His letters are dated from London, although he writes to another Baptist minister in Worcestershire and may have originally been from the midlands. He says that the Anglican teachings brought him no peace in the struggle against sin, and that the religious forms were miserable comforters. His conviction is gradual, leading him first to become a Baptist, then a Quaker, and while he came into the full truth among Friends, he does not denigrate Baptist doctrine. Claridge's account suggests that he was fully convinced before becoming a Quaker, but he does not stress this fact. He does not describe a calling to the ministry, but did write other tracts published by Friends in the early eighteenth century.

Samuel Crisp (?) was trained as a priest in the Church of England, but his account, which is in the form of two letters, does not give biographical detail. His spiritual journey is framed as a search for greater holiness. Prior to his conviction he served briefly as a chaplain, probably to an aristocratic family. He stayed only ten days, because he was offended by their vanity and, as a priest, says he was expected to flatter rather than challenge the family. He seems to have been convinced around the year 1700, through reading Barclay's *Apology*, but this was more than an intellectual experience. Crisp attended meeting for the first time only after his conviction. He became a school master after leaving the priesthood, probably in London, although he does not provide details.

SECOND GENERATION: JOURNALS

John Barcroft (c. 1663–1723) was born to Quaker parents who farmed in Ireland, although they were originally from Lancashire. He describes tenderness and piety in early childhood, and never diverged into wildness, yet he yearned for an experience of new birth or spiritual baptism that he believed was essential. This is fulfilled, but not with any external change, and the account seems formulaic in comparison with his description of his childhood experience. He married and returned to farming, and was not called into the ministry until age 33, when he became concerned about the deaths of many of the influential weighty Friends.

George Bewley (1684–1749) was born in Cumberland to Quaker parents, but emigrated to Ireland as an apprentice. He was in school until aged 13 or 14, and was apprenticed in Dublin at age 14 to a linen draper. Later he became a clerk in another Friend's business. He seems to have experienced an early conviction, which is continuous with childhood tenderness. Yet as a young man he fell into company and jocularity, and began to rebel against plain disciplines, but then accepted it as a cross. It is not until his early twenties that he begins to be concerned about inward sanctification, and describes a time of spiritual exercise, but does not give an experience of resolution. Given the detail of his earlier experiences, he may be fitting his experience to the communal story. He seems more exercised over the need for a particular experience than over judgment of sin. Though he did travel in the ministry as a companion, he says his call was participation in Meeting structures, including attending Yearly Meeting, and the role of the elder in visiting families. He is clear about the need for both ministers and elders, and argues that the same divine power qualifies both.

Uriah Brook (1683–1758) sketches his spiritual life with little biographical detail. His parents were probably Quaker, as a testimony by his son-in-law prefacing the journal says he was 'educated in the ways of truth'. He was not a minister, and his narrative presents a life-long spiritual struggle with only moments of resolution. He experienced visitations throughout his life, beginning in childhood, and went through times of fasting and scrupulosity, but still felt judgment and the weight of sin. He married late, after a long courtship in which he struggled with discernment. Yet the warm testimony from his son-in-law suggests he was a faithful and well-loved father.

Jonathan Burnyeat (1686–1709) is the youngest of the Quaker ministers discussed in the text. He was called to ministry at 12, and travelled as a companion of James Dickinson beginning in 1699 at age 13. His father had been a minister among Irish Friends, having married an Irish woman. His mother was not a minister, but was an active Friend. His mother and father died in 1688 and 1690, respectively, and he was placed under the care of relatives at Pardshaw Meeting, Cumberland. He died young, at 23, and his narrative is a travel diary without a retrospective account of youth and conviction.

Thomas Chalkley (1675–1741) was a sea captain who traveled extensively in the New World, particularly Nantucket, and combined work in the ministry with his economic interests. His parents were Quakers from outside London, although he does not talk about their ministry or suffering for faith. They may not have been particularly public Friends, but he does recall childhood teasing by non-Quaker children. He was apprenticed in his father's business, which provided him with an education. He emigrated to America, becoming a merchant with several vessels, and died on Tortola. He reports experiences of God as a child, but his conviction account is fairly formulaic. There is no clear sense of transformation and liberation from sin, although he does report openings of Scripture and an

experience of peace. Unusually for a second-generation Friend, he does not struggle with the call to ministry, accepting it as part of his spiritual growth.

John Croker (1673–1727) was born in Devon to Quaker parents, who were imprisoned and suffered loss of goods during persecution. He says his father was ‘by birth one called a gentleman’ and a tobacconist, and his mother’s family were shopkeepers. At 13 he was apprenticed to a serge maker and surgeon with whom he emigrated to America, but his master died and he had to make his way back to England through a series of adventures, including capture by French Privateers. He eventually returned home, working a little as a serge weaver and living on his father’s estate. His spiritual journey is atypical, and although he uses common Quaker language, there is no central conviction experience. He says he rebelled against his parents’ teaching, and although he made promises to God at difficult times, particularly on his journey home, he broke them when things improved. Finally, he says he kept his covenant, which was a daily cross, but does not appear to have a sense of liberation or power which allowed perfection. He continues to report trials, including the death of his wife. Croker began speaking in meeting almost casually, without a strong call, and only reports one brief episode of travelling in the ministry. The journal was not published until the nineteenth century.

John Davis (1667–1744) says he had a ‘moderate education’ by ‘honest parents’ in Wiltshire. He was apprenticed to a confectioner, but failed. He became a servant with a wealthy Duke, though returned to business after becoming a Friend. His account is atypical, as he abandoned his wife and indulged in drinking and gambling after repeated business failures. He had been a scrupulous youth, exploring Catholicism after rejecting the ‘loose’ practice in the Church of England, but despaired and turned to a libertine lifestyle. He was convinced at 36, after a struggle with sin was triggered by the near death of a close friend. They both turned to a Quaker doctor for advice, though only Davis became a Friend. He says he was impressed by the doctor’s assurance of salvation, and Barclay’s *Apology* convinced him of the doctrinal principles. He returned to his wife, who was also convinced. Yet the process of conversion was ongoing as he continued to struggle with pride, particularly in the vocal ministry, and with the cross of simplicity. After acting as a minister for some time, he recognized that he had become self-righteous and that his call to the ministry had not been genuine.

David Hall (1683–1758) was the son of Quaker parents in Yorkshire, who lost property due to persecution. He says that he was a good student at a free school in Skipton, fit for Cambridge or Oxford, and later became a master of his own Quaker school there. He was frail, due to a bout of smallpox as a child, which may have led him to emphasize his studies. He seems to assume his membership in Friends for most of the text, although there is a formulaic break in the narrative in which he talks about himself as a despicable worm, whom God saw fit to bless. This is not connected to the narrative, and there is no real sense of transformation

except in general terms. His parents were strong influences, and he went for help with discernment in his call to ministry at age 28.

Alice Hayes (1657–1720), from Hertfordshire, was raised in the Church of England. Although she felt reproof for singing and dancing, she says her parents did not discourage her. Her mother died when she was young, and she went into service because of conflicts with her stepmother. She was a devout youth, and her mistress predicted that she would become a Quaker. Hayes says that she continually read Scripture and prayed in her spare time. She attended meeting at this time, but did not become a Friend until after her marriage several years later. She injured her ankle, and could not work, making a promise with God that she would be faithful if it was healed. At first she found herself distracted from her promise by the comfort of married life, but falling ill and afraid that she would die, she underwent a final convincement after which a voice tells her to attend Quaker meeting. She does not discuss her calling to the ministry, but clearly became active, which at first caused conflict with her husband. Eventually he also became a Friend, and she was freed to serve as a minister in Holland and Germany.

Joseph Pike (1657–1729) was born in Cork, Ireland, to English parents. His father went to Ireland as a military officer, but gave up his commission to farm after converting to Quakerism shortly before Joseph was born. Pike's parents lost both position and property to persecution, and his father died when he was 11, after falling ill in prison. Pike does not mention his education, but became a wool merchant, traveling on business to England and Holland. His account is typical, with tenderness in childhood followed by a period in which he fell into fashions and wild company. His convincement was gradual, with two separate days of visitations. He alternately experienced comfort and times in which God withdrew, although slowly the comfort became more permanent. He says that his call was to church government and discipline, rather than vocal ministry, and he traveled to Yearly Meeting and other bodies. Not surprisingly, he talks at length about the importance of elders. Unlike most in the second generation, Pike describes an imprisonment for non-payment of tithes in 1681.

John Richardson (1666–1753) was from a farming family in Yorkshire, and although his father was a Quaker, he died when Richardson was young. His mother remarried a devout Anglican, who was well off, but John did not inherit since he refused to join his stepfather in business because of the stipulation that he leave Quakerism. Richardson does not describe his education, although he had some schooling, and mentions helping to pay for his brother's education before his mother remarried. He was sickly, and although apprenticed to a weaver, he learned to mend clocks in order to have less physically demanding work. He describes a short seeking stage, in which he 'sought after professors' but found them 'miserable comforters', and then withdrew into private devotion. His convincement is a gradual change, in which his inward state of seeking leads to the

dawning of a new light. He stresses new understanding and inward conviction of the truth, saying that he was convinced before he joined Friends.

William Stout (1665–1752), a grocer and ironmonger from Lancaster, came from a well-off farming family. He attended school until he was 14, before being apprenticed to a Quaker. His parents were Anglican, but he says that as a child he was concerned about the lack of true repentance in the tradition. His master held meetings in the house, although Stout did not attend, only occasionally listening at the door. His conviction experience, which focuses on obedience, was triggered by a travelling minister who visited the house. He struggled with the cross of public profession of the faith, particularly in business, but records taking losses rather than compromise his faith. He was not a minister, but handled funds for the relief of prisoners and other financial matters in his local Quaker community. His autobiography was not published until the nineteenth century, and contains more on his business dealings than his spiritual life.

Thomas Wilson (1654–1725) was one of a group of active Quaker ministers in Ireland, and travelled with John Dickinson, among others. He does not mention his education or social class, and his focus is almost entirely spiritual. He came from Cumberland, and was born into an Anglican family. He says that he sought after righteousness and disputed with priests during this seeking stage. He became convinced after attending a Quaker meeting for the first time, where the preaching shook him, and he entered the time of spiritual warfare. Unlike many in the second generation, he seems to come through to an experience of victory, and goes forward into the ministry with authority and confidence. He first travelled to Ireland in 1682, returning several times, as well as travelling in North America.

NOTES

1. Story, T., *The Life of Thomas Story*, abr. John Kendall and ed. William Alexander, York: Alexander & Co., 1832, p. 35.

2. The term ‘narrative tract’ will be used here to identify tracts which contain significant autobiographical detail, although the narrative elements may form part of a wider discursive argument. These were typically written within a few years of the events described. ‘Journal’ will be used loosely to refer to autobiographical writing that gives a broad, retrospective account of the life of the author. Most of the texts are not journals in the strict sense of a record of daily diary entries. Some appear to be based on diaries, but contain a mix of retrospective writing and diary entries, while others are memoirs.

‘First generation’ will be used to refer to individuals convinced in the first decade (approximately 1650–60) of the Quaker movement. The term ‘second-generation’ will be used to refer to all Friends convinced after 1675 and before 1700, regardless of parentage. Those second-generation Friends with Quaker parents will be referred as ‘birthright’ Friends, although this terminology was a later development.

3. Gwyn, D., *Covenant Crucified: Quakers and the Rise of Capitalism*, Wallingford, PA: Pendle Hill, 1995, p. 93. For other discussion of the eschatology of this period, see Gwyn, D., *Apocalypse of the Word: The Life and Message of George Fox*, Richmond, IN: Friends United Press, 1984; Moore, R., ‘The Faith of the First Quakers: The Beginning of their Beliefs and Practices Up to the Reformation’, PhD diss., University of Birmingham, 1993; and Wilcox, C.M., ‘The

Theology of Early Friends and its Implications for the Ministry of Women in Seventeenth Century Quakers', PhD diss., Kings College, 1991.

4. See Leachman, C., 'From an "Unruly Sect" to a Society of "Strict Unity": The Development of Quakerism in England c. 1650–51', PhD diss., University College London, 1997.

5. For an historical overview of this period, see Braithwaite, W.C., *The Beginnings of Quakerism*, London: Macmillan, 1912 and Braithwaite, W.C., *The Second Period of Quakerism*, London: Macmillan, 1919.

6. Braithwaite describes this transition in his histories, *Beginnings* and *Second Period of Quakerism*, and other historians, such as Leachman, 'Unruly Sect', and Moore, *Faith of the First Quakers*, have largely concurred on the causes of change. An exception is Tarter, M.L., 'Sites of Performance: Theorizing the History of Sexuality in the Lives and Writing of Quaker Women 1650–1800', PhD diss., University of Colorado at Boulder, 1993, who argues that the primary issue was reassertion of male control of women. Tarter's interpretation of early Quakerism emphasizes the new freedom and control over their own bodies which Quaker theology gave women. She argues the body became a 'site of prophecy', and therefore beyond the control of men, but after the first decades, male elders reasserted control over women by controlling publications and travel in the ministry. This was likely one factor among others in the concern to minimize public disunity in the face of internal controversy and persecution, as the powerful preaching of women brought criticism from non-Friends. Yet Tarter minimizes the role of female elders, such as Margaret Fell, who were instrumental in creating the new structures.

