

Book Reviews

Anne M. Blankenship, *Christianity, Social Justice, and the Japanese American Incarceration during World War II* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 2016), pp. xiv + 282. ISBN 9781469629209. Paperback, \$29.95.

President Franklin D. Roosevelt's February 1942 Executive Order 9066 effectively ordered the removal of Japanese Americans, about 120,000 in number, from large parts of the American West Coast states and commanded them to be incarcerated in interior locations in order to provide 'every possible protection against espionage and against sabotage'. It remained in effect until December 1944. About one-quarter of the Japanese Americans (often called 'Nikkei') incarcerated under this executive order were Christian; another one-third were Buddhist; many claimed no religious affiliation. Anne Blankenship's book examines the responses of certain mainline Protestant, Catholic and Quaker churches and para-church organisations to the crises engendered by this massive incarceration of Japanese Americans.

A large amount of her book is devoted to the American Friends Service Committee (AFSC). While there has been previous examination of the AFSC's work in this regard, Blankenship's thorough comparison-and-contrast with the actions of other church organisations is new. In this contrast, the American Friends Service Committee comes out well. While persons associated with all of the church organisations eventually came around to serious critique of Japanese American incarceration, Quakers associated with AFSC were vigorous in their opposition from the beginning, in communication both with government officials and with the public through letters to newspaper editors and speeches.

Equally important, however, is her description of the different kinds of social work undertaken by different religious groups:

Quakers [sought] immediate change for individual Nikkei and [worked] through legal channels for justice. Mainline Protestants [focused] on religious worship in the camps and public relations. Roman Catholics met religious needs and resettled their parishioners as quickly as possible. (p. 57)

Both mainline Protestants and Catholics were thus interested in providing appropriate worship experiences for the incarcerated Nikkei. AFSC Quakers had no interest in this liturgical dimension of ecclesiastical labours.

One provision of the regulations allowed the predominantly Buddhist or non-Christian Nikkei young adults to be released from the camps to attend colleges and universities in the East and Midwest. Quakers coordinated this massive effort through the National Japanese American Student Relocation Council (NJASRC, established May 1942) at the request of the head of the War Relocation Authority. AFSC Executive Secretary Clarence Pickett carefully embedded acceptance of this responsibility in a letter protesting the policy of incarcerating Nikkei. Other churches took care primarily of their own members in this regard. Nevertheless, the NJASRC, under the leadership of AFSC, took a non-sectarian approach to their labours and looked after everyone who wanted to attend college. Ultimately, through these cooperative endeavours, more than four thousand students were resettled, between them attending more than six hundred different colleges.

By late 1942 and early 1943 religious leaders in the mainline Protestant and Catholic communities wanted to influence the American people to oppose Japanese incarceration, although strong grassroots support for the incarceration made these same leaders wonder if they would be 'arousing the country unnecessarily' (p. 80). The AFSC, the Fellowship of Reconciliation and other groups hired released incarcerated for national speaking tours. Undoubtedly, such moves began to turn public opinion against the incarceration. Friends were leery of appearing too secular in their labours and public discourse. According to the AFSC's Raymond Booth, Friends were to remember that their main task was 'interpreting the way of Christ in mundane affairs', and if this was overlooked he feared that the AFSC would become 'simply another social work organization' (p. 96).

After Executive Order 9066 was rescinded, AFSC workers became immersed in helping Nikkei to resettle and in working to restore their civil rights. Some might have wanted the AFSC to coordinate resettlement efforts, but Clarence Pickett did not believe that the AFSC would be capable of coordinating such a large effort. Instead, they adhered to a supportive role.

Many outstanding Quaker leaders appear in this narrative. Herbert Nicholson, Esther Rhoads and Gurney and Elizabeth Binford, long-time Quaker missionaries to Japan who were not welcome in wartime Japan, played a large role in these efforts. Blankenship emphasises the Seattle area in her account of Nikkei incarceration, and in this respect Floyd Schmoe (1895–2001), a University of Washington professor who took leave from his forestry programme to work full time on supporting Japanese Americans, and his Japanese–American son-in-law, convinced Friend Gordon Hirabayashi, loom large in Blankenship's narrative. Hirabayashi refused to leave his home to be relocated at an interior camp. He was arrested and sentenced to a 90-day prison term, and his challenge to Executive

Order 9066 went all the way to the US Supreme Court before the Justices found against his claim unanimously.

While this book draws useful comparisons and contrasts between a variety of Quakerism highly influenced by modernist thought and several other Christian churches and institutions, Blankenship misses the complexity of Quakerism in the Pacific Northwest by focusing solely on the work of the AFSC. Scholars Ralph Beebe and Tim Burdick provide useful context for the evangelical strand of Quakerism, which had more numerous adherents in that region than did the modernism of the AFSC.¹ In brief, Oregon Yearly Meeting (OYM) Friends produced a substantial number of conscientious objectors during World War II (but still a minority of draft-age men, like other yearly meetings). OYM condemned the lack of legal due process accorded to the incarcerated Nikkei, expressing in 1943 the hope that Quakers would assist 'our own Japanese fellow citizens who are suffering such hardships and are in such need of Christian sympathy and help'.² And yet its relationships with the AFSC were quite strained, as Burdick makes clear. OYM may qualify more as a grassroots institution (in Blankenship's categories) than a broader denominational agency, but to ascertain, for instance, if it was closer to the outlook of the mainline Protestant churches than that of the modernist AFSC in its attitudes toward Nikkei incarcerated would be a quite useful task for someone to undertake. At any rate, this kind of nuance about differences internal to Quakerism are lacking in Blankenship's text.

