

Book Reviews

Douglas Gwyn, *A Gathering of Spirits: The Friends General Conferences 1896–1950* (Philadelphia, PA: Quaker Press of FGC, 2018), pp. xx + 295. ISBN 9780999382349. Paperback, \$20.00.

This book charts the history of the conferences (now called gatherings) of Friends General Conference (FGC) over the first half of the twentieth century, from the initial pragmatic gatherings to the biennial event they became. FGC formed as an umbrella organisation for Hicksite yearly meetings and the book begins by recounting the events of the nineteenth century that led to multiple schisms within the Quaker movement. By the early twentieth century some of those divisions were beginning to be healed and the advent of modernism within FGC and parts of the Gurneyite Five Years Meeting (FYM) transcended some of the earlier theological distinctions. Nevertheless, the book reveals how the conferences consolidated a Quaker identity separate both from the wider world and from wider Quakerism.

As clichéd as it may sound in a book review, this volume is an important contribution to Quaker studies. It is important primarily because twentieth-century Quakerism is largely unresearched. Thomas Kennedy's work on British Quakerism ends in 1920, Brian Phillips' in 1910, and only Martin Davie in *British Quaker Theology since 1895* has attempted a monograph-length treatment of the twentieth century.¹ Chapters on twentieth-century Quakerism in the likes of the *Oxford Handbook of Quaker Studies* or the more recent *Cambridge Companion to Quakerism* have the space to offer only chronological highlights. Timothy Burdick's work has offered the greatest advance in this area in recent years, with his doctoral research into holiness, fundamentalist and neo-fundamentalist

1 Kennedy, T. C., *British Quakerism 1860–1920: the transformation of a religious community*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001. Phillips, B. D., 'Friendly Patriotism: British Quakerism and the imperial nation 1890–1910', unpublished PhD dissertation, University of Cambridge, 1989. Davie, M. D., *British Quaker Theology since 1895*, Lampeter, Edwin Mellen Press, 1997.

Oregon Quakerism in the first half of the twentieth century.² This work by Doug Gwyn is a useful counterpoint, offering a history from the other end of the North American Quaker spectrum. The kinds of Quaker sensibility Gwyn charts are exactly those of which Burdick's constituency were increasingly wary as the century wore on and which prompted Oregon to disaffiliate from both FYM and then American Friends Service Committee (AFSC). The priority FGC gave to, for example, the secular approach to race relations over mission was the wedge that drove fundamentalist Friends in the opposite direction.

So, the book is important as it represents a stepping stone along the way to a fuller understanding of the recent Quaker past. It is also important as it does this so well. Gwyn is probably best known for his work on George Fox and early Quaker apocalypticism, but he has regularly written on present-day themes and in this book he brings his historical expertise and creative theoretical grasp to bear on FGC conferences. Gwyn uses ideas honed in earlier works, such as his understanding that Quakerism attracted two types of seeker convert or, for example, his work on covenant or on the apocalyptic nature of Quakerism, to interrogate and analyse twentieth-century liberalism. In this way he is able to draw historical tropes linking the earliest of Friends to the personalism of twentieth-century ones. In sociological terms, Gwyn tells a story of performative religiosity that eschewed a doctrinal one. Indeed, the idea of uniform discipline covering all the Yearly Meetings within FGC regularly surfaced, but eventually sank. FGC was to ultimately prioritise the individual over the corporate. One of the key concepts in this book is the interplay between 'spleen' and its counter-tendency 'melancholy', between energetic and hope-filled (prophetic) activism and disappointment and grief. Liberal Friends, Gwyn suggests, were ever-hopeful and yet regularly bombarded and bemused by the awfulness of world events in the twentieth century. Whilst other Christians altered what they came to see as naïve positions on human 'progress', Liberal Friends continued to affirm each others' idealism at the conferences, which later in the century became annual, and in Gwyn's terms enacted and inhabited a 'heroic era'. Gwyn suggests the conferences are akin to the chorus in a Greek tragedy, recounting and reacting to the events around them, but I wondered whether he might here have introduced more of his earlier work on tragedy and its pattern of trait, consequence and uplift to good effect, with an inevitability of consequence of FGC's optimism followed by (a self-generated) uplift to begin the cycle again. However, Gwyn is clear that these conferences are not the key actors. He does, however, helpfully map Quaker moral sensibilities in terms of the two axes drawn from the study of the Hebrew scriptures: that of pollution/purity and that of gift/debt, and again uses these to link the twentieth century with the more distant Quaker past.

