

BOOK REVIEWS

DYCK, N. (ed.), *Exploring Regimes of Discipline: The Dynamics of Restraint* (New York: Berghahn, 2008), pp. vi + 160. ISBN: 978-1-84545-401-2, Hardback, £22.50.

This book is the eighth volume in the series jointly produced by Berghahn and the European Association of Social Anthropologists and its main interest for readers of *Quaker Studies* is the inclusion of a chapter by Peter Collins on the discipline of British Quaker ritual, and the Quaker relationship to its own books of discipline (or discipleship).

Dyck's starting point for the volume is the current reclamation of discipline from a definition based on external restraint towards, or inclusive of, new regimes of self-restraint designed to enhance the 'voluntary realms of leisure and self-development' (p. 1). Discipline is about reproducing preferred forms of conduct, Dyck suggests, either the means or the ends. Academically, much of the recent scholarship has built on Foucault's treatment of discipline as a type of power or a technology of power. However, Dyck argues that an anthropological approach based in ethnography rather than textual analysis reveals a more complex phenomenon. In this way, this volume expands the literature on discipline. It does so as well by interrogating Bourdieu's notion of *habitus*, used by many sociologists and anthropologists, including in earlier work by Collins, to explain the normative responses to innovative social settings engendered by 'thick' socialization. However, recent work has questioned the source of the creation and transmission of habitus and its deterministic nature. Equally, how does habitus have 'agency' in social settings and what happens to human agency? The invocation and negotiation of forms of discipline observed by anthropologists are deemed invisible by an over-reliance on the notion of habitus.

Rather, this volume constitutes regimes of discipline which actors choose between and which in and of themselves constitute relationships. The application of power to effect discipline becomes variable within the variety of social settings. Actors may reject discipline or modify it, not simply act under coercion. Discipline seeks reliability and reproductability but its operation and outcomes are far more various. Discipline often employs its own rhetoric but the resources available to support that rhetoric vary or may be received variously. Thus, mission, rhetoric, and resource-base all become critical elements of the investigation of discipline.

Collins's chapter, in spite of his earlier reliance on habitus to help explain Quaker responses in everyday life, fits clearly into this reading of discipline. Collins takes the

books of discipline as the locus of mission, rhetoric, and resource-base in the negotiation of discipline between centrally agreed text and local practice. It is of course a dialectical relationship because, as Kathleen Thomas and I have shown,¹ the book of discipline is subject to repeated revision based initially in its negotiated reception within the group. As soon as it is published, it is out of date, a book belonging to the group that was then but is no longer now. Limited involvement in its creation and the Liberal Quaker theological emphasis on the continuing search immediately diminishes the power of the rhetoric to exactly or reliably reproduce preferred forms of conduct within the whole population. Rather Collins refers to it in terms of a potentiality. The real discipline of the group as we can observe it resides in its everyday practice, its negotiation of self-restraint with the prescriptions and preferences of the text. He writes 'Discipline is doing "the right thing"; "the right thing" is a never-ending process of negotiation informed by an apparent and contested, though always and already available, moral-aesthetic code' (p. 151).

In this way, the British Quaker setting provides a particularly good case study for a permissive voluntary association. Much has changed from the more tightly enforced discipline of eighteenth-century Quakerism which whilst still a voluntary association, subjected itself more readily to self-restraint and external discipline of the Meeting over the individual.

This is a thought-provoking volume and the other chapters are of interest too, once discipline takes over from Quakerism as the main source of interest. Peter Collins's scholarship is continually pushing against itself, constantly reconceptualising Quaker life: his work has always been worth a careful reading and the chapter here is no different.

'Ben' Pink Dandelion
Centre for Postgraduate Quaker Studies
University of Birmingham, England

BECK, W., and BALL, T.F., *The London Friends' Meetings showing the Rise of the Society of Friends in London; its progress and the Development of its Discipline, with Accounts of the Various Meeting-Houses and Burial-Grounds* (London: Bowyer Kitto, 1869; Facsimile reprint by London: Pronoun Press, 2009), pp. xxxvi + 461. ISBN: 978-0-9556183-4-5, Hardback, £36.00; Paperback, £24.00.

Quakers, like the faithful of other traditions, are often ambivalent about the buildings in which they meet to worship. On the one hand, praying and seeking do not have to be enclosed by walls. On the other, the enclosure may be particularly conducive to these activities and may be designed and adapted to make it the more so. Moreover,

1. Thomas, K., 'The Quaker Book of Discipline: A Sacred Text by Committee?', in J. Davies and I. Wollaston (eds.), *The Sociology of Sacred Texts*, Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1993; Dandelion, P., *A Sociological Analysis of the Theology of Quakes: The Silent Revolution*, Lampeter: Edwin Mellen Press, 1996.

there is a sense in which a place is hallowed by prayer and witness and draws to itself those who come, as Eliot puts it, where prayer has been valid.