Still, in an age when racial prejudice is again present in profoundly disturbing ways, starting with, but not limited to, the attempted ban directed at travellers from certain Muslim nations early in President Trump's administration, the sustained consideration of at least some varieties of highly principled Quaker response to racially prejudicial actions of (in Blankenship's case) a popular third-term American president is extraordinarily useful and thought-provoking. Accordingly, I highly recommend this book. It is clear, on the whole its judgments seem wise and profound, and its subject matter is quite relevant to current events.

Stephen W. Angell
Earlham School of Religion, USA

1 Ralph Beebe, *A Garden of the Lord: a history of Oregon Yearly Meeting of Friends Church* (Newberg, OR: Barclay Press, 1968); Tim Burdick, 'Neo-Evangelical Identity within American Religious Society of Friends (Quakers): Oregon Yearly Meeting, 1919-1947' (PhD Thesis, University of Birmingham, 2013).

2 Beebe, *A Garden of the Lord*, p. 77.

John S. Long and Jennifer S. H. Brown (eds), *Together We Survive. Ethnographic Intuitions, Friendships, and Conversations* (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queens's University Press, 2016), pp. 307. ISBN 9780773546110. Paperback, £28.99.

Together We Survive is the most recent addition to the McGill-Queens Native and Northern Series and as such is a collection of ethnographic accounts of northern peoples living within the borders of Canada, some of which deal with specialist anthropological themes, while others are more accessible to the general reader. The book is really a *festschrift* for the Canadian anthropologist, Quaker and foremost ethnographer of the Cree people Richard Joseph Preston, and comprises an Introduction and ten further essays (mostly provided by Preston's students and colleagues), organised into four parts: 1. Making a Living, Changing Community; 2. Images, Textures, Dreams, and Identity; 3. Songs and Narratives; and 4. Indigenous Rights, Compassion and Peace. There is also a select, though extensive, list of Preston's writings. The chapters are, without exception, well written and scholarly and of particular interest to those researching northern peoples.

Probably of most interest to readers of *Quaker Studies* are the Introduction written by John S. Long with Richard Preston and the final chapter, which comprises a conversation between Preston and Richard T. McCutcheon ('Are you Crying Because the Way is Hard? Linking Cree and Quaker Concerns in Dick's Life Journey'), as well as the chapter by Jennifer Preston ('A Roadmap for Reconciliation and Justice: The United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples'). This latter essay, written by the youngest child of Richard and Sarah Preston, provides an insight into the activism that has clearly long been a significant part of the Preston family's engagement with the rights of Indigenous peoples. Jennifer Preston, as the programme coordinator for Indigenous rights with the Canadian Friends Service Committee, has been a major figure in pressing for the universal adoption of the *United Nations Declaration of the Rights of Indigenous Peoples*. Her essay provides an excellent introduction to the generation and development of the *Declaration*, especially regarding its adoption and implementation in Canada. Preston notes with regret that the positive early work undertaken by Canada was greatly undermined after 2006 by the Conservative government of Stephen Harper, which tended towards the diminishment and outright denial of Indigenous rights. However, she goes on to say that in recent years the Canadian Supreme Court has strongly supported the claims of Indigenous peoples, pressing successive governments to uphold the tenets included in the *Declaration*.

Jennifer Preston begins her chapter with reference to her childhood experiences at Waskaganish. The arrival of her father, Richard ('Dick') Preston, into the field and his subsequent progress as an ethnographer of the Cree is carefully documented in the introductory chapter. He arrived in the Cree community at Waskaganish, Quebec, in 1963, at a time of rapid social and economic change. He

did the things that anthropologists do when they begin ethnographic research—he attempted and eventually achieved a measure of rapport with local people, he collected narratives, observed rituals and ceremonies, and made notes on kin ties and friendships, on patterns of production and consumption and particularly on the important and complex relationships between people and animals. He wrote up these notes in the doctoral thesis that remains a significant document within both Cree and academic communities. There is, after all, great value in recording ways of life that might otherwise have been lost and forgotten. It is clear from the accounts of local people that Dick Preston soon developed a warm and empathetic relationship with his hosts, sustaining friendships that in some cases have lasted for over half a century.

One's appreciation of Dick Preston is considerably deepened on reading his interview with Richard T. McCutcheon. Preston is sensitive, insightful and articulate in his consideration of the significance of Quakerism in his life and work. The fact that Preston served as a US marine during the Korean War adds a certain acuity to his appreciation of Quaker testimonies. The conversation is wide-ranging and embraces issues relating to peace (and violence), humanism, laughter, community, family, friendship, speaking in meeting, activism and the importance of stories and mythologies. Indeed, he is as aware, as are most anthropologists, of the importance of mythologies across cultures. Preston notes that even though they are mostly hidden, Western cultures retain their need for mythologising. He believes that the dominant 'good triumphs over evil' myth is alive and well (and living in the Star Wars films, for example). He suggests, however, that this has not been a beneficial mythology and has been contributing to a project seeking to develop 'a mythology of peace'—a project that might interest and engage some of the readers of this journal.

There are very few examples of anthropologists reflecting in print on the relationship between their academic work and their faith and practice. Despite the undoubted piquancy of the discipline of anthropology, one cannot merely assume that such reflections will inevitably be inspiring, moving or even interesting. Dick Preston's musings on what he describes as the symbiosis between his Cree and Quaker experiences do, however, tick all of these boxes and are well worth perusal.