2 Burdick, T. J., 'Neo-evangelical identity within American Religious Society of Friends (Quakers): Oregon Yearly Meeting, 1919–47', unpublished PhD dissertation, University of Birmingham, 2013.

There are useful threads running through the volume, too, in terms of the relationship of key institutions such as Pendle Hill and AFSC, and key personalities such as Barnard Walton, FGC Secretary for 35 years, or Rufus Jones, Henry Cadbury, Bliss Forbush and Patrick Malin. Gwyn ensures, too, that this is not just a history of male leaders, whilst acknowledging that they had the most air time. Some of the detail of all the talks at the conferences can feel heavy at times, but images complement the text, and it is this empirical data that then allows Gwyn to soar with his theoretical overviews. Indeed, the third reason I find the book important is that it is written with such creative authority, by someone at ease with the material and the theory they create from it. It is also, as with all Gwyn's work, beautifully phrased in places. This book is not published by an academic press—indeed, FGC have published it themselves—but it is nevertheless scholarly, critical and well referenced. It is certainly worthy of our scholarly attention.

'Ben' Pink Dandelion

Centre for Research in Quaker Studies, Woodbrooke, Birmingham, England

Teresa Feroli and Margaret Olofson Thuckstun (eds), *Witness, Warning and Prophecy: Quaker Women's Writing, 1655–1700* (Temple, AZ: Iter Press, 2018), pp. 414. ISBN 9780866985840. Paperback, \$59.95.¹

Teresa Feroli and Margaret Olofson Thuckstun's beautifully curated anthology of primary sources, *Witness, Warning, and Prophecy: Quaker Women's Writing, 1655–1700*, has something valuable to offer on every page. While readers with an interest in tracing early Quaker women authors have been pretty well served to this point, this edition goes one better than all previous collections because it concentrates so acutely on the variety and interest of these women's testimony. How they spoke, as much as why they spoke out, emerges in these carefully prepared texts, which may therefore be read by general and by specialist readers with equal enjoyment.

Part of the series 'The Other Voice in Early Modern Europe', Feroli and Thuckstun's edition fits alongside another by Jane Donawerth and Rebecca M. Lush on Quaker leader Margaret Fell, *'Women's Speaking Justified' and Other Pamphlets* (Temple, AZ: Iter Press, 2018). These works act as companion volumes to provide the most generous and inclusive selection, to date, from the body of writing that Quaker women produced over the 50-year period that marked the birth of this religious movement, through a period of change as it secured its place in English and then American dissenting culture. Feroli and Thuckstun's editorial choices are indicative of a desire to capture the main twists and turns of Quaker

1 A version of this review will also feature in *Early Modern Women: an interdisciplinary journal* (forthcoming).

women's stories, in their own words, from the early days of Quaker activism in the 1650s to their socially conscious activities as part of separate women's meetings in the post-Restoration period and 1690s.

Witness, Warning, and Prophecy mainly concerns itself with representing the key genres that were deployed by women as they sought to convey their faith, or their commitment to co-religionists, or a mixture of the two. Part one of the collection is very rich in works by women acting on the impulse to convey a spiritual message from their God. These prophetic undertakings transformed women's religiosity, as they would venture out into communities to convey their God's will, to address specific readerships (such as people in power, as in the case of Mary Howgill's message to Oliver Cromwell), or to articulate an aspect of their religious experience. In this attention to prophecy, Feroli and Thickett's volume represents the publicly oriented quality of Quaker women's writing through texts that are often both dramatic and challenging.