In the twentieth century, books about meeting houses tended to address a single dimension of this interest. Hubert Lidbetter's *The Friends Meeting Houses* (1961) and David Butler's formidable *The Quaker Meeting Houses of Britain* (1999) observed and illustrated aspects of architecture and interior design in microscopic detail. In sampling the testimony of *Our Quaker Heritage* Kenneth Southall (1974) adjusted the focus to the charming and picturesque and contributed an affectionate regard of the plain and simple for the subsequent generation of coffee-table manuals.

As Beck and Ball's catchy title suggests, it is a Victorian publication now reprinted with illustrations both contemporary and more recent, and an introduction by Simon Dixon and Peter Daniels. There are numerous illustrations both from contemporary and from more recent sources: they are included strictly for the record and not for such a celebration of reprographics that we admire the image and neglect the witness of its subject. It is to that extent a worthy companion to the volumes mentioned above. But it is a weighty tome and one is bound to wonder whether the paperback edition will survive much of the use likely to be made of it.

Beck and Ball acknowledge that their principal source of three hundred or so volumes of minutes had 'more to do with Christian practice than abstract doctrine' and that their account conveys 'more of care over the things of outward and daily life than of spiritual questions'. There is indeed little that is 'abstract' but there is much that is doctrinal and spiritual, not least in the numerous instances of conscientious adherence to principles and in the suffering of aggressive responses to them. Centuries later it is less a wonder to us that scruples were observed than that they were so violently opposed.

Those who are already familiar with Beck and Ball as a classic in Quaker history will welcome in this volume the introductory essay by Simon Dixon and Peter Daniels. It celebrates the original text as a pioneering work, appearing at a time when the collection of Quaker minutes and records had not worked its way into thematic or interpretive history. There are glosses on the Beck and Ball text and many pointers to contextual and subsequent literature. The essay is densely referenced, most helpfully by footnotes but sometimes by detailed references within the text that interrupt a fluent reading. The essay is a superb starting point for students who are looking for a research theme in Quaker studies, for there are numerous suggestions of projects waiting to be conducted, together with sources by which to get started. And while Beck and Ball document the outward effects of one London Meeting at a time, Dixon and Daniels indicate some of the currents and themes of their collective witness.

A typical sample of the data collected in 1869 might include the scale and location of hired premises, of leases and the price of rent, the acquisition of land, the costs of building materials, the construction of a purpose-built meeting house, the subsequent adaptation of the gallery, destruction by fire, minutes on reparations, the holders of the key, the precise boundaries of the Monthly Meeting and so on. There is a point after which one ceases to read such an account for fun and is inclined to reserve it as a reference text, noting that it comes with a thorough index. However, there is

rather more here than dimensions, fabrics and costs. Among the sufferings of Quaker worthies, there is an account of the violent invasion and distraint of the home of John Elson who refused to swear an oath. The very alteration of galleries and rearrangement of benches is not about furniture but—as we read between the lines—about the relative roles of men and women in the Meeting and the sequence in which they minister.

After historical preambles on the time of Cromwell, penal laws and the origin of the discipline, successive chapters are devoted to the Two-weeks Meeting, the Six-weeks Meeting and the Monthly Meeting of Gracechurch Street, Devonshire House, Peel, Southwark, Westminster, Ratcliff, Barking, Longford, Tottenham, Hendon and Kingston. Finally, there are well-documented accounts of women's Meetings, schools and burial grounds and, as though for refreshment, a late chapter treats in a more poetic style of the annual outing to Jordans.

So what is presented as an architectural or physical record deserves a place in the social and behavioural history of Friends. Its glimpses are intimate. The authors decline to 'canonise' early Friends but their historical account is related with due honour.

Roger Homan
University of Brighton, England

WARNER, L.C., *Saving Women: Retrieving Evangelistic Theology and Practice* (Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2007), pp. xiii + 301. ISBN: 978-1-932792-26-3, Hardback, £29.99.

Lacey Warner's book stems from her work teaching at Duke Divinity School on 'Women and Evangelism' between 2001 and 2004. There are seven biographical case studies here of Protestant women evangelising in the United States between 1800 and 1950. Selection criteria appear to be somewhat vague; the intention was to take into account some 'theological and racial diversity' among women in the Wesleyan and Arminian tradition. Above all they were women whom Warner sees as embodying 'a constructive practical theology of evangelism' (p. 12).

From a Quaker perspective, the case studies of particular interest are those of Dorothy Ripley (1767–1831), and Sarah Moore Grimké (1792–1873) and her sister, Angelina Emily Grimké (1805–1879). All three were best known for their anti-slavery work. Ripley, born in Whitby, the daughter of a Wesleyan Methodist preacher, was drawn to Quakers, but was apparently rejected by Whitby Quaker Meeting, and thereafter affiliated herself to no denomination on her extensive travels to the United States. The Grimké sisters also came to their abolitionist position from quite unusual origins, being born into an Episcopalian, slave-holding family in South Carolina. Sarah first came into contact with Quakers when she accompanied her father to Philadelphia for medical treatment. She became a member of Philadelphia Meeting in 1823. Angelina too became interested in Quakerism, when visiting her sister in 1827. But when both became increasingly involved in evangelical abolitionist activity, they moved away from Philadelphia, and Sarah eventually left the Society.