Gill, C., in 'Women in the Quaker Community: A Literary Study of Seventeenth-Century Political Identities', PhD diss., Loughborough University, 2000, is less critical of second-generation Friends, but also points to the re-establishment of women's roles among Friends in the late 1600s. Gill argues that, particularly for women, autobiographical writing of early Friends involved creation of a Quaker identity, in addition to a new self-identity (p. 84). It is acknowledged that this study does not do justice to women's experience, particularly as published works, which are primarily by men, were used, rather than manuscripts. This is a potentially rich area for future research.

7. Leachman, 'Unruly Sect' and Vann, R.T., *The Social Development of English Quakerism, 1655–1755*, Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1969.

8. Leachman's claim, in 'Unruly Sect', p. 63, that second-generation Friends are more orthodox is questionable, although it is clear that their apologetics assert orthodoxy where it might have been assumed by early Friends. Assessment of her claim would require a more precise definition of orthodoxy than she provides. Some historians, such as Leachman and Moore, *Faith of the First Quakers*, may impose later Quaker theology on early Friends. For instance, Leachman emphasizes the 'inner Light' as the most important aspect of Quaker doctrine, rather than Seed, Inward Christ, or other metaphors that are equally as common, and argues, following Moore, that the fact that Friends use 'Christ' and 'Light' interchangeably suggests they de-emphasized the incarnation.

Similarly, Moore argues that the atonement was not important to first-generation Friends (*Faith of the First Quakers*, p. 226). This study contradicts the claim, suggesting that while Friends insisted that salvation history must be understood as a whole, this included the historic Christ. This emphasis is not in conflict with orthodoxy, nor is Friends understanding of Christ as eternally present. Moore seems to have a limited concept of atonement as a doctrine about the historic Christ. Furthermore, she argues that 'confessional statements' may be at work in claims by other authors that early Friends were orthodox Christians, but this is no less true of her own work. It is misleading to leave liberal views unmarked as non-confessional. The present study thesis acknowledges that it is written from inside the Christian community, but will attempt to present an accurate view of early Quakerism.

9. Gwyn has also studied changes in the Quaker understanding of the covenant between God and humanity in the seventeenth century. Gwyn, D., *Covenant Crucified and Seekers Found: Atonement in Early Quaker Experience*, Wallingford, PA: Pendle Hill, 2000.

10. Damiano, K.A., 'On Earth as it is in Heaven: Eighteenth Century Quakerism as Realized Eschatology', PhD diss., Union of Experimenting Colleges and Universities, 1988.

11. Wilcox, *Theology of Early Friends*.

12. Creasey, M.A., 'Early Quaker Christology', PhD diss., University of Leeds, 1956, reprint, *Catholic and Quaker Studies* 2, Manasquan, NJ, 1973; and Jones, T.C., 'George Fox's Teaching on Redemption and Salvation', PhD diss., Yale University, 1955.

13. Moore's approach, in *Faith of the First Quakers*, is primarily historical, although her subject is theology.

14. Graves study of Quaker rhetoric and sermons and Gwyn's modelling of truth are most relevant, and will be discussed in the final section. Graves M.P., 'Robert Barclay and the Rhetoric of the Inward Light', *Quaker Religious Thought* 26 (March 1993), pp. 17-32; Graves, M.P., 'The Rhetoric of the Inward Light: An Examination of Extant Sermons Delivered by Early Quakers', PhD diss., University of Southern California, 1972; and Gwyn, *Seekers*.

15. Creasey, M., *'Inward' and 'Outward': A Study in Early Quaker Language*, Supplement to the *Journal of the Friends Historical Society* 30, London: Friends Historical Society, 1962, and Trowell, S., 'George Keith: Post-Restoration Quaker Theology and the Experience of Defeat', *Bulletin of the John Rylands University Library of Manchester* 76 (Spring 1994), pp. 121-37.

16. Dobbs, J.P., 'Authority and Early Quakers', PhD diss., University of Oxford, 1995, p. 55. Dobbs' discussion of Quaker use of Scripture and other sources of theological authority are useful, and will be discussed.

17. Watkins, O., *The Puritan Experience*, London: Routledge, 1972, p. 1.

18. The English Reformation includes a continuum of religious movements, from Calvinists to Quakers and other radical groups. Although the term Puritan can be used to refer to the entire spectrum, including Friends, here it will be used in a more limited sense to refer to orthodox Puritans; however, it is recognized that there are significant similarities and continuities between Quakers and their contemporaries. See Nuttall, G., *The Holy Spirit in Puritan Faith and Experience*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1946.

19. Watkins, *Puritan Experience*, p. 15.

20. Watkins, *Puritan Experience*, p. 34. Other short autobiographical forms are also present among early Friends, including descriptions of sufferings for the truth, or accounts of extraordinary travels in the ministry. These are not discussed unless the work includes an account of conviction.

21. Watkins, *Puritan Experience*, p. 182 notes that in his introduction to Caton's journal, Fox recommends the book to 'all who knew him (Caton)', rather than to the public as an evangelistic tract. Fox, G., forward to *Journal of the Life of that Faithful Servant and Minister of the Gospel William Caton*, A Select Series, Biographical, Narrative, Epistolary, and Miscellaneous, Vol. 6, ed. Barclay, J., London: Darton, 1839.

22. Examples are Claridge, R., *Mercy Covering the Judgment Seat and Life and Light Triumphant Over Death and Darkness*, London: Hinde, 1757; and Crisp, S., *Two Letters Writ by Samuel Crisp About the Year 1702 To Some of His Acquaintance, Upon His Change From a Chaplain of the Church of England to Join with the People Called Quakers*, 8th ed., London: Hinde, n.d. The Claridge letters were written in the mid-1690s, while Crisp's were written in 1702. No other freestanding conviction narratives of the third generation were identified in the early eighteenth century. Most journals were published posthumously.

23. There was no formal system of eldership in the late seventeenth century, but second-generation Friends do describe the influence of parents and other older Friends. These role models have been referred to as elders here, although the term is rare in the narratives.

24. Pike, J., 'Some Account of the Life of Joseph Pike', in A Select Series, Biographical, Narrative, Epistolary, and Miscellaneous, Vol. V, ed. Barclay, J., London: Darton & Harvey, 1837, 1. Although the lives of a few Friends will be discussed in detail, Appendix B includes biographies of those quoted in brief.

25. Watkins, *Puritan Experience*, p. 2.

26. Watkins, *Puritan Experience*, pp. 37-39.

27. Watkins, *Puritan Experience*, pp. 11-14.

28. Previous discussions of Quaker autobiographical forms include Brinton, H., *Quaker Journals*, Wallingford, PA: Pendle Hill, 1972, pp. 6-47, and Watkins, *Puritan Experience*, pp. 160-20. Watkins focuses on early Friends, with some discussion of eighteenth-century journals, while Brinton presents an overview of journals throughout Quaker history. These two perspectives generally support the assertions that will be made here. A third study of early Quaker understanding of conviction is Jones, *George Fox on Redemption*, who analyses Fox's pastoral teaching on regeneration, although he does not draw on narrative sources.

Watkins argues for three stages of spiritual growth: 'growing dissatisfaction with orthodox Puritan teaching, a period of fruitless seeking for true religion...and finally submission to the inner light' (*Puritan Experience*, p. 162). This categorization emphasizes the seeking of first-generation Friends, but is only partially applicable to the second generation. In addition, Watkins does not include childhood experience, which is less commonly described in the earliest autobiographical tracts. Brinton points to four stages in Quaker autobiography: divine revelation in childhood, youthful playfulness, an inner conflict he describes as an experience of a 'divided self', and an attempt to follow 'the leadings of Light' (p. 5). This reflects the spiritual trajectory of the second and subsequent generations, who went through a period of youthful frivolity rather than seeking and who more consistently give accounts of early experience.

Brinton's description of spiritual warfare as a division between a lower and higher self is based in Jungian thought, but is not developed. This thesis will focus on the theological interpretations given by Friends of the time, rather than modern conceptions of the self which are tangential to the questions asked herein. The question of the self and spiritual development among early Friends bears further work, and is addressed to some extent by Gill, 'Women in the Quaker Community'.

Both authors obscure the complexity of the final stages of conviction. Brinton does not identify an initial experience of the divine (referred to here as a day of visitation), or point to the experience of regeneration, both of which are de-emphasized in second-generation journals, as will be shown. Watkin's fusion of these experiences into a single experience of submission is perhaps more surprising, given his theoretical discussion of the Puritan experiences of law and gospel. This may reflect the difficulty of describing visitation or regeneration, which makes spiritual warfare (law) most conspicuous in the narratives. Watkins discussion of Puritan narratives also emphasizes spiritual warfare rather than the initial experience of the gospel, which might be expected to be prominent.

Jones sketches five steps in the process of regeneration in Fox's thought, drawing on pastoral sources including a sermon recorded in Fox's Journal (Fox, G., *Journal of George Fox*, ed. Nickalls, J., London: Religious Society of Friends, 1975, p. 117). These stages are (1) standing still in light, which (2) exposes sin and (3) shows Christ to be the saviour who has died for humanity, (4) repentance or accepting responsibility for one's sins, and a (5) change in life (pp. 134-35). This is a summary of Fox's advice to those seeking the experience, not a discussion of Fox's own spiritual journey. Jones' emphasis on repentance seems exaggerated (this, and Jones' insistence that regeneration required a confession of Christ, suggests an imposition of later evangelical formulations). Although some authors express repentance, the narratives suggest submission to God's will is more important. Standing in the light is a pastoral recommendation for opening oneself to the Presence of God, and it reflects the standstill of early Friends. The lack of reference to spiritual warfare in Jones's work is not surprising, given Fox's account, which minimizes this stage.

29. There are authors in both periods that seem to have a more Puritan view of childhood, describing only reproof. The dichotomy between law and grace may be expressed in other ways when childhood is not discussed, and many of the early narratives describe a struggle with the Puritan legalism during the seeking stage.

30. The term 'tenderness', which occurs frequently in Quaker writing, refers to a state of openness and vulnerability before God, often accompanied by tears.

31. Gwyn, *Seekers*, pp. 52-57.

32. A period of youthful excess is also found in most Puritan accounts and, as with Quakers, the sins reported are minor. See Watkins, *Puritan Experience*, pp. 53-57. While the condemnation of jesting seems harsh to modern ears, some authors seem to be condemning wordplay and accomplishments that were part of the culture of flattery in the upper classes. This may have developed into a condemnation of all playfulness later in the period. 'Disciplines' refer to public witnesses such as plain dress and speech, and refusing hat honour.

33. Because of this tension, labelling this stage is difficult. Conviction and day of visitation are both used by Friends, but generally refer to the entire experience of awareness of God's presence and ensuing spiritual warfare. These experiences are treated individually here in order to stress that there is an initial experience of Presence that leads to the internal struggle. The term 'day of visitation' will be used, as it best conveys this aspect of the experience. The term 'conviction' will be used to describe only the revelation of sin.

34. The corporate theology is unclear, probably because the underlying experiences differ. There seems to be the possibility of multiple experiences of Presence in first-generation narratives, and grace may initially be refused. Rhetorically, the second generation place more emphasis on a single day of visitation, and on judgment rather than grace. Yet their experience suggests multiple experiences of Presence.

35. Watkins, *Puritan Experience*, p. 173, argues that for Puritans, remembering a verse of Scripture was the trigger for the threshing experience, while Quakers generally heard a direct voice, because of their emphasis on experience over Scripture. It is true that the Friends are more experiential, and some first-generation authors report a voice, but there are a variety of experiences. Only one of the second-generation authors studied here reported an external voice, although some describe being 'pierced' by the preaching of other Friends. Gill's work, in 'Women in the Quaker Community', pp. 106-108, suggests that women are more likely to point to the influence of others in conversion. External events, such as coming close to death from illness or injury are more likely triggers, causing the youth to worry about their sinful condition. Most first-generation Friends had already been troubled about sin and election, and thus there is more emphasis on grace.

36. First-generation Friends may describe the illumination of sin, but place less emphasis on it, perhaps because anxiety over sin is part of the seeking stage. In contrast, second-generation Friends are coming out of a stage in which they have submerged reproof and indulged in sin, however minor.

37. Narratives of second-generation Friends who are convinced from outside of Quakerism are more like those of early Friends. Some claim to have been convinced of Friends principles, and to have come through the experience of regeneration, before meeting Friends.

38. Watkins, *Puritan Experience*, pp. 11-13.

39. Jones, *George Fox on Redemption*, p. 134, makes a distinction between the entire process of regeneration and the final stage of perfection, which is consistent with later writings, but not the early narratives of the 1650s. The earliest tracts seem to assume perfection, which will generally be referred to here as conversion following early Quaker usage, is immediate and integral to regeneration, rather than a process that occurs over time.