Peter Collins
Durham University, England

Gary Scott Smith, *Religion in the Oval Office: the religious lives of American presidents* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2015), pp. ix + 647. ISBN 9780199391394. Hardback, £23.49.

It is notoriously difficult to evaluate the personal religious convictions of anyone, but the difficulty is compounded when it comes to public political figures who have to run for office periodically. Such people have to appeal to a diverse electorate with religious persuasions running the gambit from deeply devout to highly knowledgeable to none at all, and they have to do so in a way convincing enough to win an election. Issues matter, of course, but candidates speak of them in ways that reflect who they are, what they value and how these values are grounded in one's view of the world, which usually relates to one's religious faith.

Gary S. Smith, chairman of the history department at Grove City College, in Grove City, Pennsylvania, has thus undertaken a valuable service in turning out two volumes on the 'religious lives' of selected American presidents. *Faith and the Presidency: From George Washington to George W. Bush* was his first well-reviewed effort, covering the most famous occupants of the Oval Office—men such as Washington, Thomas Jefferson, Abraham Lincoln, Woodrow Wilson, Franklin Roosevelt and John Kennedy. The addition before us picks up interesting, if clearly second-tier, presidents, ranging from John Adams to Barack Obama, the latter still a US Senator in 2006, when the first book appeared. They tend to be less important as presidents, though interesting in religious terms. But let's celebrate Smith's achievement in presenting readers with two important volumes on a difficult topic.

Smith's research is exemplary and extensive, a model of his thoroughness in both primary and secondary sources. The book's 171 pages of endnotes represent 40 per cent of the volume's length. The chapter on second president John Adams boasts 394 notes. It is hard to believe that Smith missed very much as he trekked around the country mining the available resources for his final product. What Smith has produced is an excellent and very readable two-volume reference work that will be consulted often, but shortcomings remain.

Smith has left readers to guess about his own religious presuppositions, something likely to be a major problem as he evaluates the men he looks at and their religious convictions. Given that the institution at which he teaches was founded by Presbyterians and its public face remains extremely conservative, both economically and politically, it seems likely that he is wont to accept with few questions what his subjects say about their religious commitments. That he might hold traditional religiously conservative beliefs is hinted at by his capitalisation of pronouns for God and Christ and his use of 'He' for either. At another point he notes that, despite Richard Nixon's comment that his predecessor Dwight Eisenhower had a 'deep faith who believed in God and trusted in His will', he failed in his 1969 eulogy to put the general in heaven (p. 271).

Smith's reluctance to take a stand on what one of his subjects believes comes early. He reports well and accurately on what presidents believed, but he fails

to come down firmly when what one says may contradict or qualify another comment. On page 29 he tells us that Adams 'did not view Americans as God's chosen people', but that he maintained that America was exceptional because it had the 'God-assigned mission' to further liberty with the best opportunity since Adam and Eve transgressed to achieve it. This reader wants to know in what ways Smith believes a God-assigned mission is not practically the same as God choosing people for a special role. Smith seldom sees such problems, suggesting that, while his reporting is superb, his evaluative analysis is less so.

The same judgment emerges from a glance at Smith's nearly four-page treatment of Nixon's White House Sunday services. He gives a balanced summary of the reasons the Quaker president instituted these weekly observances and the accolades and criticism levelled at them at the time. But Smith fails to answer the rhetorical questions he asks—boiled down, fundamentally, to whether they were a crass political enterprise or a chance for political leaders to worship the 'Judge of us all' (p. 276). He is content to summarise that none of the 'sermon[s] directly challenged Nixon to change any policy or right any wrong' (p. 277)—on its surface more of a criticism of the preachers invited than the president's decision to sponsor them. And, strangely, Smith never pauses to ask how the services comported with the Quaker faith Nixon assiduously adhered to.

Smith's restriction of himself to description shows up in his chapter—the shortest one in the book—on the first Quaker president, Herbert Hoover. Though widely and still called a 'conservative', this careful Friend championed a theory he labelled 'American Individualism' in a 1922 book; 40 years later a historian tinged with Marxism, William Appleman Williams, convincingly argued it was central to the Quaker's faith and political approach. Smith rightly mentions this 'cooperative individualism', but fails to use the concept as a way to integrate and explain Hoover's career cogently. Another lapse.

The most striking example of these lacunae is Smith's decision to skip the moral and religious question of Harry Truman's 1945 decision to drop the atomic bomb on two Japanese cities. After explaining that the president's Baptist faith 'strongly affected his foreign policy' (p. 248), he fails even to mention the atomic bomb in his text while asserting in note 206: 'Surprisingly, Truman made few references to his faith in discussing his decision to use the atomic bomb in Japan and therefore, it is not analyzed as one of the issues illustrating how his faith affected his policies' (p. 518). Analysis of even those few references to one of the most significant ethical issues of the twentieth century surely requires more attention than an endnote buried among others.

Smith's excellent reference volume thus will find an ample and immediate audience among students and scholars, even interested browsers, but his labours fail to offer his readers the kind of analytical insights that the scholarship displayed here might lead them to want or expect.

H. Larry Ingle
University of Tennessee, Chattanooga, USA

Barbara K. Wittman, *Thomas and Charity Rotch: the Quaker experience of settlement in Ohio in the early republic, 1800–1824* (Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2015), pp. ix + 292. ISBN 9781443878272. Hardback, \$81.95.