The studies are based predominantly on quite limited printed primary source research, but there is a full and helpful bibliography which highlights a range of useful autobiographical writings, letters and essays (for example, Sarah Grimké's manuscript diary for 1827). Warner makes an important point about the need to look at the whole of women's lived experience and witness, and not simply to focus on preaching and verbal evangelism.

The methodology used is an interpretivist one, seeking to produce conclusions that can be fed back into church policy today. Thus the 'saving women' of the title refers both to the task of recovering a largely ignored tradition of women's evangelism but also acknowledging the still active potential of this. In short, the subjects are seen to offer 'significant models...for a contemporary church' (p. 5).

Given this objective, it would not be reasonable to expect an entirely systematic historical analysis. There is, for example, very little discussion of the Great Separation, in spite of the fact that the Grimké sisters were in the eye of this particular storm; it is concluded that Quakers and Methodists held 'strong and similar positions' on slavery simply by reference to short quotations from George Fox, Anthony Benezet and John Wesley; and there seems to be little understanding of the difference between those ordained in Protestant denominations and Quaker ministers. Attempts to ensure a comprehensive scholarly base is largely dependent on excessively long footnotes, which generally take up a considerable portion of each page, consequently undermining the coherence of the narratives. Nevertheless, for those engaged in historical research, this work represents an interesting addition to the historiography of Quaker women, and is useful too to those interested in early nineteenth-century transatlantic Quakerism.

Edwina Newman
Centre for Postgraduate Quaker Studies, Woodbrooke
Birmingham, England

BERGLAND, R., *Maria Mitchell and the Sexing of Science: An Astronomer among the American Romantics* (Boston: Beacon Press, 2008), pp. xviii + 300. ISBN: 978-0-8070-2142-2, Cloth, \$29.95.

Maria Mitchell (1818–89) was a celebrated American astronomer, discoverer of Mitchell's Comet, librarian of the Nantucket Athenaeum, 'computer of Venus' for the Nautical Almanac and Professor of Astronomy at the newly founded Vassar College from 1865 to 1888. Bergland writes an eloquent and engrossing account of her life, linking it particularly with the progress, or otherwise, of women's education and their chances of professional success in the sciences, through the nineteenth century and beyond. Other subjects that are touched on include the abolitionist movement, the Transcendental movement and the position of women more generally. Maria Mitchell made one extensive visit to Europe, and we learn of her encounters with scientists like William Whewell and Mary Somerville. Quaker Studies scholars will be interested to know of Mitchell's origins among the Quakers

of Nantucket. She was disowned in 1843 on her acknowledgment that 'her mind was not settled on religious subjects' (p. 33), and from then on she worshipped with the Unitarians. She never, however, abandoned her Quaker style of dress or the use of 'thee' and 'thou' in intimate speech. We learn a little, mostly negative, about the Quakerism of Nantucket: about how the community was torn by the factionalism then afflicting American Quakers, about the narrowness of their 'discipline' and the hypocrisy of supposed advocates of non-violence who grew rich on the proceeds of the whaling industry. The author's main interests, however, lie elsewhere.

Her thesis is the surprising one that the climate of opinion in America in the first half of the nineteenth century was more favourable to the success of women scientists than in the second half and indeed in the succeeding years up to our own. Mitchell's appointment as computer of Venus in 1849 was indeed offered to her in rather condescending terms. 'As it is "Venus who brings everything that's fair" joked the Director, "I therefore assign you the ephemeris of Venus, you being my only *fair* assistant"' (p. xii). Nevertheless she did not, it seems, at this point consider her sex to be a drawback. It had not been an obstacle to her receiving in 1847 the gold medal for astronomical discovery from the Danish government for the discovery of 'her' comet. Bergland tells us that 'the public was at least as excited by the fact that an American had discovered a comet as by the fact that a woman had done so' (p. 57). Indeed, science in general and astronomy in particular were considered as especially suitable for women since they did not require knowledge of the 'learned languages'—not generally accessible to women—and they might be useful in inculcating feelings of reverence for the natural order and its Great Artificer, with its divinely appointed hierarchical structure, including, of course, the subordination of women to men.

So it was that the young Maria Mitchell was able to follow her astronomical bent without hindrance. Her father was an ardent amateur astronomer, and Maria learned her trade by sweeping the sky with his telescope under his supervision. The great family heroes were the astronomer William Herschel and his sister and helper Caroline. Caroline Herschel made several significant discoveries in her own right, but Mitchell was well aware of her (contentedly) subordinate relationship to her brother. She wrote in her posthumously published *Reminiscences*:

If you had asked Caroline Herschel after ten years of labor what good had come of it, she probably would have answered, with the extreme simplicity of her nature, that she had relieved her brother of a good deal of wearisome labor, and perhaps kept up his vigor and prolonged his life. Probably it never occurred to her to be other than the patient and self-sacrificing assistant to a truly great man (p. 112).