In addition to the section on prophecy, part two of the collection provides a range of works that offer a context on how women fared once the Quaker movement had embedded itself in English religious culture. During the latter part of the seventeenth century women worked to establish themselves as capable administrators and organisers of the valuable women's meetings, helping in charitable and organisational endeavours. The volume's selections of texts show how women's work was appraised as they wrote about their experiences in the women's meetings or were commended for their exemplary lives. In the later period, women also spoke on the principle of freedom of conscience during times of intense persecution. This collection gives an especially good selection of the work of Anne Docwra as an exemplar of this kind of commitment. Many connections can be made between the earlier period (roughly 1650–66) and the later period (1667–1700), by virtue of how generously this volume represents women's published output. Really, the only gap in terms of genre is conversion (called convincement), which is a little under-represented.

The editors have done fine work making these texts easily readable. This is a lengthy anthology with 40 works, and it covers in excess of 325 pages, and yet quality has not been sacrificed in its production. As the Bible is so often utilised as a source of allusion, Quaker writings benefit from the scriptural echoes being annotated; Quaker women's awareness of constitutional and religious material by their contemporaries is also important to note. The footnotes amply demonstrate these intertextual sources and, because of this detailed work of contextualisation, the accumulation of the material in the footnotes and headnotes renders this edition the most user-friendly reproduction of Quaker texts to date. While much of the material in this collection is on Early English Books Online (EEBO) or Eighteenth Century Collections Online (ECCO), the editors have done future readers a great service in making sure that digitised texts have been checked against other holdings in UK and US libraries. In some instances, gaps in the digital provision have been identified and filled. It is good to see texts not on

the English Short Title Catalogue (ESTC) and also some of difficult attribution being included (see, for example, Sarah Blackbarrow being identified as the author 'S.B.' in a work from 1662), and that the editors have chosen to provide samples of Quaker poetry as well as prose. This will provide the perfect introduction to anyone new to religious women's history and writing, and, in being so attentive to textual history, it will also have much to offer the specialist who may already know some or all of this work well.

Feroli and Thuckstun have produced an excellent edition, full of memorable works that get to the heart of what early Quaker women's testimony was about in showing (by turns) their courage, indignation, resilience and vision. It is an edition to treasure.

Catie Gill
Loughborough University

Satish Sharma, *Quakerism, Its Legacy, and Its Relevance for Gandhian Research* (Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2017), pp. xvi + 316. ISBN 9781527500105. Hardback, £45.39.

Satish Sharma's book makes a contribution to Quaker studies by the very fact of its recognising the importance of Friends to Gandhian and Indian history. He has also highlighted Quakerism's importance in Gandhian studies by virtue of the book's place in Sharma's own scholarship. In 2013, he completed a four-book series on Gandhi's teachers: Rajchandra Ravjibhai Mehta, Leo Tolstoy, John Ruskin and Henry David Thoreau, each of whom was an important and inspiring figure in Gandhi's life and the formation of his ideas, with Rajchandra, a less familiar figure to many, perhaps proving of most interest. Having recently completed these four books, Sharma has elevated Quakerism in the constellation of Gandhian studies.

As stated by the title, *Quakerism, Its Legacy, and Its Relevance for Gandhian Research*, this book primarily offers a broad perspective to help graduate students and Gandhi scholars who wish to learn about Quakerism. The author has also decided to include a broad and sweeping intellectual history prior to addressing Quakerism. This decision reveals something about his conception of audience and his belief that these backgrounds lay a foundation for understanding Quakerism. After the Introduction, the second chapter is on Early Europe, the Middle Ages, and 'times, conditions, and thought', the last of which summarises philosophical developments from Plato and Aristotle to Augustine, Machiavelli, Thomas Aquinas, Locke, Rousseau, and Hume. The next chapter, 'Seeds and Brief History', devotes ten pages to tracing history from the fall of Rome to the Crusades and secularising influences through the late Middle Ages.