As all historians are aware, our understanding of the past is inevitably shaped by the accidents of survival and preservation of documentary sources. The Pastons, for example, were not extraordinary in their own right in fifteenth-century England, but the survival of an almost unique cache of letters has immortalised them. Similarly, the Charles Colcock Jones family of Liberty County, Georgia, was known to only a handful of scholars before Robert Manson Myers turned their massive archive into the Civil War epic, *The Children of Pride*, in 1972.

Those with an interest in the early history of Quakerism in the Ohio Valley (admittedly a small group) have long been aware of the large collection of papers of Thomas and Charity (Rodman) Rotch at the Massillon, Ohio, Public Library. A few scholars have made use of them, but the collection cried out for book-length exploration. Now Barbara K. Wittman has supplied it, in a revision of her PhD dissertation undertaken at the University of Akron.

Thomas Rotch (1767–1823) came from one of the first families of New England Quakerism. His father, William Rotch, Jr (1734–1828), was a shipper with far-flung interests—the tea dumped overboard in the Boston Tea Party in 1773 was taken from two of his ships. In 1790 Thomas Rotch married Charity Rodman (1766–1824), the daughter of an equally prominent Quaker merchant family of Newport, Rhode Island. Charity, her correspondence and her connections with other Quaker women are the focus of this study.

Thomas and Charity Rotch were unusual in that most of their married life was spent at a distance from settled Quaker communities. In 1800 they moved from New Bedford, Massachusetts, to Hartford, Connecticut, where Thomas saw business opportunities. They formed a small Friends meeting there. Thomas opened a prosperous store, invested in banks and mills and on farm land he acquired in West Hartford began to raise Merino sheep. In 1811 he undertook an even more ambitious migration, to Stark County, Ohio. Large numbers of Friends, mainly from Virginia, North Carolina, and the Delaware Valley, had settled in Ohio over the previous decade, but Thomas Rotch chose to take up a large tract of land at some distance from existing Quaker communities. The town he laid out and named Kendal (now Massillon), however, quickly attracted Friends from New England. Arriving with significant capital and a reputation as a weighty Friend, Thomas Rotch established himself as a merchant, farmer, woollen manufacturer, town promoter and active Friend. Charity was equally influential, becoming the clerk of Ohio Yearly Meeting of Women Friends after its establishment in 1813. They also became involved in antislavery activities. They urged Ohio Friends to encourage free black settlement in the state, and they are among the earliest Friends for whom we have clear evidence of aiding enslaved people who had escaped.

Wittman's emphasis, however, is on Charity as a case study of women, particularly Quaker women, in the early Republican United States. Thus she tells us that

the letters of the Rotch and Rodman women examined in this study support the contentions of feminist historians, and permit a deepening of our understanding of the precise mechanics of women's cultures by illustrating the extent and ways that women formulated notions of kinship and community via correspondence. (p. 8)

Since Charity lived at a distance from her family for most of her married life, and was highly literate, she had occasion for frequent correspondence. Wittman uses that correspondence and the works of a number of women's historians to look at how Charity's experiences compare with those of other women in the early republic. For the most part, they are parallel. Charity was unusual in that her only child died in infancy, but she followed the childbearing and childrearing of relatives and friends with interest. What set Charity most apart was her relative affluence. When she set out for Ohio from New England, for instance, her outfit included 'her silver, china, fine linens, books, twelve Empire-style chairs, an English carpet, a copper tea turn, several silver dishes, tankards, and other items of sentimental value' (p. 121). Since Charity did not normally preserve copies of her own letters, Wittman necessarily must depend on letters that have survived in other repositories or extrapolate from incoming correspondence to try to reconstruct Charity's thinking and experiences.

Ultimately, the major contribution of this book comes in Wittman's conclusion that

Quaker women commonly used their correspondence as expressions of their spiritual experiences and beliefs, and to understand, and make sense of and analyze the scale of their happiness and their discontent. Through their correspondence, they created a gender-specific culture to maintain ties of kinship in spaces where all intimacies were permissible. (p. 213)

Wittman also lends support to arguments by historians such as John Mack Faragher, going back to the 1970s, that women were less enthusiastic participants in westward movement than men. Living on the frontier in an area where hired help was scarce, Charity doubtless had to work harder than she would have in New England.

This work has a few flaws, ranging from minor to perplexing. Inoculation and vaccination are not synonymous. On page 118 Wittman tells us that landholding in Ohio in 1810 'was widespread', but a page later quotes another historian who stated 'By 1810, only about 45% of Ohio adult males owned land.' Perhaps the least defensible of Wittman's conclusions is on page 217, where she argues: 'Some Quakers believed that women should be silent in churches and were offended by the immodest or brazen behavior of female ministers.' Certainly Friends would have objected to women Quakers who were immodest and brazen, but Wittman presents no support for any Friends before 1830 objecting to female ministry.

Thomas and Charity Rotch is a good introduction to two Friends who left behind a mass of documentation about their lives. But it will not be the last word on the subject.

Thomas D. Hamm
Earlham College, USA

Crawford Griffen and R. Scott Spurlock (eds), *Puritans and Catholics in the Transatlantic World 1600–1800* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2016), pp. vii + 246. ISBN 1978137368973. Hardback, \$100.00.