By the time she wrote this, however, Mitchell had moved beyond the Caroline Herschel position. When she was first offered the appointment at Vassar College at an annual salary of \$1500 she allowed her inbred humility to get the better of her. Producing what Bergland calls a 'smoking gun in the history of women in higher education', she declared, 'I do not believe I am worth it!' (pp. 183-84). Vassar accordingly reduced the offer to \$800, including board, a room for her father, and a camp-bed in the observatory! (Male professors earned \$2000.) Mitchell endured this

without protest, but she came increasingly to regret her self-depreciation and to campaign for the rights of women, especially in higher education. It was necessary. 1873 saw the publication of Edward Hale's *Sex in Education*, which argued that study could adversely affect women's reproductive organs. Mitchell joined in alliance with Julia Ward Howe (author of *The Battle-Hymn of the Republic*) to combat such views in a series of essays and lectures, but had little immediate success. Even her most brilliant students found prejudice obstructing their way to continuing with astronomical studies, and those who did find jobs in the field were given subordinate positions. At the Harvard Observatory, Mitchell complained, women work 'in the half-lighted and wholly unventilated offices', where they 'pile up the logarithmic figures', while 'in the open air, under the blue sky or the starlit canopy, boys and men make the measurements... There seems to have been a backward movement' (p. 230).

In her epilogue Bergland brings evidence to bear that things have not got much better: old prejudices are replaced by new, and women have to contend with the constantly changing tactics of a hostile male-dominated establishment. While the episodes and encounters that she relates are telling, I believe she overstates her case. The generally accepted view that women have made great strides in higher education and in the sciences is not wholly mistaken. It is nevertheless salutary to have these perhaps too easy assumptions questioned. In any case, her account of the difficulties faced by intellectually inclined women, as exemplified by Mitchell, over the course of the nineteenth century is both fascinating and shocking. I rather wish that she had made some comparisons with what was happening in Britain. Rita McWilliam-Tullberg's *Women at Cambridge* (London, 1975), with its often hilarious, often appalling account of the prejudice that kept women technically outside the University until 1947, would make an instructive comparison, as would the fortunes of Girton College, Cambridge (opened in 1869) with those of Vassar (1865).

In my opinion Bergland sacrifices too much for the sake of accessibility. Her style is sometimes repetitive, sometimes exclamatory. We do not need to know that when people visited the Nantucket Athenaeum Mitchell 'would flash an electric smile of welcome' (p. 41). The pages on common beliefs about comets over the years are fascinating: I should have enjoyed reading more on these lines, and more in general about the science. What is an equatorially mounted telescope?—I had to look it up in *Wikipedia*. We learn of the birth of astrophysics but nothing about its nature. Some lack of care in the spelling of names is evident: it is Benjamin Peirce, not Pierce, Asa Gray, not Grey, Gillian Beer, not Beers. And Benjamin Franklin was no Quaker! Despite these quibbles, this book remains compelling as well as provocative, and it is very informative.

Joanna Dales
Centre for Postgraduate Quaker Studies
University of Birmingham, England

GRAVES, M.P., *Preaching the Inward Light* (Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2009), pp. xi + 462. ISBN: 978-1-60258-240-8, Hardback, \$49.95.

Early quaker language took mystical, apocalyptic, theophanous and military forms. With these four dramatic elements a linguistic style developed that was often turgid and repetitive but capable, too, of descriptive beauty, poetic fluidity and remarkable incisiveness. And all this at a time when controversy, fanaticism and open denunciation of one's opponents, often combined with bitter invective, were normal features of a polemical and highly verbal cultural milieu. Like all religious language, it contained metaphor, allegory and symbolism, and could be spontaneous and informal.

While this is certainly true of the 1650s, Michael Graves's work on early Quaker impromptu speaking, *Preaching the Inward Light*, draws our attention to extant sermons delivered in the post-Restoration era, concentrating on their 'intellectual, theoretical, pedagogical and methodological framework' (p. 12). His book comprises four sections preceded by an introductory description and apology for the work. Sections I and II address the cultural constraints on, and the presuppositions of, early Quaker preaching together with the development of Quaker impromptu style. Here Graves centres on Robert Barclay and Samuel Bownas. Section III examines 79 sermons, their thematic characteristics, key metaphors and other salient features during the period 1671–1700, while Section IV takes a closer look at four sermons from the same period delivered by George Fox, Stephen Crisp—who both bridge the artificial 1660 divide—as well as Barclay and William Penn. To the book's 12 chapters are added an epilogue (summary and implications of the book), five appendices, comprehensive notes and three good indexes (early works, names and subject).

The introduction clearly sets out *Preaching's* goals and its limitations such as the small number of sermon texts available to scholars. Still, this paucity fails to deter the author's wish to 'elucidate...the practice of self-consciously inspired impromptu speech, through an examination of the documents' (p. 7). In Chapter 1, Graves places Quaker style within the context of the importance given, since the mid-sixteenth century, to the study of rhetoric and homiletics and *their* ideological background. Chapter 2 reconstructs the Quakers' worldview and the presuppositions underlying their rhetorical style. In the next chapter, Graves discusses the sermons of such Friends as Margaret Fell, George Whitehead, Rebecca Smith and Charles Marshall, the latter regarded by the author as 'extremely conservative' since he reduced 'the preacher to a passive, inwardly turned, essentially weak vessel prior to and after delivery of the message' (p. 102). Barclay's *Apology* occupies centre stage in Chapter 4, in particular his understanding of immediate revelation and inspired speech, while Chapter 5 is given over to the later eighteenth-century 'flowering of Quaker homiletic theory' in which Samuel Bownas saw 'sanctification as a process rather than an instantaneous gift' (p. 133). Bownas's work, which amounted to 'the first practical manual for Quaker preachers' (p. 150), was critical of the method of Peter Ramus, the sixteenth-century Protestant rhetorician and martyr, in which sermon topics were divided and subdivided (p. 136). Bownas's encouragement of a self-effacing, message-centred delivery in contrast to the Puritan content-centred sermon was the

outcome but it was also, according to Graves, consistent with Marshall's conservative approach.