In 'Seeds and Brief History', the author offers a 20-page summary of Quaker history, with emphasis on the seventeenth century, discussing George Fox in some detail and mentioning in passing important figures such as James Naylor, Margaret

Fell, Mary Penington and Mary Dyer, but also with mention of major movements in the next three centuries. Concluding with general statements that characterise much of the book's advice to future researchers, Sharma states that

An enormous amount of literature exists on Quaker and Gandhian thought and practices, and some researchers have pointed to the similarities, commonalities, and parallels between the two. But the need still exists for further extension, expansion, and enrichment of the thought and practices through more analyses, comparisons, integrations, syntheses, and transformations. (p. 60)

The 'Closing Remarks' at the end of each chapter often include sentences which summarise by way of such lists.

The three central chapters elaborate on: Quakerism's core beliefs; spirituality, pacifism and peace; and Friends' efforts at aid, relief and conciliation. The last of these chapters discusses the following topics, among others, all of which have obvious relevance to Gandhi's interests: social welfare efforts; aid and relief; prison reforms; sanitation, physical health and nursing; temperance; human equality; slave trade and slavery; educational endeavours; and conciliation efforts. I had hoped, however, that these chapters might highlight direct connections with Gandhi and might raise specific questions. The book leaves the reader to raise questions for further research.

I also hoped that more would have been said about what Gandhi learned from Quakers. The section on prison reforms discusses Elizabeth Fry's work, but what did Gandhi know of this? During his visits to England in 1906 and 1909 he learned from the protests of the suffragettes, but did he also pay attention to the protests of Alice Paul during the next decade? A section of the book on 'Pacifism and Peace' discusses early Friends' testimonies, but this section ends with the mid nineteenth century. We do not hear about Gandhi's responses to the important work of Quakers in the areas of pacifism and peace in the early twentieth century.

There are few specifics about how Gandhi's ideas were actually influenced by Friends. It would have been helpful to hear about Gandhi's interactions with Quakers in South Africa, as well as those interactions that were more extensive from 1928 to the end of his life in 1948. Gandhi had worshipped with Friends and had experimented with silent worship, but concluded that silent worship would not be the best way to meet the needs of his followers. During his 12-week visit to England in 1931 for the Round Table Conference, Quakers arranged and hosted many of the activities in which Gandhi took part. He worshipped and spoke with Friends at Woodbrooke, Birmingham, and Friends House in London. Key Quaker figures with whom Gandhi spent time were Horace Alexander, John S. Hoyland, and Reginald Reynolds. Conversely, some Quakers were outspoken in their criticism of Gandhi's ideas. An article by John W. Graham called 'The Case Against Mr. Gandhi' was published in October 1931 in *The Friend*.

The sections discussing Gandhi's ideas are relatively brief: there are two pages in the Introduction and, in Chapter 7 'Legacy and Relevance', a 20-page segment

on 'Interfacing with Gandhian Research', which offers broad ideas about the overlap of Quaker and Gandhian ideas. In that section Sharma discusses the commonality of efforts by Quakers and Gandhi to reform government policies and improve living conditions; their organising around perceptions and principles; the essential equality and unity of humankind; their focus on God, Truth and inner revelations, and how they guide conscientious living; the importance of community and personal responsibility; tending to the needy and the victims of war; the importance of education; and local, national and international peace efforts.

Sharma concludes the chapter on 'Legacy and Relevance' by saying 'it is quite amazing to note that early Quakers and Gandhi were separated by centuries and belong to two different historical traditions in two different continents, and yet demonstrate striking similarity and numerous parallels' (p. 212). The similarity and parallels are indeed amazing. Quakerism and Gandhianism share profoundly in their efforts for peace and justice.