The title of this collection of 11 essays and an introduction is expansionist enough to allow topics from Laudian bishops to images of nineteenth-century American utopian communities. The articles are well researched, but there is little overlap and each could have been published separately in scholarly journals. The only article on Friends, by Jordan Landes, is an institutional history of London Yearly Meeting's dealings with Quakers in the New World, plus a brief biography of the transatlantic career of Thomas Chalkley. The information contained here is a compact version of the material in her *London Quakers in the Trans-Atlantic World* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2015), reviewed in *Quaker Studies* (June 2016, pp. 130–131). Other contributors make only scattered references to Friends. Articles on the Caribbean islands show how the Restoration government, in order to promote empire, encouraged the migration of Catholics and dissenters and allowed religious toleration at the expense of the Church of England. David Manning shows how letters, including those by Friends, on the Port Royal 1692 earthquake portrayed the avarice by merchants and planters as causing God's judgment, warned of similar sins in London and created a lasting image of dissipation. Most amazing to me was that, according to the chapter, none of these letters mentioned the treatment of enslaved people.

The articles provide contrasting approaches to religious history—formal theology, biography, a kind of art history, literary analysis, comparative eschatology, institutional analysis and the new emphasis on Atlantic history—but none are employed in a way that will open up major new scholarly vistas. Topics include families where one member becomes Roman Catholic and others Puritans; the complicated roles of Catholics in the various colonies; eschatology in Cotton Mather's *Magnalia*; Presbyterian defences of remaining separate from the Church of England in Ireland; whether the American Indians were descendants of the lost tribes of Israel; a 1621 print linking the Armada, the gunpowder plot and James I's foreign policy; Puritan complaints about intercessory prayer by Laudian bishops; a 1630s debate among English and New England Puritans about congregational polity; and Americans invoking anti-Roman Catholic stereotypes after encountering Beisel's followers at Ephrata in Pennsylvania, Shakers and Rappites. The study of Puritans, Catholics and Quakers in colonial America has long been transatlantic and these articles continue this tradition under a new name.

J. William Frost
Emeritus, Swarthmore College, USA

Gregory A. Barnes, *A Centennial History of the American Friends Service Committee* (Philadelphia: Friends Press, 2016), pp. xii + 486. ISBN 9781537526980. Paperback, \$24.95. Johannes Paulmann (ed.), *Dilemmas of Humanitarian Aid in the Twentieth Century* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016), pp. ix + 451. ISBN 9780198778974. Hardback, £75.

Despite a growing academic interest in the histories of humanitarian aid over the past decade, the humanitarian relief work of Friends in the twentieth century remains a relatively under-researched area. These two contributions are therefore both welcome and timely as we mark the centenary of the formation of the American Friends Service Committee (AFSC).

Barnes' *Centennial History* of the AFSC provides a long-awaited and ambitious overview of the humanitarian work of the AFSC at home and abroad. Drawing on extensive organisational archives, the extended chronological scope enables the author to trace the development of the organisation and its relationship with the broader Quaker community over the course of a century. Barnes characterises the organisation's evolution as falling into three distinct phases, which provide the structure of the book: 'Ahead of its Time' (1917–1950), 'Catching up with the Times' (1951–1990) and 'New Times' (1991–2016).

The first part opens with the formation of the AFSC at the instigation of Rufus Jones, who would become its first chairman. Prompted by America's decision to enter the so-called 'Great War' in early April 1917, and the need to find an alternative military service for young Quaker men, the Committee was established in a matter of weeks. Training for the volunteers began in July on Jones' Haverford College campus, and in late August and September the first groups of AFSC volunteers departed for France. In the meantime, six American women had departed for Russia, beginning a relationship with the Soviet Union that would last for several decades and which would later result in accusations of communist sympathies. In both Russia and France the AFSC joined the British Friends' War Victims' Relief Committee (FWVRC), which had been active in relief to non-combatants since 1914. As Barnes points out, the relationship between the British and American Quaker teams was often fraught with tensions, brought about by differences in background and theological and political outlook. This situation was exacerbated by some of the compromises that arose from the AFSC's connections to the American Red Cross.

In the post-war period the emphasis was largely on feeding programmes in Germany, Austria, Serbia and Russia. In this work the AFSC collaborated not only with the FWVRC but also with fellow Quaker Herbert Hoover's American Relief Administration—another relationship that required compromise and diplomacy, and which would ultimately come to a fractious end. The interwar period also saw a shift to Home Service, with relief initiatives aimed at relieving distress in American coalfields, for example. The organisation's attention then returned to international issues in the 1930s, with relief work in Spain during the

Civil War, with refugees from Europe, and finally to reconstruction in Europe, Africa and Asia in the aftermath of the Second World War.

In the 1950–1980s Barnes argues that the AFSC had to shift its focus in response to external forces, and as a result its efforts were concentrated on the ‘home front’, often in opposition to government policy on issues such as civil rights and race equality, labour relations, peace and disarmament and the Vietnam War. This period also saw the beginnings of an ecological awareness, and the organisation’s response to the emergence of feminism, LGBT rights and the need for diversity in the workforce. The final part of the book brings the story up to date and summarises the activities of an organisation that Barnes characterises as increasingly ‘data-driven’. It is also an organisation that now includes very few Quakers on the staff, while still perceiving itself as Quaker in origin and ethos.