Graves launches next into an examination of 79 surviving sermons analyzing them for their theology, spiritual guidance and views on society at large. Five key clusters of metaphors are then isolated in Chapter 7—(i) light/dark, (ii) guiding voice, (iii) seed, (iv) hunger/thirst and (v) journey/pilgrimage. In each case, says Graves, 'the quantitative significance of the metaphor is estimated, and its functional role...illustrated and analyzed' (p. 27). Chapter 8 lends itself to identifying four 'salient characteristics' of the sermons—their 'catechital' style, use of spatial terms, appeal to guilt and use of personal testimony, and consequently draws upon the work of Jackson Cope, Maurice Creasey and Hugh Barbour respectively.

In Chapter 9 we are introduced to Fox's sermon before the 1674 Yearly Meeting in which Fox had the delicate task of encouraging a re-organization of the movement in the light of the continuing persecutions and the role of women. Both were controversial and Fox's legitimacy was at stake. The sermon needed to be genuinely impromptu while at the same time authoritative. Graves put Fox's rhetorical choices successfully under the microscope. Stephen Crisp's 1687 sermon before a typical London Friends' gathering is dissected in Chapter 10 for its verbal response to his claim that he was speaking 'in the Light' as an 'oracle of God' (p. 28). Chapter 11 highlights the only surviving sermon of Barclay which helps us 'see in action Barclay's own application of the approach he advocated which was to 'preach Christ, and direct people to his pure light in the heart' (p.121). William Penn's sermons have received little attention so far and so, in his concluding main chapter, Graves reviews Penn's eulogy for Rebecca Travers, a Public Friend, and the struggle Penn had in coming 'to grips with the vicissitudes of his own life through reflection' on hers (p. 29).

Preaching's well-ordered text, written in clear, accessible language, tackles a complex topic admirably. It contains shrewd insights such as criticism of Bownas's insistence that preachers should enter the meeting house as 'blank pages' and disregard all prior learning, and that the Quakers' attempt to argue for a religion based on experience rather than tradition may be more in line in with postmodern thinking. Graves's work reminds us that Quaker homiletics and discourse were elemental of a holistic orthopraxis and that their sermons made God suddenly real and near. Often theologically conservative, they also bore a resemblance to revivalist messages (p. 312).

Graves's fine composition is in many ways a significant improvement upon Cope and Bauman, the other two main commentators on early Quaker linguistic style. *Preaching* will be especially attractive to students of linguistics and rhetorical studies, English and communication, Quaker studies, and indeed anyone wishing to dig deeper into the fascinating world of the early Quakers.

Gerard Guiton
Melbourne, Australia

SELL, A.P.F. (series editor), *Protestant Nonconformist Texts* (4 vols.; Aldershot: Ashgate, 2007), pp. xiii + 421; xvii + 459; xix + 400; xv + 416. ISBN: 0-7456-3864-2, 0-7546-3853-7, 0-7546-3850-2, 0-7546-4013-2, Hardback, £75 per volume.

These four substantial volumes present texts from the history and thought of Protestant Nonconformity in England and Wales from the days of the sixteenth-century Separatists to the end of the twentieth century. Each volume has been edited by a team of three editors drawn from different church traditions, thus ensuring a broad selection of material.

The first volume, 1550–1700, edited by R. Tudur Jones, Arthur Long and Quaker Studies scholar Rosemary Moore, takes an inclusivist position, including texts from the Elizabethan ‘Separatists’, ‘although their contemporaries would not have called them “Nonconformists”, as well as those in the period before 1662 considered by our contemporary historians to be the precursors of modern Nonconformist denominations’ (p. 1). Through the texts, some of which are excerpted and some of which are printed in their entirety, the reader is led through the history of Nonconformity in its early stages, up to the ‘age of toleration’. Quaker texts are well represented. Many of these are available, of course, through Early English Books Online (and in some cases Google Books), but the breadth of the collection allows the reader to see them in their wider theological context, allowing for the exploration of similarities and differences with writings from other contemporary religious movements.

Similarly the volume on the eighteenth century explores the ways in which ‘Old Dissent—the Congregationalists, Baptists, Presbyterians and Quakers—had to face challenges from Enlightenment thought on the one hand and Evangelical Revival enthusiasm on the other’ (p. i), exploring issues of philosophy, Christian doctrine, sacraments, evangelicalism and mission, and the relationship between church and state. Quaker texts of this period have received much less scholarly attention than have those of the seventeenth century and I valued the chance to discover many texts new to me and, as with volume I, the chance to see, for example, accounts of Quaker sufferings alongside similar persecutions suffered by Methodists, to see Quaker pronouncements on social and political issues alongside those from the other churches, and, in particular, to explore spiritual writings by Quakers Anne Gwin, John Fry, Anne Moore and Anne Crowley within the wider context of eighteenth-century spiritual reading.