Mike Heller

Professor of English, Roanoke College, USA

James W. Hood (ed.), *Quakers and Literature*, Quakers and the Disciplines: Volume 3 (Longmeadow, MA: Friends Association for Higher Education, 2016), pp. xiv + 167. ISBN 9780996003384. Paperback, £14.02.

What is, or what has been, or what should be the relationship between Quakerism and imaginative writing? Such broad questions inform this collection of 11 essays, which speculates that it might now be time to develop 'a new understanding of what it means to be fully Quaker and fully writer simultaneously' (p. 5).

If it is indeed time for this, it would be a striking development, for Quakers' relationship with literature has not hitherto been an especially productive one. Indeed, there has been from the outset, the editor James W. Hood suggests, a 'fundamental friction ... between the Quaker testimonies of simplicity and integrity and the metaphoric, imaginative, carnivalesque spirit that so deeply informs artistic expression' (p. 2). The problem has been two-fold: first, to create has been seen as the prerogative of the Almighty, so the creative arts made of the human artificer an imitator of the Creator rather than his worshipper. Secondly, there has been seen to be a fundamental problem with 'the base falsity of representation itself, the substitution of one thing for another' (p. 3). Fox might well have concurred with the sentiments, if not the doctrine, of the clergyman and poet George Herbert, his near contemporary, who asked in 'Jordan (I)', 'Is there in truth no beauty? / Is all good structure in a winding stair?' These lines enact the very problem that Fox and other early Friends sought to circumvent by rejecting the arts. In deference to the simplicity of divine truth, Herbert refuses

the tools and methods of literary representation; and yet, in so doing, he deploys precisely the techniques he is questioning. The metaphor of the 'winding stair' is conjured to question the godliness of metaphor itself. Despite his best efforts, his poetry speaks analogically, with forked tongue; its 'truths' are to be glimpsed momentarily, garnered from between the lines, rather than plainly stated.

The tensions inherent in such formal and religious complexity have been a rich source of critical discussion in relation to Herbert and other Puritan writers, and Hood's Introduction to this collection of essays gestures towards extending these debates to a cognate examination of the tension between Quakerism and literature. This sparked questions for me in anticipation of the explorations to be found in subsequent chapters: in what ways, I wondered, might the specific forms and practices of Quaker belief find literary shape? What kind of relationship might a faith premised on the godly power of silence have with the artfully written word? How might a commitment to the spontaneity and simplicity of godly utterance be reconciled with the consciously formal craft of literary production?

Turning from the Introduction to the main chapters, however, I found myself needing to recalibrate my expectations, orienting them more towards Quakerism and less towards the discipline of literary study. The book is published by the Friends Association for Higher Education, whose website describes it as 'showing the ways Quakers have not only been "publishers of truth" but have also furthered the truth in a number of written forms'. This usefully clarifies the book's agenda: it is ultimately more interested in how Quaker literature (broadly conceived) might best articulate and serve the faith than in the kind of critical questions outlined above.

Once I had refocussed my expectations, there was much to value in the contributions to this 'invested' engagement with the topic. The chapters are organised into six sections, but running across and between these are several recurrent concerns. First, there is a commitment to demonstrating the power of Quaker written testimony, historical and contemporary. The first three essays examine instances of eighteenth-century Quaker life-writing: Jon Kershner discusses the prophetic voice of John Woolman's journal; Helene Pollock considers the memoir of Mary Neale; and Marva L. Hoopes addresses the narrative power of Susanna Morris's journal. Later, Higgins explores the way Quaker values inform the work of a twentieth-century writer (see below). At stake in each of these contributions is a desire to open the power of their central texts to twenty-first-century readers.