40. Friends often refer to the practices of plain speech, plain dress, the refusal of tithes and hat honour and other disciplines as a cross. Although blatant persecution and arrests largely ended with the Act of Toleration in 1689, social pressures and some legal restrictions continued.

41. Narratives were identified using bibliographies compiled by Watkins, *Puritan Experience*, and Brinton, *Quaker Journals*. In addition, the index to the Bevan-Naish Collection, held by Woodbrooke College, was invaluable, as it arranges biographical writing by birth date. This is not an exhaustive study, and many more first-generation writings were identified than are included here. More than half of the second-generation writings identified have been included.

42. Intermediate generation accounts of those convinced between 1660 and 1675 are not included. This is, in part, to limit the number of narratives; however, 1660 is consistent with Braithwaite's division of Quaker history, spanning roughly from 1649 to 1661 and from 1662 to the end of the century, respectively, *Beginnings* and *Second Period*. The definition of these periods is somewhat arbitrary, and Moore (*Authority Among Early Friends*, p. 15) argues that the significant break occurred in 1666 with the publication of an epistle by eleven influential Friends asserting the authority of communal discipline. The most influential of the first-generation leaders were convinced by 1660, and thus this is a useful division for this project. The second-generation lower limit of 1675 is also arbitrary, but was chosen as a time when significant numbers of children would be coming of age whose parents were convinced in the 1650s and early 1660s. The upper limit of 1700 for second-generation Friends reflects Braithwaite's division, *Beginnings* and *Second Period*.

The wider time span (1650–1660 as opposed to 1675–1700) was necessary to obtain similar numbers of narratives in each period, as those convinced in the first generation published more than twice the number of accounts as those convinced between 1675 and 1700. (This estimate is based on both Watkins' bibliography in *Puritan Experience* and the materials found in the Bevan–Naish collection at Woodbrooke, which are readily searched as the autobiographical works are indexed by birth date). The earliest first-generation narratives were written in the first decade, while their journals were written in the late 1600s. The second-generation journals were written in the early 1700s, and many were published at the beginning of the reformation of the 1740s and 50s. Thus, there are perspectives from three theological periods reflected in the narratives studied: the first decade, the late seventeenth century, and the early to mid-eighteenth century.

43. For example, 'conversion' or 'convincement' may refer to the entire process of becoming a Friend. In addition, the experiences themselves may not be distinct, and different authors may describe differing degrees of divine agency using the same term.

44. The term 'day of visitation' occurs among first-generation writers, but is more common in the second.

45. Jones, *George Fox on Redemption*, p. 134.

46. Jones, *George Fox on Redemption*, p. 134, refers to this stage as 'perfection', but 'conversion' is more consistent with the language of early Friends.

47. See pp. 46–47, below.

48. For instance, convincement accounts by Dewsbury, W., *The Discovery of the Great Enmity of the Serpent against the Seed of Woman*, London: Calvert, 1665, and (Scott) Gotherson, D., 'To All That Are Unregenerated, A Call to Repentance', 1661, reprinted in Edward Scull, *Dorothea Scott, otherwise Gotherson and Hogben of Egerton House, Kent*, Oxford: Parker, 1883, form part of the argument of tracts. Narratives by Lilburne, J., *The Resurrection of John Lilburne, now a prisoner in Dover Castle*, London: Calvert, 1656, and Crook (Crooke), J., [Untitled Letter,] in Penington, I., *To all Such as Complain That They Want Power*, London: Wilson, 1661, pp. 23–26 are letters published for a wider audience, and were addressed to Lilburne's wife and friends, and to Isaac Penington, respectively. Crook later wrote a longer account of his life, *A Short History of the Life of John Crook*, Hereford: Jones, n.d., which covers his early life, convincement and calling to the ministry with significant personal detail, but ends in 1656. Thus, it is intermediate in form between the freestanding narratives of the 1650s and later journals. James Naylor's (Nailor, Nayler) relatively late 1659 account, *What the Possession of the Living Faith Is* (n.p., 1676) is written in the first person, but is a generalized description of rebirth with almost no personal detail. It is the opening example of a treatise on the nature of a living faith. Although written in 1659 it was not published until 1676, because of embarrassment over Nayler's 1656 enactment of the entry into Jerusalem, and contains an explanatory preface.

Names are spelled as on the title page of the tract used, and alternate spellings noted. Spelling of names was variable in the seventeenth century, even in the same tract; e.g.: Naylor, Nailor, Nayler; Hubberthorn, Hubberthorne.

49. Hubberthorn, R., 'A True Testimony of Obedience to the Heavenly Call', in *A Collection of the Several Books and Writings of that Faithful Servant of God Richard Hubberthorn* (London: William Warwick, 1663), pp. 1-6.

50. Brockbank, E., *Richard Hubberthorne of Yealand: Yeoman, Soldier, Quaker*, London: Friends Book Centre, 1929, was consulted for biographical detail not found in the narrative.

51. In the body of the text he indicates that he is held in Westchester gaol, but the tract is dated from Chester.

52. Hubberthorn, *True Testimony*, pp. 4-6.

53. Hubberthorn, *True Testimony*, p. 2.

54. Hubberthorn, *True Testimony*, pp. 1-2.

55. Hubberthorn, *True Testimony*, p. 2. The imagery is from Jer. 23:29, which refers to the word as a fire and hammer, and is also used by Dewsbury to describe a period of internal struggle.

56. Hubberthorn, *True Testimony*, p. 2.

57. Hubberthorn, *True Testimony*, p. 4.

58. Bauman, R., *Let Your Words Be Few: Symbolism of Speaking and Silence Among 17th Century Quakers*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983, reprint London: Quaker Home Service, 1998, pp. 74-76.

59. Dewsbury, *Discovery*.

60. Dewsbury, *Discovery*, p. 1. See Smith, E., *William Dewsbury: One of the Valiant Sixty Quakers*, York: Sessions, 1997, for a biography which indicates periods spent in prison.

61. John Lilburne mentions the tract as influential in his conviction in 1656. Lilburne, *Resurrection*, p. 5.

62. Gotherson opens with the same quotation. She argues, in response to those who accuse Friends of rejecting the idea of original sin, that a child's sin is not imputed from parent to child, and infants are heirs of heaven when born. *To All Unregenerated*, p. 113.

63. Gen. 3:24 KJV. Note: Here and elsewhere in the dissertation, all scriptural quotes are from the KJV, as it is most helpful in identifying early Friends' use of the texts.

64. Dewsbury, *Discovery*, p. 14. Gotherson, *To All Unregenerated*, p. 93, also equates the sword with the law.

65. Dewsbury, *Discovery*, p. 17.

66. Dewsbury, *Discovery*, p. 17. Dewsbury's language is figurative, and he seems to be relating stages of his life to Scripture, rather than experiencing visions.

67. The allusion here is unclear, but is likely be a reference to Moses, the prophets and all of the faithful through time who have 'finished their testimony' (Dewsbury, *Discovery*, p. 18) although he may also intend to point to the persecution of Friends. He describes seeing the abomination set up in the holy place, probably in reference to the apostate church.

68. Dewsbury, *Discovery*, p. 18.

69. Dewsbury, *Discovery*, p. 18. References to groaning in labour for the new creation are common in Quaker narratives, and are a reference to Rom. 8:26.

70. Dewsbury, *Discovery*, p. 19.

71. Penington, I., 'A Brief Account of My Soul's Travel Toward the Holy Land', in *Works*, Vol. 2, 2d ed., London: Clark, 1761, pp. 49-53. Other biographical detail is gleaned from Mary Penington's longer autobiography, which will be mentioned in the following section. Penington, M., *Experiences in the Life of Mary Penington (Written by Herself)*, ed. Penney, N., Philadelphia: Biddle Press, 1911, reprint London: Friends Historical Society, 1992.

72. Isaac Penington, *Soul's Travels*, p. 49.

73. Isaac Penington, *Soul's Travels*, p. 50.

74. Isaac Penington, *Soul's Travels*, p. 50.

75. Isaac Penington, *Soul's Travels*, p. 50.

76. Isaac Penington, *Soul's Travels*, p. 51.

77. Isaac Penington, *Soul's Travels*, p. 51.

78. Isaac Pennington, *Soul's Travels*, p. 52.

79. Isaac Pennington, *Soul's Travels*, p. 52.

80. Isaac Pennington, *Soul's Travels*, p. 52.

81. Isaac Pennington, *Soul's Travels*, p. 52.

82. Though the first generation prefers the language of revelation, only occasionally using the metaphors of threshing and refining that are popular among the second generation.

83. See p. 19, above.

84. Gotherson, *To All Unregenerated*, p. 3.

85. Crook, *Sort History*, 7.

86. For instance, Friends often claim, with Paul, that they are fools in Christ (1 Cor. 1:18-19).

87. The metaphor of the garden is probably taken from Revelation as much as from Genesis. One of the promises to the faithful in Revelation is a return to the garden to feed on the tree of life (Rev. 2:7): 'To him that overcometh, will I give to eat of the tree of life, which is in the midst of the paradise of God'. John witnesses the fulfilment of this promise, coming to see the 'new heaven and new earth' (21:1) and reaching the tree of life at the centre of the New Jerusalem (22:2). The passive stance of Dewsbury, and to some extent Hubberthorn, as they watch the unfolding of the internal apocalypse, is analogous to John's role as a witness in Revelation, and may be intentional.

88. Lilburne's narrative, confessing the errors of his past and describing his conversion, is entitled *The Resurrection of John Lilburne*.

89. They may refer to having experienced death and a second birth, to having a new name, or to having being restored to the state of Adam (Christ as Seed). They also refer to having received spiritual manna, which is linked to the new name in Rev. 2:17: 'To him that overcometh will I give to eat of the hidden manna, and will give him a white stone, and in the stone a new name written which no man knoweth saving he that receiveth it... I will write upon him the name of my God, and the name of the new city of God, which is new Jerusalem' (Rev 2:17; 3:12 KJV). Geoffrey Nuttall points to this scriptural reference to a new name, but does not connect it with references to manna and the tree of life. Nuttall, G., 'Reflections on William Penn's Preface to George Fox's *Journal*', *Journal of the Friends Historical Society* 57 (1995), pp. 113-17.

90. This probably reflects the audience, more than a shift in theology. The early tracts were intended to establish the authority of the writer and gain converts, and so emphasize the call to preaching. Journals of the first and second generation are more likely to emphasize suffering for the truth and being sustained by God, a message more meaningful inside the community. Preaching and outward disciplines were both public, in that they led to persecution, and speech acts such as refusing oaths, going naked as a sign and even holding meetings for worship contrary to law blur the line between preaching and other ethics. See Bauman, *Let Your Words be Few*. Even those who were not called to the public ministry had to take up a public testimony. This was emphasized by the second generation, as will be shown.

Note the term 'outward cross' can also be used to refer to the historic crucifixion, in contrast to the inward experience of crucifixion.

91. Nayler, *Living Faith*, pp. 3-4.

92. Burnyeat, J., *Journal of the Life and Gospel Labours of John Burnyeat*, A Select Series, Biographical, Narrative, Epistolary, and Miscellaneous, Vol. 6, ed. Barclay, J., London: Darton, 1839, p. 151. See also Jones, *George Fox's Teaching on Redemption*, p. 117, for the role of the historic Christ in Fox's teaching.

93. Jones, *George Fox's Teaching on Redemption*, pp. 82-83.

94. The reference to groaning is from Rom. 8:19, which describes the earth groaning in labour for a new creation. For women, submission to God and a new relationship to creation was liberating in a more tangible way. Tarter emphasizes the physicality of early Quaker language and worship. She argues that the body becomes a 'site of prophecy', giving women

control over their bodies even while acknowledging God's ultimate authority. Early Quaker worship included audible groans and sighs, quaking and, occasionally, enactments of rebirth, although these are not mentioned explicitly in the narratives. Tarter, 'Sites of Performance', pp. 12-13.

95. Fox, *Journal*, p. 27.

96. For instance, see the quote from Penington, p. 17, above. Similarly, Burnyeat, *Journal*, p. 154, says of the illumination of sin and the need to depend on Christ for salvation, 'we thus had a sight and sense of the insufficiency of all we either had or could do to give ease, help, or salvation'.

97. He bases this, in part, on Friends use of Rom. 8:18, which describes the groaning of the earth for a new creation. Gwyn, *Apocalypse*, pp. 69, 202.

98. Crook's description of regeneration is unusual. He remains physically in London, but walks as if he were in another place. This emphasizes both the new relationship to creation and the separation from the world urged by early Friends. 'I walked as one taken from the earth...as if I walked above the World, not taking notice of (as it seemed to me) of any Persons or things as I walked up and down London streets. I was gathered up in the marvellous light of the Lord and filled with a joyful dominion over all things in this world'. Crook, *Short History*, p. 16.

99. Fox, *Journal*, p. 27.

100. Nesti, D.S., 'Grace and Faith: The Means to Salvation', PhD diss., Gregorian University, Rome, 1975, reprint, *Catholic and Quaker Studies* 3, Manasquan, NJ, 1975, p. 143, points to the covenant as the framework for the new relationship that results from regeneration, but argues that this is an individual understanding of covenant. Friends do use the idea of covenant, among other metaphors, although it is not common in narrative writings. The concept of covenant expresses both an individual relationship and the gathering of a new people of God, although Nesti misses the importance of the latter in Quaker thought.