Quakers are somewhat less well represented in the nineteenth-century volume and, in my view, seriously under-represented in the twentieth century volume, in which we find only a handful of Quaker texts—one on science and Christian belief, one on the First World War, one on sex and one on baptism, eucharist and ministry. This presumably reflects the knowledge and experience of David M. Thompson, J.H.Y. Briggs and John Munsey Turner, the editors of that final volume, rather than any lack of appropriate material. It makes that final volume of considerably less usefulness to Quaker Studies scholars than the first three, although it nonetheless would provide useful comparative material for historical or theological study.

The textual editing in all four volumes is of a very high standard. Each volume has a substantial introduction and the second, third and fourth volumes also provide introductions to each of the topic sections. Each text has its own introductory headnote, providing contextual information and suggestions for further reading and research.

This wide-ranging collection would be an asset to any university or college library, and would be a good 'jumping-off' point for students of history, theology and literature as well as a useful resource for experienced scholars.

Betty Hagglund
Centre for Postgraduate Quaker Studies
University of Birmingham, England

ABBOTT, M.P., *To be Broken and Tender: A Quaker Theology for Today* (USA: Western Friend, 2010), pp. vii + 242. ISBN: 9780970041043, Paperback, \$20/£13.86.

Following Chuck Fager's *Without Apology* and Patricia Williams's *Quakerism: A Theology for our Time*, Margery Post Abbott's *To Be Broken and Tender* represents the third recent attempt to systematise Liberal Quaker theology. Each of these books is of course inherently challenged by the diversity of Quakerism, and also by its egalitarian nature. Who is now to say what a Liberal Quaker theology might (or certainly should) consist of? Indeed, the very diversity of approaches these books take is testimony to the individuation of this branch of Quakerism. Ultimately, it cannot hope to be definitive, as its subtitle suggests, and as scholars, we need to be wary of generalising from its particulars. Abbott's book is nevertheless compelling in its interweaving of traditional Quaker theology and personal narrative. It is, typically for her, very well written, and is primarily a devotional book for Quakers whilst also serving as a good source of data for academics studying contemporary Liberal Quaker theology. Liberal Quaker theology of any sort is particularly rare and this deserves our scholarly attention.

'Ben' Pink Dandelion
Centre for Postgraduate Quaker Studies
University of Birmingham, England

KENNEDY, T.C., *A History of Southland College: The Society of Friends and Black Education in Arkansas* (Fayetteville: University of Arkansas Press, 2009), pp. xii + 349. ISBN-10: 1-55728-916-6; ISBN-13: 978-1-55728-916-2, Cloth, \$45.00

The story begins in 1864 as Alida and Calvin Clark arrived in Helena, Arkansas, in the Mississippi delta. They were Quaker abolitionists sent by Indiana Yearly Meeting to take charge of desperately poor 'colored orphan children' among the thousands of escaped slaves gathering under the 'protection' of the Union army. The Clarks stayed

to found a school that became Southland College, the first institution of higher education for Blacks west of the Mississippi, and Southland Meeting, the first predominately Black Monthly Meeting in North America.

Alida Clark was the driving force behind these two institutions. She operated the school, organized religious and temperance activities, and continually solicited money to keep them going. Unlike most other idealistic Quakers who went south to help freedmen, Alida's goal was to bring her students and their families into the Religious Society of Friends. She encouraged revivals similar to those occurring among mid-west Gurneyite Friends, while continually stressing the 'solid, reverential deportment' of Southland's Blacks (p. 55). Under her prodding, Southland became a Particular Meeting of Whitewater Monthly Meeting (Indiana YM) in 1870, then a Monthly Meeting in its own right. Daniel Drew was the first among several recorded ministers of African descent. Alida penned a steady stream of articles to the Quaker press, reports to various Friends' bodies, and voluminous correspondence with themes boasting of the promising results at the school, in temperance work, and of meeting growth, begging for funds, and chastising Quaker racism.

After the Clark's resignation in 1886 there were seven changes of administration in the next seventeen years. During this time Alida's dream of Southland providing freedmen the means to achieve political, social, and religious equality shifted to helping its students adjust to a permanent subordinate position. Booker T. Washington's Tuskegee model had captivated northern Quakers.

In 1903 Harry and Anna Wolford arrived and for the next fourteen years moved Southland in new directions. While still evangelical, Harry was more generically Protestant, and Southland Meeting withered. He was able to cultivate the local white business community for the first time, while maintaining the trust and praise of the Black community. He accommodated to the realities of inadequate YM funding, Arkansas' white power structure, and also the needs of the poor Blacks—their irregular attendance and sometime inability to pay. He also bought and sold real estate and made loans to local Negroes. Under Wolford Southland became a regional teacher-training academy, and for the local population a primary school with as many students as possible under their conditions of extreme poverty.