Centennial histories are often perceived as unduly celebratory in nature. Barnes, however, does not shy away from some of the more uncomfortable themes or episodes in the organisation’s history. These include the painful nature of organisational restructuring brought about by various internal and external factors (including the financial pressures resulting from the economic downturn of recent years) and the fact that, despite its attempts at affirmative action, the AFSC was regularly subject to accusations of racism and sexism. One of the inevitable limitations of a study that aims to survey a complex and continually evolving organisation over such a vast period of time is that the opportunity to engage in detailed analysis of specific undertakings, periods or themes is restricted. A number of the themes that are introduced in the volume would benefit from further analysis, including the issue of gender and leadership, both at home and in the international field; the often problematic relationships between the AFSC and the wider Quaker constituency in the context of increasing professionalisation and affirmative action; and the implications for its Quaker identity and principles of collaboration with a broad range of agencies and, indeed, the nation state. That being said, the author is to be congratulated on producing a comprehensive, coherent and very readable account that should provide an excellent stimulus for future research.

Some of the themes raised above are taken up in one of the essays featured in the second publication reviewed here, which brings the AFSC and Quaker relief into dialogue with the broader context of humanitarian history. *Dilemmas of Humanitarian Aid in the Twentieth Century* draws together 17 case studies of a broad range of agencies and geographical contexts. In his introduction to the essays Paulmann provides an overarching framework for the collection. Opening with the current perception of contemporary humanitarianism as being in a state of crisis, he summarises recent humanitarian historiography and key concepts to present a series of ‘dilemmas’ inherent in humanitarian practices. These include concerns about the negative consequences of aid, the creation of cultures of dependency, relief as ‘industry’, competition between agencies, the complexities of interacting with mass media, political and moral compromises and the risk of

prolonging conflict or becoming part of military strategies. His contention that these dilemmas and debates are far from new and that much can therefore be gained from historical reflection and analysis is richly illustrated in the essays that follow.

The collection is organised in four loosely chronological sections beginning with 'Multiple Foundations', which considers the birth of The International Committee of the Red Cross in the second half of the nineteenth century and the AFSC in the latter stages of the First World War. The second part includes essays on the interwar period and the Second World War, exploring, for example, humanitarian relief during Morocco's Rif War in the 1920s, the founding of the Save the Children International Union and the activities of the United Nations Relief and Rehabilitation Agency in post-Second World War Europe. In the third section the focus shifts to the period of the 'Cold War and Decolonization' and includes, among other topics, explorations of religious and secular politics in aid to sub-Saharan Africa and German aid to Vietnamese 'boat people'. The last section of the book considers more recent 'dilemmas' in the changing global political landscape since the end of the Cold War and focusses, for example, on the formation and work of Médecins Sans Frontières and the role increasingly played by Asian countries in the organisation and delivery of aid.

Of particular interest to readers of this journal is Daniel Roger Maul's wide-ranging and well-researched chapter 'American Quakers, the Emergence of International Humanitarianism, and the Foundation of the American Friends Service Committee, 1890–1920'. The inclusion of Quaker humanitarianism within an edited collection with a wider focus is very welcome (as Friends' endeavours tend to be neglected within the broader historiography), and the essay demonstrates how reading the Quaker experience in conversation with broader histories might prompt us to ask new questions.

Maul provides a detailed discussion of the origins of Quaker humanitarian aid, informed by a brief but useful evaluation of the prevalent historiographical explanations for the evolution of humanitarian motives (the growth of Enlightenment sensibility, the development of capitalism, the rise of evangelicalism and the missionary movement and Imperial discourses of responsibility and 'civilising' mission), and their relevance to the Quaker experience. While taking some account of earlier relief initiatives, Maul traces the genesis of twentieth-century Quaker relief to two factors that coincided to re-energise Quaker participation in humanitarianism: first, the moves to modernise the Society of Friends originating with J. W. Rowntree and others in the 1890s and the transnational expansion of the Young Friends Movement. Drawing on the seminal historical work of John Ormerod Greenwood, Maul stresses the centrality of a discourse of service that recognised no national boundaries.¹ Secondly, Maul

1 J. Ormerod Greenwood, *Quaker Encounters Volume 1: Friends and relief* (York: William Sessions Ltd., 1975), p. 172.

emphasises the challenges posed by the First World War and the need in both Britain and the USA to find a practical Quaker response to the crisis. It was the different ways in which these developments played out in British and American Quaker contexts that were at the root of the tensions between the AFSC and the FEWRC, and their differing approaches to relief. Maul provides a convincing analysis of how the 'complex and multi-layered relationship between the religious and the secular' (p. 86) shaped some of the AFSC's policies and practices. Working in collaboration with other, often secular, agencies led to tensions between the need to maintain and protect a distinctive Quaker identity and ethos and the ability to operate effectively within non-Quaker frameworks (including national governments, the media and a broad spectrum of donors and supporters) that saw humanitarian aid as a means of furthering national interests. Maul asserts that collaboration with the American Red Cross, for example, reinforced the AFSC's aim of projecting an image that was both patriotic and professional, and heightened the differences and tensions between the American and British Quaker relief teams. In contrast to the FEWRC, in which women occupied positions of responsibility, the Red Cross' strategy to masculinise humanitarian activity led to a 'male bias' in AFSC's leadership and, to a lesser extent, personnel. Similarly, the compromises that were demanded by working in collaboration with Hoover's American Relief Administration, which consciously used food as a political weapon to counter socialism and advance American interests in Europe, again led to differences with the FEWRC. Maul concludes that, despite the AFSC's best efforts to stay faithful to its Quaker principles, as a key player in the distribution of American aid globally it also became an integral part of America's war effort and its initiatives to further national interest.

Siân Roberts
University of Birmingham, England

Peter Ackers and Alistair J. Reid (eds), *Alternatives to State-Socialism in Britain: other worlds of labour in the twentieth century*, Palgrave Studies in the History of Social Movements (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2016), pp. xvii + 354. ISBN 9783219341620. Hardback, £66.99.