101. Watkins argues that the key experience was the discovery of the light, 'an inward power that convicted a man of sin, showed him the truth, and gave him power over evil', *Puritan Experience*, p. 160. His emphasis on light rather than the Seed is probably an imposition of later Quaker perspectives, and does not identify the light as Christ, not an unnamed power that is 'discovered', or revealed. Although later Friends typically emphasized Light to refer to the inward presence of the spirit, Dobbs argues that the early Fox more often used the rhetoric of life within the power of God. In this life and power, Friends were to be brought together in unity and truth, and given authority over false leaders who had usurped God's true power. Dobbs, 'Authority', pp. 55-56.

102. Simmons, M. (Simmonds), *A Lamentation For the Lost Sheep of Israel*, London: Calvert, 1655. This is not a narrative tract, but includes a brief description of Simmons' conviction. Simmonds was active in the ministry in the south, and a supporter of James Nayler. The quotation is Song of Solomon 5:16.

103. Burrough, E., 'A True Declaration, and A Discovery to All the World of my Manner of Life', in his *A Warning to the Inhabitants of Underbarrow*, London: Calvert, 1654, p. 35.

104. 2 Cor. 4:7. See, for instance, Vokins, J., *God's Mighty Power Magnified*, London: Northcott, 1691, reprinted in *Hidden in Plain Sight: Quaker Women's Writings, 1650-1700*, ed. Garman, M., et al., Wallingford, PA: Pendle Hill, 1996, pp. 255-73 (264), who says 'he brought me to be as Clay in the hand of the Potter. He filled my Vessel with his heavenly treasure, and fulfilled that Scripture that testifies that he hath said, *I honour them that honour me*'.

105. Watkins, *Puritan Experience*, p. 183 concurs, saying 'Quaker thought left at first little room for wide fluctuations in the spiritual life after the rigours of conviction'. Watkins refers primarily to those in public ministry, but even those not serving as ministers describe taking on the plain disciplines as a cross. The call to the ministry is not questioned in the early tracts, probably because of the need to establish the authority of the writer. The later journals often report a struggle in which the writer at first resists the call to minister, but feels a growing

weight until submitting to the call. This is more common in second-generation journals, and will be discussed in the next section.

106. Fox also speaks extensively about the love of God. At one point he describes an experience in which he was 'taken up in the love of God, so that I could not but admire the greatness of his love'. Fox, *Journal*, p. 14

107. Friends use the term 'opening', though without clear definition, to refer to an inward experience of illumination and new understanding. They often speak of Scripture being opened or describe a new clarity, and, less often, refer to the opening of creation.

108. See, e.g., Howgill, F., *The Inheritance of Jacob Discovered*, London: Calvert, 1656.

109. Gotherson, *To All Unregenerated*, describes a more general battle with sin. With the exception of Gotherson, the earliest narrative tracts studied here are by men. Most were central figures in the Quaker movement, or, like the Leveller John Lilburne, *Resurrection*, had been leaders in other movements. There are later retrospective accounts by women and non-leaders, which will be discussed below.

110. The rejection of reason is implicit in the rhetorical rejection of wisdom, but is not explicit.

111. 1 Cor. 1:18-19.

112. It is tempting to argue that Friends believed that knowledge was imputed, although they resisted this term in opposition to the Calvinist understanding of Christ's righteousness as imputed at justification. Their concern was that justification must involve a real change in behaviour. Thus, it is not surprising that they were accused of being secret Catholics, with a belief in inherent righteousness. Jones argues that Fox taught that righteousness is imparted, not imputed in a forensic sense, because the Christian becomes a new creature in Christ, *George Fox's Teaching on Redemption*, p. 35.

It is probably most helpful to avoid these categories, and suggest that Friends held that both righteousness and knowledge are characteristics of Christ, who dwells inwardly. Humanity shares in these gifts by continually turning to the Light within, but it is unclear whether these become characteristics of the human person. Certainly, the human must be converted, or exhibit a change in lifestyle, but this must be maintained through abiding in Christ. This is probably closer to the Catholic understanding, but this can only be inferred, as Friends' theology was not typically developed explicitly. This lack of clarity means that some Friends, including Fox, were accused of claiming divine authority for themselves. See Dobbs, 'Authority', pp. 212-35 for a discussion of the challenges to Fox's authority.

113. Crook, *Short History*, p. 39.

114. Penington, I., 'A Treatise Concerning God's Teachings, and Christ's Law', in *Works*, Vol. 2, 2d ed., London: Clark, 1761, pp. 503-31. Note: the quote is from p. 516, but page is incorrectly numbered 416 in this edition.

115. Initial resistance to the call is quite common in later journals, though not in the early tracts. As has been noted, many of the early tracts were written by men who had already served as religious leaders in other traditions and were probably less likely to resist a calling. Yet this shift probably also marks a growing concern for testing the call, particularly in the light of various controversies involving strong leaders who were in opposition to Fox and other central figures.

116. Nesti, 'Grace and Faith', p. 116. He also says that this revelation is 'God's internal and illuminating call of grace', which invites humanity to salvation, convinces humanity of the need for salvation, and gives assurance of salvation' (p. 87).

117. S.B. (Blanford, S.), *An Account Given Forth by One That Hath Been A Traveller* (n.p., 1698, reprinted in Garman (ed.), *Hidden in Plain Sight: Quaker Women's Writings, 1650-1700*, pp. 285-306.

118. Moore suggests this was a rejection of elaborate allegorical interpretations popular at the time and an attempt to follow apostolic doctrine. Moore, 'The Faith of the First Quakers', p. 64.

119. Friends did use Scripture in disputational writing and apologetics, but rarely make arguments from texts in the narrative writing.

120. Palmer, V.T., Jr., 'Early Friends and the Bible: Some Observations', *Quaker Religious Thought* 26 (March 1993), pp. 41-55.

121. Fox, *Journal*, p. 104.

122. Dobbs, 'Authority', p. 92.

123. Dobbs, 'Authority', pp. 336-37.

124. Nutall, G., *The Holy Spirit in Puritan Faith and Experience*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1946, and Gwyn, *Seekers*, both discuss the relationship between Friends and other Puritan groups. See also Knox, R.A., *Enthusiasm*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1950, reprint London: Collins, 1987, pp. 146-47, who argues that Quaker ethics were grounded in Anabaptist and Puritan practices.

125. George Fox's preface to Caton's journal, in Caton, W., *Journal of the Life of that Faithful Servant and Minister of the Gospel William Caton*, A Select Series, Biographical, Narrative, Epistolary, and Miscellaneous, Vol. 6, ed. Barclay, J., London: Darton, 1839, p. xvii.

126. Caton, *Journal*, 1839. The journal had been entrusted to George Fox after Caton's death, c. 1665, in Holland, where he had gone to spread the Quaker message and eventually married a Dutch Friend, Anneken Dirrix.

127. Most of the journals were probably written using notes and diary entries. Watkins, *Puritan Experience*, pp. 183, 186-87, argues that keeping a daily journal was a well-established habit in the period, and George Whitehead explicitly says that his memoir was written from 'divers papers, notes, and memorials', *Memoirs of George Whitehead*, ed. Tuke, S., York: Alexander & Son, 1830, p. 24. Some contain very little biographical detail, and may omit significant issues, such as marriage or mention of the writer's 'outward work'.

128. Some, such as Joan Vokins, use the style of early Friends throughout the text. Her narrative is an extended conviction narrative, though written retrospectively. Vokins, *God's Mighty Power Magnified*. Vokins, Barbara Blaugdone (*An Account of the Travels, Sufferings and Persecutions of Barbara Blaugdone*. Shoreditch: T.S., 1691, reprinted in Garman [ed.], *Hidden in Plain Sight*, pp. 285-306, and Blanford (*Account Given Forth*), all women, published extended narrative tracts in the early 1690s, focusing on ministry but including an account of conviction. Blaugdone, *Account of the Travels*, and Blanford, *Account Given Forth*, also use the earlier rhetorical style throughout the text. These include brief accounts of conviction, but emphasize the call to ministry and travails. These seem to be directed to the wider world, unlike most journals which are addressed to the Quaker community, and may be intended to justify women's ministry, though this is not explicit.

129. Some 'journals' are little longer than the earlier tracts, but are included here because they are retrospective.

130. This may reflect differences in education and social background. Narratives from the north and Ireland, and authors with less education, are more likely to emphasize obedience and a general sense of sin rather than an opening of creation and knowledge. This is not a clear division, as Hubberthorn was himself well educated. This is an area for future research.

131. Watkins, *Puritan Experience*, p. 193.

132. Ellwood's writing style is also unusual, with more texture and biographical detail. His purpose does not seem to be pastoral, and he was not a minister. He was an important background figure, however, as he was the editor of Fox's journal. Ellwood's journal was not published until the nineteenth century. Ellwood, T., *The History of Thomas Ellwood*, Morley's Universal Library, London: Routledge, 1885.

133. Caton, *Journal*, was in his mid-teens when convinced. He lived in the Fell household when Fox first visited in 1652. Margaret Fell was an early convert to Friends, and became an important elder and organizing force in the movement. Her home became a centre for Friends travelling in the ministry. Fell later married Fox, well after the death of her first husband. Caton went to the estate to live with a relative who was a tutor to the family, staying to serve as a

companion to Fell's son. Margaret Fell seems to have been fond of young Caton, and encouraged his spiritual development and paid for him to attend school along with her son.

Ellwood's father, of a 'declining family', was a friend of the Peningtons, first of Mary Springett Penington and her daughter, and then of the couple after Mary remarried. Ellwood was convinced in his late teens, c. 1658, and although this brought conflict with his father, was supported by the Peningtons, often staying with them. They helped him find a position as a reader (to John Milton, who lost his sight with age), supported him while in prison and tried to bring a reconciliation with Ellwood's father. Ellwood later served as a tutor to the younger Penington children. Ellwood, *History*.

134. The chronology is slightly confusing. Ellwood, *History*, seems to describe two cycles of judgment and reconciliation, but they are temporally close, and he seems to be describing an initial resistance. It was soon overcome, and he submitted to the threshing experience.

135. Caton, *Journal*, p. 7.

136. Nayler, *Living Faith*, and Burnyeat, *Journal*, also write in the plural, giving a sense of corporate discovery and purpose.

137. Ellwood, *History*, p. 29.

138. Ellwood, *History*, p. 30.

139. This may be merely a reflection of Ellwood's less evangelistic style, as he may relate experiences that others omit. Regardless, the theology implicit differs significantly from that of his contemporaries.

140. Coxere, E., *Adventures by Sea*, ed. Myerstein, E.H.W., Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1945; and Penington, *Experiences*.

141. Penington, *Experiences*, p. 33.

142. She mentions having 'let my mind run out in prejudice against some particular Friends', probably an oblique reference to Mary and Isaac Penington's support of Perrot against Fox (*Experiences*, pp. 34-35).

143. The narratives of second-generation Friends are almost entirely in journal format and published posthumously. There are only two tracts written near the time of conviction, both of which are collections of letters published for a wider audience, Claridge, *Judgement Seat*, and Crisp, *Two Letters*. Both authors are newly convinced, and no narrative tracts written by young, birthright Friends were identified. This probably reflects a new emphasis on the influence and authority of elders within the community. There is a short journal by Jonathan Burnyeat, son of John Burnyeat, published after his death at the age of 23. He began travelling in the ministry at age 12 with James Dickinson and other older Friends. The text is a travel diary beginning in his eighteenth year, and unfortunately, contains little reflection and no account of his conviction or other aspects of his life prior to age 17. Burnyeat, J., *Some Account of the Gospel Labours of Jonathan Burnyeat*, London: William & Frederick Cash, 1857.

144. Dickinson, J., *A Journal of the Life, Travels and Labour of Love in the Ministry of that Worthy Elder and Faithful Servant of Jesus Christ, James Dickinson*, London: Hinde, 1745. He travelled with both Thomas Wilson and the young Jonathan Burnyeat, and was an important figure among Irish Friends.

145. Second-generation Friends used the term 'traditional Quaker' to refer to those who had grown up in Quakerism, but had not experienced conviction, and so had their faith only by education and imitation. See the account of Bownas' conviction on pp. 31-33, below. Vann, *Social Development*, pp. 158-96 discusses the implications of the Quaker emphasis on conversion for birthright Friends.