Second, there is an interest in genre and the ways in which different literary modes have variously served the Religious Society of Friends. Where life-writing was the focus of the first section, the second is concerned with representation of Quakers or the transmutation of Quaker values in fiction. Diane Reynolds finds a generic deficit in an over-simplistic and moralistic twentieth-century Quaker fiction compared with the ethical complexity of its expository prose testimony; Edward F. Higgins analyses the Quaker-informed science fiction of Joan Slonczewski; Cathy Pitzer and Jean Mulhern discuss the work of the crime

novelist Rex Stout; and William Jolliff explores, and commends, the special power of poetry.

Jolliff, a poet and educator, is also interested in the power of literary practice as an act of ministry. He concludes that creative work, whether popular or more formally challenging, can offer readers 'the experience of identification, transcendence, or epiphany' (p. 122), and thereby serve the Quaker community. Graves and Heller (see below) also consider the ministerial power of 'literature in action', thereby shifting the focus away from texts and on to readers.

A Quaker-informed pedagogy is a fourth concern of this book, outlined and explored in the chapters by Darlene Graves and Mike Heller. Graves considers Quaker contributions to the theatre both in terms of subject matter and as informing and supporting 'a style of creative and improvisational drama' (p. 123), while Heller returns to the topic of Quaker and other spiritual life-writings, but this time as a means to engage students in a process of reflection on their own spiritual, intellectual and ethical growth.

Above all, however, the contributions are all focussed on the ethics of a Quaker engagement with literature, whether on the page, in performance, or studied in the classroom. Particularly incisive and well-developed in this regard is J. Ashley Foster's fascinating essay exploring the connections between British Modernism (particularly in the work of Virginia Woolf), pacifism, relief work and Friends during the Spanish Civil War. Bringing together history, literature and philosophy, the chapter also raises urgent questions about an ethical engagement with violence in our own time.

This is a quietly campaigning volume as much as a critical one. It celebrates the power of Quaker testimony in previous centuries and advocates a nuanced and rigorous literary expression in the present. While it might not fully answer the more academic questions about the relationship between Quakers and literature, it nonetheless testifies to the power that literature has always held for Friends, and continues to hold today.

Hilary Hinds
Lancaster University

Marie-Jeanne Rossignol and Bertrand Van Ruymbeke (eds), *The Atlantic World of Anthony Benezet (1713–1784): from French Reformation to North American Quaker Antislavery Activism* (Leiden and Boston: Brill, 2016), pp. xxviii + 256. ISBN 978–9004–31564–8. Hardback, \$143.

This collection of 13 essays, introduction and foreword is an excellent examination of the context and world around Quaker abolitionist Anthony Benezet. In this product of a 2013 conference in Paris, 'The Atlantic World of Anthony Benezet', contributors each focus on different aspects of Benezet, his family history, his place in the Quaker Atlantic community, and his writings and impact in the larger

Atlantic world. Pulling together multiple threads of history and historiography, this book is fundamental for researchers of Quaker history, Atlantic history, the history of emancipation and anti-imperial struggles, and transnational and global history.

Part I of this book, 'Anthony Benezet's French Heritage', includes three essays about Benezet's family's French roots and their experiences as part of the Huguenot diaspora. Bernard Douzil traces Benezet's family history in France, establishing its connections to local and regional politics and Protestantism. Didier Boisson provides understanding into why the Benezet family left France, even when many Huguenots were returning to France. Next, Bertrand Van Ruymbeke points out that, while Benezet is not widely referred to as Huguenot, his family's journeys were part of the larger diaspora, making him a 'figure of the *Refuge*' (p. 52).

Part II, 'Benezet and the Quaker Community in the British Atlantic World', comprises four essays that address how he fitted into the Quaker community and how his Quakerism related to his work. J. William Frost's contribution addresses the question of why Benezet's family became Quaker, how Anthony found employment through his faith, and finally how he became a Weighty Friend, concluding that he did not just gain himself through his beliefs but also 'put American Quakers on the map' (p. 69). In a highlight of the book, David L. Crosby writes about the Quaker Peace Testimony and its relationship to abolition, giving a useful understanding of Benezet's motivations and of the Peace Testimony applied to everyday living. Geoffrey Plank's work on John Woolman and Benezet picks up on some of the earlier comparisons between the two in Frost's chapter and examines them in depth. It is a fascinating comparison of two men on complementary paths that invites further research. Finishing off this section, and providing an approach based on trade history, Richard C. Allen writes about Nantucket Quakers and Atlantic politics in a chapter that concentrates on those politics, with Benezet's influence at the margins.