This edited collection focuses on the 'short' twentieth century, from 1918 to 1979, and contains two chapters of particular interest to those pursuing Quaker Studies or with a general interest in Quakerism and its history. It is therefore those chapters that are my primary focus here. After an introductory essay by the editors the book is divided into three sections. Part one contains four chapters under the heading 'Other Forms of Association'. The first paper that touches upon Quakerism, 'Protestant Nonconformists: Providers of Educational and Social Services', falls within this section, along with other chapters on women

activists, trade unions and the Co-operative Party. Part two concerns 'Other Leaders' and commences with the second piece that forms part of this review: 'Edward Cadbury: an Egalitarian Employer and Supporter of Working Women's Campaigns'. The following papers in this section deal with Walter Citrine and Frank Chapple, focussing on unions. The final part of the book is entitled 'Other Intellectuals', and considers two individuals, G. D. H. Cole and Michael Young, alongside state-society partnerships, and concludes with a chapter by the editors looking forward to fresh research.

In their detailed and adept introduction, Ackers and Reid demonstrate the dominance of state-socialist thinking in labour history and explain that the volume seeks to counteract this trend and explore other possibilities. Ackers and Reid argue for more liberal-pluralist readings of twentieth-century history, some of which are presented here. However, beyond saying that liberal-pluralism 'eschews state-socialist methods and outcomes' and acknowledging the piecemeal nature of these endeavours, they do not define the term succinctly, perhaps leaving the general reader wondering at its precise meaning, particularly in this context (p. 16). It is these liberal-pluralist ideas that they argue were much more important for British labour's thought than has been previously recognised.

Chapter 5, Andy Vail's 'Protestant Nonconformists: Providers of Educational and Social Services', gives considerable attention to the Adult School movement and the involvement of Quakers in it. The piece opens by placing nonconformists in their party-political context, as membership of and office-taking within Labour increased. This detailed and useful background helps the chapter fit better into the collection. Also featured are churches explicitly attempting to link faith and socialism, such as the Labour Church. The following discussion of 'Christian Auxiliary Movements' (p. 126) covers Working Men's Clubs, John Brown Paton's National Home Reading Union and Boys' and Girls' Life Brigades, Toynbee Hall (which had three Quaker wardens), and briefly Woodbrooke Quaker settlement. However, Vail notes that other settlements that followed were largely organised by Friends. Perhaps somewhat unexpectedly, Vail also deals here with educational provision for workers at the Cadbury factory from as early as 1899, and the contributions of other employers. Quakers unsurprisingly feature heavily in the next section, 'Adult Schools and the Brotherhood and Sisterhood Movement'. Vail gives full credit to their contribution and the rise they gave to the other initiatives, providing a fairly detailed comparison before describing their decline. The final section of Vail's chapter considers the decline of nonconformity in the twentieth century. While it provides some detail and statistics on other nonconformists and some links to party politicisation, Quakerism is not considered. Vail's conclusion is well written and helpful in summarising the chapter and pointing towards areas of further research.

John Kimberley has contributed the sixth chapter in this collection, 'Edward Cadbury: an Egalitarian Employer and Supporter of Working Women's Campaigns'. His aim in this chapter seems to be to raise Cadbury's profile, and he clearly views

Cadbury favourably, arguing that his contribution to management thought is significant and overlooked. Edward Cadbury is credited with being the 'principal architect' of the management system at his family's firm (p. 153). Kimberley also focuses on Cadbury's concern for women at the company. The substance of the chapter looks briefly at the firm's business philosophy and considers the importance of Edward's faith for his work. Kimberley argues that 'Although Edward was not demonstrative about his Quaker faith, it was deeply held' (p. 154). This may well be the case, but little supporting evidence is presented here, or for a couple of other minor points, though these detract little from the chapter on the whole. Kimberley's coverage of the late nineteenth-century transformation of Quakerism from evangelical to liberal is succinct and accurate. He then turns to two of Edward Cadbury's texts, *Women's Work and Wages* and *Sweating*. The outlines of both books are clear and helpful, with Kimberley providing some analysis as well as description. The following section of the chapter looks at Julia Varley, a woman trade unionist, and Cadbury's collaboration with her, highlighting his proactive approach alongside details about her work.

Kimberley dedicates several pages to Edward's work towards welfare in the workplace, arguing that, by arranging a conference on welfare work, Cadbury began the personnel management movement, with some support (p. 165). Within this, Kimberley provides some analysis of Cadbury's third book *Experiments in Industrial Organization*. One of Kimberley's arguments in explaining the lack of recognition for Edward is that his modesty meant that he gave too much credit to his father, George, and uncle, Richard (p. 166). Kimberley demonstrates that, for Edward, 'individual improvement and development came before the needs of the business' (p. 168). He also appraises the negative aspects that accompanied excellent welfare for workers at Cadbury's (p. 169). Kimberley analyses how Edward's management approach fitted with George Fox's theology. This is a strong, convincing analysis, which makes clear points. In concluding, Kimberley argues persuasively that a sense of covenant underpinned Edward Cadbury's practice.

In their conclusion to the collection, Ackers and Reid argue that these chapters demonstrate the contribution other forms of labour association can make to society, and that such alternatives should be given more credence in the contemporary, post-Thatcher context. Neoliberalism, they argue, is not the only alternative to state-socialism today.