146. Dickinson, *Journal*, p. 1.

147. Dickinson, *Journal*, p. 2.

148. Dickinson, *Journal*, p. 3.

149. Dickinson, *Journal*, p. 3.

150. Dickinson, *Journal*, p. 4.

151. Dickinson, *Journal*, pp. 4-5.

152. Dickinson, *Journal*, p. 6.
153. Dickinson, *Journal*, p. 7.
154. This event occurred after he first interrupted a Presbyterian Meeting to speak, and he had previously spoken in the Friends Meeting (Dickinson, *Journal*, p. 9). Later Quaker journals rarely recount such disruptions. Ironically Wilson, in describing an incident in which a group tried to break up a Quaker meeting at Kendal by dragging out Dickinson, argues that neither Christ nor the apostles disturbed religious assemblies (*Journal*, pp. 9-10).
155. Dickinson, *Journal*, p. 10.
156. Story, *Life*.
157. Story, *Life*, p. 12.
158. This maybe something of an overstatement, as Story did attend the Quaker meeting in his seeking stage, and probably knew something of Friends from the general culture. He says that he owned Quaker books, but had not read them until after his conviction. Other converted Friends also make this claim, including Thomas Wilson, in *A Journal of the Life, Travels, and Labours of Love In The Work of the Ministry, of That Eminent and Faithful Servant of Jesus Christ, Thomas Wilson*, London: Sowle, 1730, reprinted in *Journals of the Life, Travels, and Gospel Labours of Thomas Wilson and James Dickinson*, London: Gilpin, 1847, and Hall, D., in *Some Brief Memoirs of the Life of David Hall*, London: Hinde, 1758.
159. See p. 19, above.
160. He left law after he joined Friends in 1691, supporting himself by writing legal documents and later working with Penn in Pennsylvania.
161. Story, *Life*, p. 21.
162. Story, *Life*, p. 29.
163. Story, *Life*, p. 31.
164. Story, *Life*, p. 32.
165. Story, *Life*, p. 33.
166. Story, *Life*, pp. 34-35. Note: The Sun of Righteousness is from Malachi, a favourite of second-generation Friends. References from Mal. 1, 3-4 are common—Jacob's struggle with Esau, the refiner's fire that purifies gold and silver, the dawning of the Sun of Righteousness—as are the images of the threshing floor and the axe laid to the root of the tree in Matt. 3:10-12. Several Pauline texts referring to the struggle between flesh and Spirit are also used.
167. See opening quote, p. 6, above.
168. Story, *Life*, pp. 37-38.
169. Story, *Life*, pp. 41-42.
170. Story, *Life*, p. 42. Story's reference to the Tree of Life is unusual in the second generation, suggesting a completion of salvation history more typical of first-generation Friends.
171. Story, *Life*, p. 70.
172. He is invited to attend only two weeks after his initial experience of worship, pointing out that this was unusual. He does not go into detail on the divisions, but may refer to the Wilkinson–Story separation, in which some Friends challenged the new organizational structures imposed by Fox and others (Story, *Life*, p. 72). See Dobbs, 'Authority', pp. 62-82 for a discussion of the separation.
173. Story, *Life*, pp. 75-77. He says the dissenters are 'thieves and robbers, climbing up some other way; by education, tradition, imitation, or sinister interests and worldly views; who, not being under the rule of law and grace, would act and say of themselves contrary to the way of Truth and Church of the Living God'.
174. He says this was because he treasured the silence and because preaching was counter to his natural disposition as he was 'prone to weeping'.
175. Story, *Life*, pp. 131-32.
176. Bownas, S., *An Account of the Life, Travels, and Christian Experiences In the Work of the Ministry of Samuel Bownas*, London: James Phillips, 1795.
177. Bownas, *Life*, p. 2.
178. Bownas, *Life*, pp. 42-43.

179. Bownas, *Life*, p. 3.

180. Bownas gives two accounts of his conviction in his journal, the second of which is part of an independent account of his travels in Scotland, which he inserts. This is undated, but seems to have been written somewhat earlier. The conviction account is part of a dispute about the Quaker ministry with a Scotch Presbyterian. The two accounts differ in some details, but describe a similar experience. The second emphasizes the transformation and authority to preach, as might be expected, rather than his experience of opening and tenderness, and gives greater detail on his initial call.

181. Bownas, *Life*, p. 43.

182. Bownas, *Life*, p. 3. The second account is similar, but not identical. He says he hears a voice in his breast, which says, 'Look unto me, and thou shalt find help'.

183. Bownas, *Life*, p. 4.

184. Bownas, *Life*, pp. 4-5, quoting 1 Cor. 2:14. Unusually, Bownas includes citations.

185. John 3:3-5.

186. Bownas, *Life*, p. 5.

187. Bownas, *Life*, p. 43.

188. Bownas, *Life*, p. 7.

189. Fothergill, J., *An Account of the Life and Travels In the Work of the Ministry of John Fothergill*, London: Hinde, 1753.

190. He gave up the family home, and supported himself by a plot of family land and occasional hired work

191. Both Fothergill, *Life*, and Bownas, *Journal*, repeatedly emphasize the importance of older Friends as role models for youth and young ministers. This may be an early eighteenth-century concern, reflecting the period in which the account is written

192. Fothergill, *Life*, p. 2. Although Fothergill uses the term 'convinced' here, he does not seem to mean that he had an mature experience of regeneration. He may mean that he was convinced of Quaker doctrinal principles, even though he had not yet experienced them inwardly.

193. Fothergill, *Life*, p. 4.

194. Fothergill, *Life*, p. 5.

195. Fothergill, *Life*, p. 5.

196. Fothergill, *Life*, p. 6.

197. Fothergill, *Life*, pp. 6-7.

198. Fothergill, *Life*, p. 13.

199. Fothergill, *Life*, p. 15.

200. Fothergill, *Life*, p. 16.

201. Fothergill, *Life*, p. 17.

202. Fothergill, *Life*, p. 20.

203. Pike, *Life*.

204. Damiano, 'On Earth as in Heaven'.

205. Leachman, 'Unruly Sect', pp. 20-23 also argues that second-generation Friends held a more gradual understanding of perfection, suggesting that Friends were distancing themselves from the accusation that they did not distinguish between humanity and the indwelling God.

206. Jack D. Marietta argues that the primary concern in the reformation of Quakerism in the mid-eighteenth century was not the spiritual state of individual Friends, about which little is said in minutes, but the reputation of the Society, and of 'Truth' itself. Marietta, J.D., *The Reformation of American Quakerism 1748-1783*, Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1984. This may be true of the formal practice, but the purpose of the narratives, many of which were published at the beginning of the reformation, is pastoral. It is likely that both concerns were present.

207. Jacob, Joseph and Saul are favourite references, as are allusions to the covenant between God and Israel. See, for instance, Bewley, G., *A Narrative of the Christian Experiences of*

George Bewley, Dublin: Jackson, 1815, p. 36, for a long aside comparing the Quaker movement to Israel. As an elder, Bewley is concerned that Friends, like Israel, have a special blessing, but risk losing it if they do not remain faithful.

208. Hayes, A., *A Legacy or Widow's Mite; Left by Alice Hayes to Her Children and Others*, 2d ed., London: Hinde, 1749.

209. Even those first-generation Friends who emphasize spiritual warfare, such as Hubberton, draw more often on imagery from Revelation, suggesting the completion of salvation history, even if they do not describe coming into a new creation.

210. See p. 34, above.

211. See p. 30, above.

212. For instance, see Claridge, R., 'An Answer to a Question', in *Mercy Covering the Judgment Seat and Life and Light Triumphant Over Death and Darkness*, London: Hinde, 1757, which is appended to his narrative epistles.

213. Richardson, J., *An Account of the Life of that Ancient Servant of Jesus Christ, John Richardson*, 5th ed., London: Edward March, 1843, p. 13.

214. See p. 57, above.

215. Richardson, an introverted convert to Friends, had his stuttering healed as part of his empowerment for ministry. He initially resisted the call, but this caused God to 'take away from me the comfort of his holy presence for several months altogether' (*Life*, p. 33). Of the fourteen Friends convinced after 1685, only two, Hall, *Life*, and Burnyeat, *Gospel Labours*, describe an experience of empowerment, whereas of those seven convinced prior to 1685, only Pike, *Life*, does not.

216. Damiano, 'On Earth as in Heaven', pp. 158-60, points to the initial struggle with calling to the ministry as central in the experience of eighteenth-century ministers.

217. Clearly, this may also have been true of some in the first generation as well.

218. Story, *Life*, and Claridge, *Judgement Seat*, both continue to stress new knowledge as a result of regeneration.

219. Some examples include Chalkley, T., *A Journal or, Historical Account of the Life, Travels and Christian Experiences of that Ancient, Faithful Servant of Jesus Christ Thomas Chalkley*, 2d ed., London: Hinde, 1751; Hayes, *Widow's Mite*; Richardson, *Life*; and Wilson, *Journal*, all of whom receive clear communications in voices and visions. That visions are not given particular weight is supported by reading the journals of Dickinson and Wilson together, as they were travelling companions. Wilson reports an incident where Dickinson had a premonition of how they would be saved from French privateers by a fog, but Dickinson merely reports that God preserved them from harm despite the danger. Wilson, *Journal*, p. 17; Dickinson, *Journal*, p. 125.

220. Pike, *Life*, p. 38.

221. Chalkey, *Journal*, pp. 8, 9.

222. Johannine imagery is probably more common in discursive writing, it can be found in the narratives, and is closely linked to sensory images. Several authors, such as Crook, *Journal*, pp. 16-17, talk of the illumination of sin, and after regeneration, the Light that shows the truth. Blanford, *Account Given Forth*, p. 287, provides an example of the veil metaphor: 'I felt a Power arise in my heart, and I said this is it I have waited for, and with great power it rent the Vail, chased away my dark thought, gave me some understanding of Scripture, and I could say, *I have heard of thee, and have read of the Wonders thou didst for the Children of Men*'.

Paul asserts that the covenant of law is a veil that obscures the full glory of God. When the veil is removed, 'we all, with open faces beholding as in a glass the glory of the Lord, are changed unto the same image from glory to glory, even as by the Spirit of the Lord' (2 Cor. 3:18). The passage explicitly links regeneration, or transformation, with both a new understanding and the limitations of the law. As with early Friends, it is the glory of God that is perceived, which conforms the Christian to the image. In Paul, regeneration is a process, rather than an accomplished fact. Paul uses the metaphor to suggest the relationship between regeneration, or transformation, and new understanding beyond the limitations of the law. He says as the veil of

the law is removed, Christians behold the glory of God in a mirror, as they are transformed into the image of God (2 Cor. 3:18 KJV). Paul sees regeneration as a process, and thus second-generation Friends may be closer to his original meaning, although some seem to have been re-entangled in the law.

A less common, but equally sensory, passage is used by Richardson, *Life*, p. 6, to describe the entire experience of regeneration: the story of the blind man healed by Jesus at Bethsaida (Mark 8:22). The blind man at first regains only partial vision, but is completely healed on the second application of mud. This also suggests the incomplete victory over sin experienced by many second-generation Friends, but offers the possibility of full regeneration. He says that after his conviction, he saw 'clearly things as they are, and not darkly, mistaking trees for men'. The term 'darkly' suggests the image of a dark glass in 1 Cor. 13:11-12, with its reference to a new understanding that accompanies rebirth. 'When I was I child, I spoke as a child; when I became an adult I put an end to childish things. For now we see in a mirror, dimly, but then we will see face to face. Now I know only in part, then I will know fully, even as I have been fully known'. Richardson's new sight includes opening of Scripture, but extends to all forms of understanding. Thus, questions of discernment are only secondarily about knowledge—what is crucial is an experience of new birth and a healed sight. Later Friends do not differ from their parents in their understanding of truth, but that understanding is placed in tension with their experience of incomplete regeneration.

223. Claridge, *Judgement Seat*, p. 13.

224. See p. 1, above.

225. 'Negative theology' is used here to describe a theology that solves the problem of the limits of human knowledge about God by arguing that God is unknowable, and therefore, that all that humanity can do is come to God in worship without articulating the faith. Placher, W.C., in *The Domestication of Transcendence: How Modern Thinking About God Went Wrong*, Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 1996, argues that the modern emphasis on certainty and objective knowledge placed Christianity with a choice between negative theology and theology that distanced God and humanity. He suggests the use of narrative approaches to theology as an alternative, although he does not address issues of interpretation of Scripture and other corporate stories. Arguably, the theology of early Friends was narrative, and expressed in the language of the scriptural story as it unfolded in the present. Second-generation Friends are less immediately caught up in the sweep of salvation history, and apologetic literature drew some into scholastic disputes about God and an attempt at precise articulation of a faith. Others, such as Stout, *Autobiography*, and Davis, J., *Some Account of the Wonderful Operations of Divine Love and Mercy as Exemplified in the Life and Experience of John Davis*, Manchester: Harrison, 1842, express doubts about the wisdom of becoming embroiled in disputes, and retain the earlier view.

Where early Friends were content with a relational, subjective knowledge, the modern worldview prioritized objective knowledge. Both Story and Claridge are well educated, as a lawyer and clergyman, respectively, and were likely aware of the emerging modern tension between subjective and objective knowledge. Their position may reflect an incipient division between liberal and evangelical Friends, and an increasingly distant view of God, despite the language of relationship. Gwyn, *Seekers*, argues that such tensions may have been present even in the 1640s between more intellectual, southern seekers and northern seekers. Marietta, in *Reformation*, p. 35, argues that deism was a concern in the reformation of American Friends that occurred in the mid-eighteenth century. Story was from the north, and education and other exposure to literature may be more important than geography. The influence of modern thought on the development of early Quakerism deserves further research.