In 1919 Indiana YM, chronically short of funds, turned Southland over to the Home Missionary Board of the Five Years Meeting. It hoped to have all thirteen Yearly Meetings contribute financially. It didn't happen. But the HMB, unfamiliar with southern conditions in general and Southland in particular, tried to micromanage its new young appointee, Raymond Jenkins. Their vision called for the school to work on the 'Negro problem'—the definition of which was apparently unnecessary. The new vision involved raising the standards to match northern schools (resulting in an immediate high failure rate) and a shift to manual training in the hopes of creating a Hampton or Tuskegee of the west. A strict code of conduct was enforced, including no blues music. Students left in droves, northern white teachers were hired to implement the new curriculum, and debts mounted rapidly. The more desperate the finances, the more grandiose the plans seemed to become. Wolford's efforts to undermine the new administration did not help. The school closed in 1925 at the end of its 61st year.

Southland's story illustrates the pervasive negative impact on the local Black community of white racism, of both southern and northern varieties. Kennedy takes us from the heady, hopeful days of the early Reconstruction through its abandonment by the North, the downward spiral into sharecropping, white violence, and Jim Crow laws. Forces beyond its control—floods, droughts, pestilence—combined with human disasters, including economic dependence on a single crop, periodic collapse of cotton prices, and vigilantism. The deck was impossibly stacked. We get only glimpses—the documentation does not exist for more—of what Southland meant to those of African descent. The education of their children offered hope that they, at least, might escape.

It remains a bittersweet tale about well-meaning white northern Quakers. Within these parameters it is an excellent study of a visionary institution. The book is valuable not only as a window on changing white attitudes and efforts over those sixty years, but also as a mirror to any charitable effort undertaken by one group on behalf of another. Difficulties include micromanagement from a distant home office, chronically inadequate funding, and the inability or unwillingness to consult the recipients. The second half of Southland's story is caught up in the quite unself-conscious paternalism and assumption of superior knowledge that was a hallmark of late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century Progressivism. Author Thomas Kennedy concludes that Southland College should be remembered for the 'long, selfless service' to 'a small body of truly needy human beings and for the generous spirit that impelled that service' (p. 267).

The book is the result of meticulous research. It has excellent end notes, a full bibliography, index, and 25 black and white illustrations, mostly old photographs. Many small typos, the result of copy-editing by computer without re-reading the result, do not detract from this excellent study.

Martha Paxson Grundy
Cleveland Heights, Ohio, USA

BRUYNEEL, S., *Margaret Fell and the End of Time: The Theology of the Mother of Quakerism* (Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2010), pp. 215. ISBN: 978-1-60258-062-6, Hardback, \$39.95.

From the time she was 'convinced' when George Fox visited her home in June 1952, Margaret Fell was indispensable to the success of the nascent Quaker movement, organising, fund-raising, and when necessary disciplining. After the early success of the Quaker mission led to the move of its administration to London, she became one of its most important communicators with English governments, both republican and monarchical, and was probably the prime mover in the development of women's Meetings, though the definitive account of this process has yet to be written. A study of her thinking was overdue, for, like many Quakers, she was a competent amateur theologian. Her published output was small compared with that

of the leading male Quakers, but the recent production of a scholarly edition of her numerous letters means that her written work can now be viewed as a whole.²

Sally Bruyneel has produced a creditable study of her theology, placing it firmly in the sixteenth- and seventeenth-century setting of the Radical Reformation as it developed in England, and showing how it related to her activities as a Quaker leader. After an introduction, the first chapter is a useful overview of Fell's life and work, most of which is already familiar to Quaker historians. Bruyneel is surely right to emphasise the importance of Thomas Fell, both in Margaret's pre-Quaker development and as a supportive power in the background after her convincement. It should be noted (p. 49) that the shift of the Quaker organisation to London in fact began in 1657–68, not the late 1660s, though the turmoil of the Restoration years delayed its implementation.

Chapter 2 is an excellent description of the religious background in which Quakerism developed, rightly emphasising the importance of a distinctly English apocalyptic. Bruyneel takes this by way of Foxe's 'Book of Martyrs' through the radical reformers up to the New Model Army and the Levellers, Fifth Monarchy Men and Diggers, all important as immediate precursors or contemporaries of the Quakers, and all believing that they were living in the End Times and part of a divine purpose. Bruyneel then summarises early Quaker apocalyptic, distinctive in that it held to a strongly realised eschatology. Quakers believed that the End Times were already beginning, and that the final battle between Michael and the Devil was already taking place, though a spiritual rather than a physical conflict.