Part III, 'Benezet's Writings from an Atlantic Perspective', embraces six essays emphasising Benezet's print and literary contributions around the Atlantic world. Jonathan D. Sassi writes about the antislavery campaign in New Jersey just before the American Revolution and Benezet's impact on it. Louisiane Ferlier then looks at the circulation of early Quaker antislavery books in the Atlantic, reminding readers of the importance of the print trade to transatlantic Quakerism. Like Allen's chapter, Ferlier's discusses the world in which Benezet operated more than the man himself, with both pieces providing useful context to this work. Marie-Jeanne Rossignol's essay moves the reader to France, examining of Benezet's reputation there and discussing the French translations of his work, or the absence of them from the French national library's catalogue. Nonetheless, Rossignol finds proof that translations existed and Benezet served as a figure not just as an 'antislavery icon' but also for his 'Quaker qualities and values' (p. 184). Randy J. Sparks focusses on Benezet's *Some Historical Account* and the impact of his accounts of West Africa, Africans in Philadelphia and the slave trade influenced

abolitionists, from Thomas Clarkson, Granville Sharp, John Wesley and beyond, all made even more interesting by Sparks's mention of the power of Benezet's footnotes and the story of the Robin Johns. Completing the circuit around the Atlantic, Nina Reid-Maronet looks at Benezet in Benjamin Rush's Philadelphia, as well as Canada, starting with Rush's writing about his dream of paradise with formerly enslaved people and Benezet. Like Plank's examination of Benezet in comparison with another Quaker, Reid-Maronet's work is effective in describing Benezet's influence not just on Rush but also on Black abolitionist communities in Upper Canada. The third section finishes strongly with Richard S. Newman's 'From Benezet to Black Founders: Toward a New History of 18th-Century Atlantic Emancipation', where Newman examines Benezet amidst an interconnected world of antislavery activists, especially those of African descent, where his skilled use of print was part of 'an international and multi-cultural network of race rebels' (p. 223).

This is a well-curated collection, with the chapters organised logically and segueing smoothly into those following. Ideal for research libraries, especially in its electronic version, the essays will serve students who will find essential context and facts in the separate pieces. However, it was particularly enlightening to read it as a whole work, where the essays formed a clear outline of Benezet's family, faith and works.

This book sits well next to works on eighteenth-century Quakers and abolitionists, and especially on Benezet: Roberts Vaux's 1817 *Memoirs of the Life of Anthony Benezet* and Maurice Jackson's 2009 biography, *Let This Voice Be Heard: Anthony Benezet, Father of American Abolitionism*. For any interested researcher, reading any essay from this collection will increase their understanding of Benezet, his work and how both fit into the larger context and historiography. Rossignol and Van Ruymbeke write that they hope the volume will have an impact on future research, both of Benezet and of anti-slavery movements in the Atlantic world; with such successful essays, the collection will surely stimulate further scholarship.

Discussing a book's beginning at the end of its review may seem backwards, but the foreword by Jackson sets the modern context for Benezet's campaigning, mentioning the Emancipation Proclamation, the 2003 March on Washington to celebrate its 150th anniversary, Dr Martin Luther King and Barack Obama (pp. vi–vii). Jackson's final paragraph quotes Benezet's last words: 'I am dying and feel shamed to meet the face of my maker, I have done so little in his cause' (p. xxii). The quotation grounds this collection, with the chapters that follow demonstrating Benezet's important role in a larger movement by examining the context of his work and networks.