226. Damiano, 'On Earth as in Heaven', p. 125, has argued that eighteenth-century Quaker spirituality balanced cataphatic and apophatic approaches to the faith, which emphasize articulation of knowledge of God and negative theology, respectively. This bears questioning in the light of the second-generation narratives. While both approaches are present within

Quakerism, more intellectual Friends like Story may have favoured the apophatic, while others, like Dickinson, held to the more cataphatic style of early Friends.

227. Wilson, *Journal*, p. 25.

228. As an example, John Davis, one of the more interesting characters, admits to falsely supposing he had an 'opening' that he was called to the ministry. He says that 'I thought myself good enough to be a preacher, and many times when at Meetings, I have been under concern, which seemed to spring from the Truth; such Scriptures opening to my mind as I thought I was to preach'. He says that he could pray with zeal for a long time, and had large openings while alone which 'confirmed me I must be a preacher, thinking I had wit enough to do it better than many'. God preserved him and 'mercifully made manifest, by degrees, the deceitfulness of this spirit; and, deepening my experience, He at times led me to the place of the true prayer, and gave me to perceive the mystery of iniquity the working in my heart'. Not surprisingly, Davis's account was not published until the nineteenth century, probably both because of his mistaken judgment and because he is one of the few authors that was fully involved in a sinful life, including drinking, gambling and abandoning his wife. His conversion likely appealed more to the evangelicals of the 1800s than to his contemporaries. Davis, *Operations of Divine Love*, pp. 42-43.

229. See pp. 28-29, above.

230. Damiano, 'On Earth as in Heaven', pp. 142-43.

231. Chalkey, *Journal*, p. 8.

232. Story, *Life*, p. 41.

233. Story, *Life*, pp. 102-103.

234. John Croker, *Brief Memoir of the Life of John Croker, Select Series, Biographical, Narrative, Epistolary, and Miscellaneous*, Vol. 6, ed. Barclay, J., London: Darton, 1839, pp. 309-10. Only two other cases were noted. Like Croker, Alice Hayes is reluctant to confront publicly her former priest, although she feels called. In prayer, she promises that she will go if a certain Friend returns the next day from a journey. He does, and after meeting he accompanies her to the church service, where she speaks. She invites the congregation to meeting that night, many of whom are convinced. She implies that this confirms her leading. Thus, she both looks for signs and uses 'post hoc' discernment. Hayes, *Widow's Mite*, p. 34.

While courting, Pike says that he 'earnestly desired to know the Lord's mind' about his marriage, and waited to be guided. He did not receive any negative indication that it was the wrong choice and eventually 'found in the end great clearness and satisfaction of mind to proceed'. He also says they were several signs that provided evidence to confirm the choice, but does not say what these signs were. Pike, *Life*, p. 8.

235. Croker's conversion, *Memoir*, is probably the least convincing, see note, p. 73, below. See Parker, S.E., *Led by the Spirit: Toward a Practical Theology of Pentecostal Discernment and Decision Making*, Journal of Pentecostal Theology Supplement Series 7, Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1996, on Pentecostal decision-making. He argues that seeking signs, or 'laying fleeces' (in reference to Gideon's laying down a fleece promising God that he would go to battle if it were wet in the morning) may be a narcissistic absorption of God into the self. He points to reliance on an inner feeling or 'the deep sense that this feels right' (p. 108), as a more mature form of discernment. There is great potential for a comparative study of Pentecostal and Quaker decision making, and it is significant that Parker also chose a narrative approach—ethnography—as the appropriate methodology.

236. See p. 51, above.

237. The authors rarely give scriptural citations in the narrative accounts, which are directed inside the community, but do include them in descriptions of disputes with non-Friends. It is not unusual for Friends of either generation to report disputes with clergy and other non-Quakers. Yet a few second-generation Friends argue against disputing or are careful to point out that they never went beyond their leading in a dispute. This suggests an underlying concern about the public image of Friends, and that disputing might feed the pride. Story, for

instance, is willing to enter into disputes, but is careful to note that he waited for authority from God (*Life*, p. 91).

238. Barcroft, J., *A Brief Narrative of the Life, Convincement, Conversion and Labours of Love in the Gospel-Ministry of that Worthy servant of Jesus Christ, John Barcroft*, Dublin: Fuller, 1730.

239. Some writers, suggesting that the Bible serves as a spiritual food, but cannot be hoarded or possessed, use manna as a metaphor in discussion of Scripture. See Bownas, *Life*, p. 15, for an example.

240. 'When the Lord's Spirit seem to be withdrawn from me, although I read them, and understood the words, yet my mind not being influenced and opened by the Lord's Spirit, I received not the same benefit or comfort; and from hence learned, by living experience, that it is by and through the openings of His Spirit that we receive the true comfort or profit in reading the Holy Scriptures' (Pike, *Life*, pp. 33-34).

241. Pike says of his vocation as an elder, 'I saw, in the Divine Light, that I must join heart and hand with other faithful brethren, in the reformation of many things that were creeping in amongst the Friends in Ireland' (*Life*, p. 55). This seems to be of particular concern among northern and Irish Friends, such as Bewley, *Christian Experiences*, Bownas, *Life*, Fothergill, *Life*, and Wilson, *Journal*, although they also point out the strong examples that they had in first-generation Friends. Marietta notes that Irish Friends were particularly harsh with disownments later in the century, which suggests a more fervent development of the faith (*Reformation*, p. 10).

242. Although the Yearly Meeting had indicated that Friends travelling in the ministry should carry a letter from their Monthly Meeting, the narratives suggest that this was not yet formalized, particularly for those travelling in a local area, even if they were preaching publicly. None of the writers describe the process, only mentioning that they carried letters of endorsement for trips abroad.

243. All three men cite Barclay's *Apology*, though Crisp also reports reading Penn's *No Cross, No Crown*. Robert Barclay's *Apology for the True Christian Divinity*, n.p., 1678, reprint Glenside, PA: Quaker Heritage Press, 2002, was the primary systematic defence of Quakerism. Penn, W., *No Cross, No Crown, A Discourse Shewing the Nature and Discipline of the Holy Cross of Christ*, in *Works*, Vol. 2, London: Phillips, 1782.

244. The lack of explicit reliance on tradition may be, in part, because narratives are necessarily individual in perspective. Yet it also reflects a continued emphasis on personal appropriation of the emerging communal tradition. Richardson, *Life*, *Story*, *Life*, and Wilson, *Journal*. Richardson is not strictly a convert, as his father was a Friend who died in prison when Richardson was eleven. This undoubtedly had some influence, but he was raised afterwards by an Anglican stepfather and mother, and his account includes a seeking stage typical of non-birtheright Friends.

245. Tarter argues that the standardization was to a particularly male model of the self, to which women conformed. This may be the case, although confirmation would require a greater number of women's narratives be studied than are included here. It is true, as Tarter notes, that women seemed to have maintained the early rhetorical forms in their narratives, with the exception of Penington, *Experiences*. Tarter, 'Sites of Performance', pp. 176-261. Gill, in 'Women in the Quaker Community', p. 84, argues that, particularly for women, autobiographical writing of early Friends involved creation of a Quaker identity, in addition to a new self-identity. She is less suspicious than Tarter of this collective identity being inherently male, but points to the difficulty of untangling the personal and the societal (p. 111).

246. Almost all birtheright Friends describe taking up a Quaker lifestyle as a cross, whereas only some journalists of the first generation use this language. While many joining Friends from the outside continue to struggle with accepting the cross of Quaker discipline, this was probably less difficult for those already inside the community. Some birtheright Friends do initially resist the discipline, and others left Quakerism, but for many the social pressure to conform to the

discipline of their own community probably outweighed the external pressures. See Vann, *Social Development*, for a discussion of these issues.

247. Admittedly, it is difficult to assess the validity of experience from narratives, and differences in articulation and detail may be mistaken for sincerity or insincerity. For instance, John Croker, *Memoir*, never really describes an experience of purging, and his periods of piety are triggered by a series of predicaments in which he prays to God for help as he tries to make his way home from North America after being stranded when his master dies. The experience that most approximates the expected threshing experience comes later in life, well after he is already engaged in the ministry. Uriah Brook was a merchant who never became a minister, and may represent a typical Friend. He describes an ongoing struggle with sin, and seems to have died seeking peace. His testimonial contains the faint praise that in 30 years he never fell asleep in meeting. Brook, U., *A Short Account of the Inward Exercises and Christian Experience of Uriah Brook*, Gloucester: Bellows, 1868.

It should be noted that William Stout, another non-minister, seems to have experienced a more full conviction. Stout, W., *Autobiography of William Stout of Lancaster*, ed. J. Harland, London: Simpkin & Marshall, 1851. Davis, in *Operations of Divine Love*, has multiple threshing experiences prior to joining Quakers. He becomes a minister, but much later realizes this was out of pride, not a genuine call, and is not sufficiently humbled.

248. Jones, *George Fox's Teaching on Redemption*, p. 134.

249. For example, see Burnyeat, *Gospel Labours*, pp. 23–24, who describes an incident in which an older Friend objects to the draft of a harsh letter he intends to send to a meeting condemning departures from discipline that he had witnessed. He relies on Dickinson, his travelling companion, who is also older and well known, to intercede. Burnyeat says, 'this conflict with fleshly reasoning, although sharp, lasted not long'. Although Burnyeat condemns reason, there is a suggestion that there might be redeemed reason that is not 'fleshly'. The interplay of the authority of the three men suggests an informal network, in which some Friends wield considerable influence. Burnyeat shows the draft to Dickinson voluntarily, because he wants to be certain of his leading, and Dickinson shows it to the other, unnamed Friend who is from the local area.

250. Crisp, *Two Letters*, p. 13.

251. Creasey, 'Early Quaker Christology'; Gwyn, *Seekers*; Jones, *George Fox's Teaching on Redemption*; and Kuenning, L., 'Miserable Comforters: Their Effect on Early Quaker Thought and Experience', *Quaker Religious Thought* 25 (October 1991), pp. 45–60 present a clear understanding of early Quaker Christology and soteriology, which concurs with the conclusions of Section II.

252. Jones, *George Fox's Teaching on Redemption*, p. 57.

253. Kuenning, *Miserable Comforters*, p. 47, discusses the anxiety and lack of assurance that resulted from the Puritan emphasis on saving faith. Although one was not saved by works, an upright life was considered to be the evidence of election. He says, 'assurance that one had such [saving] faith was apt to depend heavily, if not on good works themselves, at least on the sincerity of one's effort to perform them. This could be agonizing to those who conceived perfect sincerity more radically than the Puritan preacher anticipated'. Kuenning concludes that the liberating aspect of the Quaker message was the teaching that Christ had died for all people. This was probably an element, but Kuenning misses the Quaker emphasis on the possibility of achieving victory over sin.

254. Creasey, 'Early Quaker Christology', p. 112.

255. Drawing on Augustinian theology, Jones, *George Fox's Teaching on Redemption*, pp. 148–49, argues that early Friends held that sanctification restores to humanity the state of Adam—*posse non peccare*, but not to that of Christ—*non posse peccare*. The sanctified person has the possibility not to sin, whereas it was not possible for Christ to sin. Human perfection is not absolute in this perspective, and the individual can choose, as Adam did, to turn away from God. Perfection requires ongoing dwelling in the Presence of God, and it is significant that

while Barclay, *Apology*, pp. 206–207, Prop. 8:2, asserts a belief in perfection, he says that he must take it on faith because he has not reached that state.

256. See p. 20, above. This clearly contradicts Moore's claim, *Faith of the First Quakers*, p. 226, that the atonement was unimportant to Friends. Friends describe both an inward and outward cross, but emphasize the former as the inward authentication of the outward. The crucifixion of human will was understood to be this inward expression.

257. Second-generation authors tend to describe regeneration as a single experience, perhaps because the unity of grace was more firmly established, though they recognized the ongoing process. See Creasey, 'Early Quaker Christology', p. 118, and Jones, *George Fox's Teaching on Redemption*, pp. 82–83, and pp. 38–39, above.

258. Punshon, J., *Reasons for Hope: The Faith and Future of the Friends Church*, Richmond, IN: Friends United Press, 2001, pp. 265–69, argues that the conviction experience for first-generation Friends was analogous to the 'second-blessing' experience of entire sanctification in Wesleyan thought, in which sanctification is generally understood as an instantaneous work of grace following conversion. Some also equated this with Spirit Baptism, though Pentecostals later separated Spirit Baptism out as a third experience of empowerment. Punshon claims that because Friends already 'knew' Christ, their conviction experience was a second gift of sanctification, and is not analogous to conversion as usually defined in the evangelical tradition.

As he acknowledges, early Friends would likely protest that they were not truly Christian until conviction. The narratives suggest a twofold conviction experience, at least for early Friends, and the latter experience does appear to be analogous to second blessing. Yet Friends were clear that justification and sanctification are a single work of grace, and would probably disagree with Wesley's description of distinct experiences reflecting different works of grace. Regardless, second-generation Friends do appear to be seeking a second experience, and there is a lack of clarity in which sanctification can be reduced to a human work.