Chapter 3, 'The Kingdom of Light: Margaret Fell's Theology and Eschatology', is the nub of the book, and looks at Fell's writings as set against standard Christian theology. What is unfortunately lacking is any attempt to compare Fell's thought with that of other contemporary Quaker writers, for an interesting fact would have emerged. Bruyneel shows that Fell's theology is 'surprisingly orthodox given the strong opposition which Friends' theology elicited among the church leaders and divines of the day' (p. 77). Fell's theology as described here is in fact more orthodox than that of the majority of Quaker publications of this time. Most early Quaker writings have little to say about Jesus and the conventional understanding of the cross and the atonement, for they concentrate on the saving power of the Light, often without even modifying the phrase to 'Light of Christ'. Bruyneel, however, found Fell making a number of references to the saving work of Jesus, and expressing herself in a way at least more or less compatible with the standard doctrine of the Trinity. This is not to say that Quakers in general did not hold these beliefs, but most Quaker writings were a response to attacks from more conventional churchmen, and therefore emphasise their differences rather than their similarities.

Chapter 4 discusses Fell's interest in the move of Cromwell's government to mend relations with the Jews, and gives the background to what was happening in the general Protestant eschatological assumption of the time, that the Jews must be converted before the purposes of God could be completed. Fell was the only Quaker

2. Glines, E. F., *Undaunted Zeal: The Letters of Margaret Fell*, Richmond, IN: Friends United Press, 2003.

writer who seems to have had a particular interest in this, and Bruyneel notes the skilled use of the Old Testament in her arguments.

The final chapter considers Fell's faith in relation to her influence on the early formulations of the Quaker Peace Testimony and on the development of a formal place for women within what was now recognisably the Religious Society of Friends, though that term was not yet in use. A discussion of *Women's Speaking Justified* is set within a description of the changing place of women in Renaissance times. Both themes are related to Fell's eschatology, which emphasised that the Spirit had indeed been poured out on all flesh (Acts 2:17, ref. Joel 2:28), and that therefore, both the use of weapons and gender differences were out of place within the spiritual community.

Faults mainly concern presentation rather than substance. The book would have benefited from more pro-active editing to moderate some purplish prose passages (e.g. the opening sentence) and to correct occasional errors such as 'palette' for 'palate' (also in the opening sentence). There is no list of Fell's publications. Most of the references in the text are to the '*Works*', which may be conventional, but is not helpful, for readers need a quick check on the date and origin of quotations. Moreover, given that seventeenth-century books can now be called up at the touch of a mouse on the Early English Books website, first editions of pamphlets may well be more accessible than collected editions.

But these are relatively minor matters. Bruyneel has discovered Margaret Fell's distinctive voice, which probably originated in her personal religious development before ever she met George Fox. This book is a valuable addition to current studies of early Quakerism.

Rosemary Moore
Centre for Postgraduate Quaker Studies
Birmingham, England

ENTWISLE, H., *Rockpools and Sunshine: The Biography of Dorothea Sharp* (York: Sessions, 2008), pp. 116. ISBN: 978-1-85072-378-3, Paperback, £19.99.

Dorothea Sharp (1873–1955) was born in the Baptist manse at Dartford, her father being the pastor and her mother a member of the Sturge dynasty. To this Quaker lineage the author attributes her reported generosity and philanthropy: the anti-slavery crusader Joseph Sturge was the younger brother of her maternal great grandfather and the author gives him extended attention for his witness, the remoteness of his association notwithstanding. However, there are some very unquakerly touches in the appreciation of her life, such as a deference for worldly honours and quotations of the worldly value of paintings as a measure of their worth.

The book is offered as a biography but it is rather more by its digressions. First, it is an appreciation of Dorothea Sharp's virtuosity as a painter, both in the text and in the annotations of illustrated works. Second, it is a gallery which offers images of the works of this prolific artist on nearly every page. The archetypal Dorothea Sharp

painting shows children playing in the sun, evidently on holiday. The pictures are full of light and movement. If the seaside is not the setting, joie de vivre is nevertheless the theme.

Much is made of Dorothea Sharp as a woman artist. She connected with children in her paintings but had no children of her own. We may prefer to speculate on the Quaker influence as we regard the book as an exhibition of her work. There is, for example, in mood, theme and composition a compelling likeness to some of the work of a contemporary of Dorothea Sharp, Joseph Edward Southall (1861–1944): he too visited the world of sandcastles, toy boats and boys with the balloons. He worked in tempera, she in oils, both thereby defying current gender stereotypes. The more significant contrast, however, is that ‘she had no wish to moralise in her paintings’ (p. 38): indeed she sought the very locations where social issues were least in evidence and the popularity of her work in the inter-war period is attributed the capacity of her subject matter to deflect viewers from harsh reality (p. 71) and by 1939 the art societies were encouraging colourful and uplifting pictures (p. 87). Dorothea Sharp came into her own: in other words, her art is commended as the opiate of the people. If the family connection with Joseph Sturge is worth documenting within this biography, one might expect some social engagement and not merely a claim to fame. So we are left to interpret her choice of theme not as the affirmation of innocence and purity in the human condition but as the medium of light and colour.

One senses the absence of an editor. The cover bears one title and the title page another. Copyright details are to be found six pages in but the publisher remains anonymous. Numerical references listed at the end fall a long way short of being adequate: for example, a page reference to Gombrich’s *Story of Art* is of little help unless we know which of his many editions since 1950 the author is using and ‘Obituary in the Dartford newspaper 1901’ is even more bewildering. By a closer adherence to conventions the author might have ensured that her subject be taken more seriously.

Roger Homan
University of Brighton, England