Nicola Sleafwood
University of Birmingham, England

Julie L. Holcomb, *Moral Commerce: Quakers and the transatlantic boycott of the slave labor economy* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2016), pp. ix + 252. ISBN 978801452086. Hardback, £26.95.

In 1942 Ruth Nuermberger wrote that the 'Free Produce Movement' was a Quaker campaign, attracting very few outsiders. This fascinating movement was an important but relatively little-known chapter in the wider story of abolitionism, when British and American consumers attempted to attack slavery at 'the root of the evil', through a two-pronged approach—the avoidance of slave-made goods and the favouring of those made using free labour.

In this important, scholarly and highly detailed new book, Julie L. Holcomb carefully examines how the Free Produce Movement took shape: its history, scope and remit, successes, failures, key players and complex organisation. This spans approximately a century, from the late eighteenth century until the end of the American Civil War, when consumers avoided 'slave-made' things, notably plantation-grown sugar and cotton. Significantly, these early humanitarians sought an alternative supply of free labour goods, 'untainted' by slavery, certified as genuine and made especially for this market.

Moral Commerce contributes considerably to our understanding of the ideologies, mechanisms and impacts of free produce. This is a less-explored aspect of abolitionism, for, notwithstanding Nuermberger's pioneering text and some recent scholarship on the subject, there has been no single, comprehensive book published on the movement. As Holcomb observes, no full history of the British Free Produce Movement has been written, and a deeper look at the quality and range of free produce goods, especially cotton, would be exciting.¹

Moral Commerce maps the global aspects of the movement and is richest in its careful examination of free produce within American culture. The combination of broader brushstrokes and fine detail, drawn from a wealth of primary sources, will provide fascinating reading for both specialist and non-specialist readerships. Readers interested in humanitarianism, abolitionism, political rhetoric and in-fighting among grassroots campaigns will find much to enjoy. Furthermore, an extraordinary cast of characters is brought to our attention: the persuasive and charismatic Elihu Burritt, and Henry Highland Garnet, a formerly enslaved person who held audiences enthralled with his first-hand account of the horrors of the plantation. For me, the faded little ticket bearing the ubiquitous image of a kneeling slave, once affixed to a roll of cotton cloth, is the most striking example offered by the book, for here is the material evidence for a way of life, a set of beliefs and the practical solutions to a moral dilemma that existed in the 1850s (p. 150).

1 See Anna Vaughan Kett, 'Quaker Women and Anti-Slavery Activism: Eleanor Clark and the Free Labour Cotton Depot in Street', *Quaker Studies* 19:1 (September 2014), pp. 137–56.

In eight well-organised chapters Holcomb takes the reader on a complex journey, emphasising the significance of free produce as ‘the first consumer movement to transcend the boundaries of nation, gender, and race’ (p. 3). It is through its uneven development that we may understand both the problems of using commodity consumption to solve political problems and the bitter power struggles that can ensue. Whilst avoidance and abstinence may seem familiar concepts to Quakers, the official boycotting of slave-grown cotton was a complex matter, for slave-grown cotton was everywhere, even in the paper used for abolitionist pamphlets—and how was the consumer to know that free cotton was really genuine? Feelings ran very high, especially in the 1850s, when the American wing of the movement became an acrimonious battle-ground, with leading abolitionist Samuel S. May convinced of the futility of free produce, which was, he said, akin to ‘bailing out the Atlantic with a spoon’ (p. 170).

The marketplace became a contested arena for many debates associated with this period, some of which were well known to Quakers, such as unease with the world of goods, the desire to maintain ‘clean hands’ in morally questionable commerce and the preference for plainer home-grown goods over fancy foreign ones. Also important were the discourses surrounding the roles played by class, gender, race and religion in promoting cultural and historical change. Free produce appears to have touched some significant nerves, for how else can we explain the harsh criticism heaped upon its supporters? Yet, despite bitter criticism, much of it anti-Quaker and misogynistic, a core of radical and deeply committed activists continued to promote consumer action and to demand ethical goods.

Holcomb must be congratulated for drawing together a huge range of secondary and primary sources and for telling the free produce story with such clarity. The free produce narrative needs to go down in history as a moral struggle enacted by a relatively small community against all odds; a direct attack on the mighty Anglo-British slave-cotton industry. It also played a part in female emancipation, for women were both quartermasters and gatekeepers of the moral home and Holcomb is right to see free produce agency as foundational to women’s emergent political identities.

Moral Commerce begins by agreeing with Nuermberger and stating that ultimately the boycott of slave-made goods ‘failed to achieve its goal: the abolition of slavery’ (p. 12). However, the book goes on to set out its successes, for it was part of the groundswell of opinion that resulted in sustained and powerful condemnation of slavery, resulting in the Abolition Bill in 1807, the abolition of British slaveholding in the 1830s and the abolition of slavery in America in 1865.

There are also some significant and lasting legacies, for free produce gave political power to women, offering them culturally acceptable ways of expressing political dissent, both in the public and private spheres. The female free produce consumer emerges as both driver and champion of moral change, for, as Holcomb writes, ‘each individual decision in the marketplace was freighted with moral significance’ (p. 193). In turn, this set the precedent for widespread acceptance

of consumer activism far beyond Quaker culture, and it established the ethical consumer's desire for good practice in manufacturing. For these reasons, the Free Produce Movement was a deeply important campaign and one to which we owe a great deal.²

Anna Vaughan Kett
University of Brighton, England

² Anna Vaughan Kett has also written a review of *Moral Commerce* that will appear in *Winterthur Portfolio*, forthcoming, Winter 2017.