Punshon suggests a conflict in both Wesleyan and Quaker thought between a formulation of sanctification as an instantaneous gift, emphasizing God's grace, or as a more gradual process of growth. He suggests that the latter is more open to Pelagianism, or works-righteousness. This may be true in practice, but theologically there is no reason that gradual growth cannot also be understood as a gift of grace, as is held in Catholic sacramental theology. Punshon says that initially both traditions struggled with this issue, but Quakerism moved toward a more gradual view of sanctification, as is suggested in the second-generation narratives, while Wesleyans continued to hold to a more instantaneous view.

259. Jones, *George Fox's Teaching on Redemption*, pp. 140–47, points to two unresolved problems in Fox's soteriology—the role of human will and the temporal link between justification and sanctification. Jones says that Fox is 'in that Pauline or Arminian position which insists that man's active obedience is required for his election and salvation and at the same time is certain that such obedience and faith is the gift of divine grace' (p. 140). He concludes that while Fox maintains that unregenerate humanity cannot avoid sin, obedience is an act of free will for the regenerated. King argues the problem remains open, and says 'Fox does not really solve the problem of how perfection can exist in man, but he appears to solve it by always keeping a subject–object relationship between human and the divine within man'. Thus, the distinction between the divine and human is not blurred, and the Light or Seed are distinct from the human nature, but perfection is the fruit of turning to the divine within. Hadley King, R., *George Fox and the Light Within*, Philadelphia: Friends Book Store, 1940, pp. 43, 71. The narratives suggest that Friends did see themselves as having a choice to remain obedient, though popular understanding of free will may not be clear. This suggests that the assurance that early Friends received involved an inward sense that such a choice was possible, because they had received a vision of a restored earth.

260. George Keith, who caused a schism among Friends in the 1690s, was concerned about the lack of attention to the historic crucifixion, among other issues. He accused Penn of deism, believing Penn distanced God by insisting that immediate revelation was sufficient without

knowledge of Jesus. Keith eventually left Friends, but his concerns reflect the potential for shifts in Quaker theology, as revelation is no longer placed in the context of salvation history. See Trowell, *George Keith*.

261. Gwyn, *Seekers*, compares the seeking of the English reformation with the 1960s in US history.

262. Although Damiano's soteriology is unclear in 'On Earth as in Heaven', pp. 131-65, she gives a rich account of eighteenth-century Quaker spiritual formation and the understanding of sanctification as a process of growth. She defines sanctification as 'opening to grace' rather than the state of perfection that results from opening and conforming to grace (p. 131). This is inconsistent with orthodox definitions of sanctification, and is not supported by Bownas, *Qualifications of the Gospel Minister*, Philadelphia: Pendle Hill and Tract Association of Friends, 1989, on whom she bases her argument. She lists sanctification, conviction, watchfulness (attentiveness to conversion), and preparation as separate 'qualifications' of a minister, whereas Bownas' structure suggests two, sanctification and divine inspiration. Bownas does describe conviction as part of sanctification, and recommends watchfulness and preparation in his advice to young ministers. He clearly understands sanctification to be the culminating experience of grace, in which one has been purged through conviction of sin, although it requires watchfulness. Despite this confusing use of terms, Damiano's work on eighteenth-century Friends suggests continued growth, and that sanctification is one process requiring watchfulness.

Damiano does not mention justification, and this may reflect her sources. Yet work by Job Scott, a late eighteenth-century New England Friend, whom she cites, suggests that justification was incorporated into sanctification, as has been argued in this thesis. He says, in *Salvation By Christ In Three Essays*, 2d ed., Manchester: Irwin, 1876, 'Christ is our complete justification... We are complete in him, and in him alone, without addition... But we are never really complete in him any otherwise than as we are really in him, as the branch is in, belongs to, and is of the vine... He never repeals a jot or tittle of the moral law to any, further than it is fulfilled in them' (p. 9).

Damiano also describes the climax of conviction as making a 'commitment to sin no more' (p. 143), and although it is unclear if she intends to emphasize human agency rather than perfection as a gift, there may be a similar lack of clarity among eighteenth-century Friends. Where the first generation often experienced a sudden, overwhelming gift of sanctification, the second and later generations may be likely to stress human responsibility. Yet many of Damiano's quoted sources write as if they have received a gift (pp. 141-48), and there is probably a range of experience, with some second-generation Quakers continuing to share that of early Friends.

263. Bewley, *Christian Experiences*, an elder among Friends in Dublin, is particularly eloquent.

264. Gwyn, *Seekers*, pp. 335-72 and Gwyn, D., *Four Models of Truth: A Developmental Model for Religious Community*, unpublished manuscript. Gwyn argues that early Friends simultaneously used correspondence and three other approaches to truth in a four-part hermeneutic. The other three approaches are coherence, in which truths are validated through their place in a holistic framework; operationalism, which emphasizes the proper method of discernment; and pragmatism, which stresses the desired result. In *Seekers*, p. 337, he suggests that as the Quaker movement matured, coherence of Quaker doctrine was emphasized, although all four operate in any generation. This model is not inconsistent with the conclusions of this thesis, although Gwyn presents a hermeneutic that describes how Friends actually arrived at truth, rather than asking where theological authority lies. Friends do use other approaches in articulating the truth, as has been argued, even in the first generation. They inherited a Puritan framework, which was developed into a particularly Quaker tradition through their reading of Scripture and other writings. This process included a concern for coherence, pragmatics and, particularly as the movement developed, the correct method of discernment, or operationalism. Yet, ideally, correspondence remained the authority against which these were tested.

265. It may be that the early Friends' understanding included revelation of knowledge about the material world. Graves, *Rhetoric*, p. 309, argues that Fox, and perhaps most early Friends, saw revelation as the source of all authentic knowledge, whether spiritual or material. This is reflected in claims to an opening of creation and sensory language, but it is difficult to know whether this is what Friends mean when they describe the opening. It seems that theologically, the importance of this claim would be the rejection of all natural knowledge and dependence on God rather than human constructs. Graves says that later Friends, notably Penn and Barclay, began to emphasize the role of reason in knowledge of the 'non-spiritual realm'.

Most Friends in the first decade of the movement rejected unredeemed reason. Jones says that Fox would not allow that reason was useful as a check, but that redeemed reason is of practical use in apologetics. Thus, although reason had less of a role than Scripture, Scripture and immediate revelation were expected to concur, and redeemed reason was held to have a place in apologetics. Jones, *George Fox's Teaching on Redemption*, p. 68. This may be an overstatement, and Fox and others do regularly employ reason. The issue was rejection of the arrogance of human constructions, not reason in itself, but some Friends may not have understood this distinction. Rhetorical condemnation aimed at a worldly use of reason may be taken by some as a condemnation of *all* reason.

266. Creasey, 'Early Quaker Christology', p. 113.

267. Jones, *George Fox's Teaching on Redemption*, p. 58. Thus, knowledge was primarily subjective, not objective. While there are descriptions of explicit revelatory experiences within early Quakerism, including voices, dreams and visions, these are not usually given more weight than the more common discernment tool of feeling the Life or peace in a situation. Furthermore, the 'content' of visions is generally highly metaphorical. There are some who receive very specific instructions, such as Coxere, whom God instructs to cut away a sail to save his ship as it founders, but this is rare (*Adventures*, p. 95).

268. For instance, Story, *Life*, argues that those who are regenerated will be in unity, but this unity is authenticated by correspondence with his own experience; see p. 31, above.

Damiano, 'On Earth as in Heaven', pp. 120-26, concurs. She argues that eighteenth-century Friends were wary of reason, and that knowing involved a dissolution of the differentiation between the human as subject and God as object. In this perspective, she argues that knowing *about* God is replaced by knowing and loving God, though she presents little evidence from Quaker sources. She says, 'practice is the key to interpretation and means of verification', suggesting that knowledge develops through the practice of waiting in the Light, and the truth is therefore known through correspondence between the experience of waiting and the Life, or light, that is sensed within a particular leading. Yet, significantly, her discussion emphasizes extraordinary messages from dreams and similar objective knowledge, though supernaturally known. She gives examples such as a Friend's 'knowledge' that a woman travelling in the ministry abroad was only ill, not dead, despite reports to the contrary.

269. The structures were not imposed without controversy, though this is only occasionally reflected in the narratives. Some accounts do mention these tensions, but as published writers are typically on the 'winning' side, they do not question the imposition of structures.

270. Leachman, 'Unruly Sect', pp. 19-22. Trowel, *George Keith*, says that Barclay and Keith clearly distinguished reason and the inward light, and argued that the Light is revealed to a 'new organ', or Seed, which is implanted in humanity, rather than to natural reason. He suggests that this was one issue in a separation among Friends led by Keith in the 1690s. Trowell argues that, in contrast, Penn and Whitehead understood revelation to be the illumination of reason. Despite his rejection of reason as the organ that receives revelation, Barclay's methodology suggests a role for reason, while maintaining the distinction between natural knowledge and redeemed reason.

It is likely that while some Friends understood the light to work through the illumination of reason, this was not the only, or even the primary, definition of the Light, which continued to be understood as an inward revelation of Christ. George Whitehead, despite the suggestion that

he concurred with Penn, gives a typical convincement account stressing the supporting Presence of God. He summarizes, 'remembering the Lord our Gracious God in his ways, and merciful dealings with me from my youth; how He found among his lost and strayed sheep, on the barren mountains of fruitless professions, and how He drew me to an inward experience of his Power and sanctifying work in my heart, and to know his teaching and spiritual ministry; thereby to enable me by degrees, experimentally to minister to others, and oblige me to live accordingly'. George Whitehead, *Memoirs*, p. 1.

271. See p. 43, above.

272. Jones argues that Fox believed that natural reason not even useful as a check, but that redeemed reason is of practical use in apologetics. He says, 'Reason remains secondary to the light which reveals truth to it. Yet when man has been reborn through the Spirit, reason plays a major role both in his knowledge of truth and his obedience in it'. *George Fox's Teaching on Redemption*, p. 56.

273. Barclay, *Apology*, p. 47 (Proposition 2:11). Graves, *Robert Barclay*, p. 21-22, notes the language of perception in Barclay's formulation of the nature of the seed, which suggests emerging scientific epistemology, although Barclay resists Locke's understanding of the mind as a *tabula rasa*, onto which objective perceptions are written. Rather, Barclay believed all ideas were divinely implanted, whether natural or supernatural, and the supernatural ideas were 'stirred up' by motions of the Spirit, just as natural ideas were 'stirred up' by observation of the natural world.

274. Leachman, 'Unruly Sect', pp. 43-45, argues that there was also an increased emphasis on Scripture as an authority. The narratives suggest that both generations drew heavily on Scripture, but in differing ways. Second-generation Friends were more likely to use Scripture in apologetics and formulate proofs using Scripture, but the first generation has an embodied, typological understanding of Scripture unfolding inwardly in their experience.

275. See Marietta, *Reformation*, for more on this period. For instance, superficial comparison of Bownas' *Life* and his *Qualifications* suggest that the journal provides examples of experiences that support the argument of the discursive text.

276. For example, in Pentecostalism, Land's work on Pentecostal spirituality and the importance of religious feeling and Parker's work on Pentecostal decision-making both suggest parallels with this study. Land, S.J., *Pentecostal Spirituality: A Passion for the Kingdom*, Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1993, and Parker, *Led by the Spirit*.

277. Bauman, *Let Your Words be Few*; and Graves, *Rhetoric*.

278. For instance, Graves, *Rhetoric*, simply records whether sanctification is mentioned in a sermon, and does not give detail on how it was understood. Sample size presents a problem with this approach, in that few sermons survived from the first two decades, and in the latter period almost half are by one person, Stephen Crisp, and several more are by William Penn.

279. See, for instance, Creasey, 'Early Quaker Christology'; Nesti, 'Grace and Faith'; and Nuttall, *Holy Spirit*.

280. Lengthy titles of many of the primary sources have been abbreviated.

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY²⁸⁰

- B., S. (Blanford, Susannah), *An Account Given Forth by One That Hath Been A Traveller*. No publisher, 1698. Reprinted in Garman *et al.* (eds.), *Hidden in Plain Sight*, pp. 285-302.
- Barclay, Robert, *Apology for the True Christian Divinity*, Glasgow: Dunn & Wright, 1886.
- Barcroft, John, *A Brief Narrative of the Life, Convincement, Conversion and Labours of Love in the Gospel-Ministry of that Worthy servant of Jesus Christ, John Barcroft*, Dublin: Fuller, 1730.

- Bauman, Richard, *Let Your Words Be Few: Symbolism of Speaking and Silence Among 17th Century Quakers*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983. Reprint, London: Quaker Home Service, 1998.
- Bewley, George, *A Narrative of the Christian Experiences of George Bewley*, Dublin: Jackson, 1815.
- Blaugdone, Barbara, *An Account of the Travels, Sufferings and Persecutions of Barbara Blaugdone*, Shoreditch: T.S., 1691. Reprinted in Garman et al. (eds.), *Hidden in Plain Sight*, pp. 274-284.
- Bownas, Samuel, *An Account of the Life, Travels, and Christian Experiences In the Work of the Ministry of Samuel Bownas*, London: Phillips, 1795.
- *Qualifications of the Gospel Minister*, London: Hinde, 1750. Reprint, Philadelphia: Pendle Hill and Tract Association of Friends, 1989.
- Braithwaite, William C., *The Beginnings of Quakerism*, London: Macmillan, 1912.
- *The Second Period of Quakerism*, London: Macmillan, 1919.
- Brinton, Howard, *Quaker Journals*, Wallingford, PA: Pendle Hill, 1972.
- Brockbank, Elisabeth, *Richard Hubberthorne of Yealand: Yeoman, Soldier, Quaker*, London: Friends Book Centre, 1929.
- Brook, Uriah, *A Short Account of the Inward Exercises and Christian Experience of Uriah Brook*, Gloucester: Bellows, 1868.
- Burnyeat, John. *Journal of the Life and Gospel Labours of John Burnyeat*, A Select Series, Biographical, Narrative, Epistolary, and Miscellaneous, Vol. 6, ed. Barclay, J., London: Darton, 1839.
- *Some Account of the Gospel Labours of Jonathan Burnyeat*, London: William & Frederick Cash, 1857.
- Burrough, Edward, 'A True Declaration, and A Discovery to All the World of my Manner of Life', in his *A Warning to the Inhabitants of Underbarrow*, London: Calvert, 1654, pp. 31-35.
- Caton, William, *Journal of the Life of that Faithful Servant and Minister of the Gospel William Caton*, A Select Series, Biographical, Narrative, Epistolary, and Miscellaneous, Vol. 6, ed. Barclay, J., London: Darton, 1839.
- Chalkley, Thomas, *A Journal or, Historical Account of the Life, Travels and Christian Experiences of that Ancient, Faithful Servant of Jesus Christ Thomas Chalkley*, 2d ed., London: Hinde, 1751.
- Claridge, Richard, *Mercy Covering the Judgment Seat and Life and Light Triumphant Over Death and Darkness*, London: Hinde, 1757.
- Coxere, Edward, *Adventures by Sea*, ed. Myerstein, E.H.W., Oxford: Clarendon, 1945.
- Creasey, Maurice, 'Inward' and 'Outward': A Study in Early Quaker Language, Supplement to the Journal of the Friends Historical Society 30. London: Friends Historical Society, 1962.
- 'Early Quaker Christology', PhD diss., University of Leeds, 1956. Reprint, Catholic and Quaker Studies 2, Manasquan, NJ, 1973.
- Crisp, Samuel, *Two Letters Writ by Samuel Crisp About the Year 1702 to Some of His Acquaintance, Upon His Change From a Chaplain of the Church of England to Join with the People Called Quakers*, 8th ed. London: Hinde, n.d.
- Croker, John, *Brief Memoir of the Life of John Croker*, 2d ed., London: Harvey & Darton, 1840.

- Crook (Crooke), John, [Untitled Letter.], in Isaac Penington, *To all Such as Complain That They Want Power*, London: Wilson, 1661, pp. 23–26.
- *A Short History of the Life of John Crook*, Hereford: Jones, n.d.
- Damiano, Kathryn A., ‘On Earth As it is in Heaven: Eighteenth Century Quakerism as Realized Eschatology’, PhD diss., Cincinnati: Union of Experimenting Colleges and Universities, 1988.
- Davis, John, *Some Account of the Wonderful Operations of Divine Love and Mercy as Exemplified in the Life and Experience of John Davis*, Manchester: Harrison, 1842.
- Dewsbury, William, *The Discovery of the Great Enmity of the Serpent against the Seed of Woman*, London: Calvert, 1665.
- Dickinson, James, *A Journal of the Life, Travels and Labour of Love in the Ministry of that Worthy Elder and Faithful Servant of Jesus Christ, James Dickinson*, London: Hinde, 1745.
- Dobbs, Jack P., ‘Authority and the Early Quakers’, PhD diss., Oxford University, 1995.
- Ellwood, Thomas, *The History of Thomas Ellwood*, Morley’s Universal Library, London: Routledge, 1885.
- Fell, Margaret, *A Relation of Margaret Fell*, n.p., 1690. Reprinted in Garman *et al.* (eds.), *Hidden in Plain Sight*, pp. 234–54.
- Fothergill, John, *An Account of the Life and Travels In the Work of the Ministry of John Fothergill*, London: Hinde, 1753.
- Fox, George, *Journal of George Fox*, ed. Nickalls, J., London: Religious Society of Friends, 1975.
- Garman, Mary, *et al.* (eds.), *Hidden in Plain Sight: Quaker Women’s Writings, 1650–1700*, Wallingford, PA: Pendle Hill, 1996.
- Gill, Catie, ‘Women in the Quaker Community: A Literary Study of Seventeenth-Century Political Identities’, PhD diss., Loughborough University, 2000.
- Gotherson, Dorothea (Scott), ‘To All That Are Unregenerated, A Call to Repentance’, 1661. Reprinted in Scull, Edward, *Dorothea Scott, otherwise Gotherson and Hogben of Egerton House, Kent*, Oxford: Parker, 1883.
- Graves, Michael P., ‘Robert Barclay and the Rhetoric of the Inward Light’, *Quaker Religious Thought* 26 (1993), pp. 17–32.
- ‘The Rhetoric of the Inward Light: An Examination of Extant Sermons Delivered by Early Quakers’, PhD diss., University of Southern California, 1972.
- Gwyn, Douglas, *Four Models of Truth: A Developmental Model For Religious Community*, Unpublished Manuscript.
- *Seekers Found: Atonement in Early Quaker Experience*, Wallingford, PA: Pendle Hill, 2000.
- *Covenant Crucified: Quakers and the Rise of Capitalism*, Wallingford, PA: Pendle Hill, 1995.
- *Apocalypse of the Word: The Life and Message of George Fox*, Richmond, IN: Friends United Press, 1984.
- Hall, David, *Some Brief Memoirs of the Life of David Hall*, London: Hinde, 1758.
- Hayes, Alice, *A Legacy or Widow’s Mite; Left by Alice Hayes to Her Children and Others*, 2d ed., London: Hinde, 1749.
- Holme, Benjamin, *A Collection of the Epistles and Works of Benjamin Holme*, London: Hinde, 1753.
- Howgill, Francis, *The Inheritance of Jacob Discovered*, London: Calvert, 1656.

- Hubberthorn, Richard, 'A True Testimony of Obedience to the Heavenly Call', in *A Collection of the Several Books and Writings of that Faithful Servant of God Richard Hubberthorn*, London: William Warwick, 1663, pp. 1-6.
- Jones, T. Canby, 'George Fox's Teaching on Redemption and Salvation', PhD diss., Yale University, 1955.
- King, Rachel Hadley, *George Fox and the Light Within*, Philadelphia: Friends Book Store, 1940.
- Knox, Ronald A., *Enthusiasm*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1950. Reprint, London: Collins, 1987.
- Kuenning, Larry, 'Miserable Comforters: Their Effect on Early Quaker Thought and Experience', *Quaker Religious Thought* 25 (1991), pp. 45-60.
- Lampe, Henry, *Autobiography of Henry Lampe, M.D.*, London: Headly Brothers, 1895.
- Land, Stephan J., *Pentecostal Spirituality: A Passion for the Kingdom*, Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1993.
- Leachman, Caroline, 'From an "Unruly Sect" to a Society of "Strict Unity": The Development of Quakerism in England c. 1650-1689', PhD diss., University College London, 1997.
- Lilburne, John, *The Resurrection of John Lilburne, now a prisoner in Dover Castle*, London: Calvert, 1656.
- Marietta, Jack D., *The Reformation of American Quakerism 1748-1783*, Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1984.
- Moore, Rosemary, 'The Faith of the First Quakers: The Beginning of Their Beliefs and Practices Up to the Reformation', PhD diss., University of Birmingham, 1993.
- 'Authority Among Early Friends', in *Authority and Tradition, Proceedings of the Quaker Theology Seminar 1996/7*, ed. Rex Ambler, Birmingham: Woodbrooke College, 1997.
- Naylor, James (Nayler), *What the Possession of the Living Faith Is*, n.p., 1676.
- Nesti, Donald S., 'Grace and Faith: The Means to Salvation', PhD diss., Gregorian University, Rome, 1975. Reprint, *Catholic and Quaker Studies* 3, Manasquan, NJ, 1975.
- Nuttall, Geoffrey, 'Reflections on William Penn's Preface to George Fox's *Journal*', *Journal of the Friends Historical Society* 57 (1995), pp. 113-17.
- *The Holy Spirit in Puritan Faith and Experience*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1946.
- Palmer, Vail T., Jr. 'Early Friends and the Bible: Some Observations', *Quaker Religious Thought* 26 (1993), pp. 41-55.
- Parker, Stephen E., *Led by the Spirit: Toward a Practical Theology of Pentecostal Discernment and Decision Making*, Journal of Pentecostal Theology Supplement Series 7, Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1996.
- Penington, Isaac, 'A Brief Account of My Soul's Travel Toward the Holy Land', in *Works*, Vol. 2, 2d ed., London: Clark, 1761, pp. 49-53.
- 'A Treatise Concerning God's Teachings, and Christ's Law', in *Works*, Vol. 2, 2d ed., London: Clark, 1761, pp. 503-31.
- *Experiences in the Life of Mary Penington (Written by Herself)*, ed. Penney, N., Philadelphia: Biddle Press, 1911. Reprint, London: Friends Historical Society, 1992.

- Penn, William, 'No Cross, No Crown, A Discourse Shewing the Nature and Discipline of the Holy Cross of Christ', in *Works*, Vol. 2, 3d ed., London: Phillips, 1782, pp. 5-358.
- Pike, Joseph. *Some Account of the Life of Joseph Pike*, A Select Series, Biographical, Narrative, Epistolary, and Miscellaneous, Vol. 5, ed. Barclay, J., London: Darton & Harvey, 1837.
- Punshon, John, *Reasons for Hope: The Faith and Future of the Friends Church*, Richmond, IN: Friends United Press, 2001.
- Richardson, John, *An Account of the Life of that Ancient Servant of Jesus Christ, John Richardson*, 5th ed., London: Edward March, 1843.
- Scott, Job, *Salvation by Christ in Three Essays*, 2d ed., Manchester: Irwin, 1876.
- Simmons, Martha (Simmonds), *A Lamentation for the Lost Sheep of Israel*, London: Calvert, 1655.
- Smith, Edward, *William Dewsbury: One of the Valiant Sixty Quakers*, York: Sessions, 1997.
- Story, Thomas, *The Life of Thomas Story*, abridged Kendall, J., ed. Alexander, W., York: Alexander & Co., 1832.
- Stout, William, *Autobiography of William Stout of Lancaster*, ed. J. Harland. London: Simpkin & Marshall, 1851.
- Tarter, Michele Lise, 'Sites of Performance: Theorizing the History of Sexuality in the Lives and Writing of Quaker Women 1650-1800', PhD diss., University of Colorado at Boulder, 1993.
- Trowell, Stephen, 'George Keith: Post-Restoration Quaker Theology and the Experience of Defeat', *Bulletin of the John Rylands University Library of Manchester* 76 (Spring 1994), pp. 121-37.
- Vann, Richard T., *The Social Development of English Quakerism, 1655-1755*, Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1969.
- Vokins, Joan, *God's Mighty Power Magnified*. London: Northcott, 1691. Reprinted in Garman *et al.* (eds.), *Hidden in Plain Sight*, pp. 255-73.
- Watkins, Owen, *The Puritan Experience*, London: Routledge, 1972.
- Whitehead, George, *Memoirs of George Whitehead*, ed. Tuke, S., York: Alexander & Son, 1830.
- Wilcox, Catherine Mary, 'The Theology of Early Friends and its Implications for the Ministry of Women in Seventeenth Century Quakerism', PhD diss., Kings College, 1991.
- Wilson, Thomas, *A Journal of the Life, Travels, and Labours of Love in the Work of the Ministry, of that Eminent and Faithful Servant of Jesus Christ, Thomas Wilson*, London: Sowle, 1730. Reprinted in *Journals of the Life, Travels, and Gospel Labours of Thomas Wilson and James Dickinson*, London: Gilpin, 1847.

AUTHOR DETAILS

Nikki Coffey Tousley is a doctoral candidate in Theology at the University of Dayton. She received a M. Divinity degree in 2001 from Duke University and a MPhil in Quaker Studies from the University of Birmingham. Her current academic focus is the application of contemporary narrative and virtue ethics to the Quaker tradition, particularly the role of worship in Quaker discernment and

the witness of eighteenth-century American Friends. This article is her unrevised MPhil thesis. The research was undertaken in the Woodbrooke library, particularly the Bevan Naish collection.

Mailing address: 175 Indian Avenue, Dayton, Ohio 45410, USA. Email: touslenc@notes.udayton.edu.