Jordan Landes
Senate House Library, University of London, England

Christopher Densmore, Carol Faulkner, Nancy Hewitt and Beverly Wilson Palmer (eds), *Lucretia Mott Speaks: The Essential Speeches and Sermons* (Champaign: University of Illinois Press, 2017), pp. xi + 224. ISBN 9780252040795. Hardback, \$75.00.

Lucretia Mott Speaks contains the most complete collection of Mott's speeches and sermons available. The volume is edited by some of the most prominent Mott experts in the United States: Christopher Densmore, curator of the Friends Historical Library at Swarthmore College, where many of Mott's papers are located; Carol Faulkner, professor of history at Syracuse University and author of the recent authoritative biography of Mott, *Lucretia Mott's Heresy: Abolition and Women's Rights in Nineteenth-Century America* (2011); Nancy Hewitt, Distinguished Professor Emerita of History and Women's and Gender Studies at Rutgers University; and Beverly Wilson Palmer, research associate at Pomona College and editor of *Selected Letters of Lucretia Coffin Mott* (2002), a comprehensive collection of Mott's correspondence.

Lucretia Mott Speaks builds on the earlier volume, *Lucretia Mott: Her Complete Speeches and Sermons*, which was edited by Dana Greene and published in 1980. Mott spoke extemporaneously, and Greene accomplished the challenging task of locating 49 transcriptions of Mott's speeches and sermons in various sources. Unfortunately, the volume was not widely accessible, having been published by a small academic press with limited production. Greene's book includes a detailed introduction to Mott's life and work and a brief index of proper names, but it does not contain a full index and lacks annotations.

The editors of *Lucretia Mott Speaks* acknowledge the importance of Greene's path-breaking contribution and expand on it in several invaluable ways. The Introduction, written by Faulkner and Hewitt, helpfully situates Mott's life and work. Mott's speeches and sermons reveal a complex, radical thinker and activist with wide-ranging concerns that were not limited to abolitionism and early women's rights, for which she is best known. Rather, Mott spoke on many issues that confronted nineteenth-century America and continue to challenge the world today, including 'racism, feminism, religious freedom, international peace and cooperation, education and democracy' (p. xi). Drawing from her speeches and sermons, Faulkner and Hewitt argue that Mott was a tireless advocate for a democratic, egalitarian, humanistic worldview that was deeply informed by her adherence to Hicksite Quakerism. She did not hesitate to speak out against corrupt authority figures and frequently incurred their wrath, but her writings show that she never succumbed to cynicism in the face of seemingly intractable problems. The multifaceted nature of Mott's views led her to form a wide variety of alliances among Unitarians, freethinkers, anti-Sabbatarians, anti-clericalists, and others, who often served as her audience. Unlike other American women's rights advocates, Mott did not focus primarily or exclusively on suffrage, but rather promoted greater political, religious, economic, educational, social and cultural opportunities. Although Mott participated in formal women's rights associations

and conventions, her scepticism of hierarchical social structures held her back from fully endorsing these reform efforts. Even Mott's abolitionism was distinctive: her commitment never wavered in her lifetime, even after the American Civil War, and she went beyond the primarily white reform community by establishing long-standing partnerships with African American men and women.

The editors add new information found in newspapers including the *Anti-Slavery Bugle*, the *Liberator*, and the *Pennsylvania Freeman*, bringing the total number of speeches and sermons included in the volume to 60. The Mott manuscript collection at the Friends Historical Library and special collections at Haverford College contain some abbreviated transcriptions and summaries that are incorporated into the volume as well. Indeed, the editors have located among these manuscripts a reference to what is probably Mott's first speech, thereby allowing readers to more accurately trace the chronology and trajectory of her career. Additional speeches between 1838 and 1841 shed light on Mott's early work by introducing readers to important themes that appear consistently throughout her lifetime. By including accounts of Mott's speeches made during and after the pivotal 1848 Seneca Falls Women's Rights Convention, the editors show that the women's rights movement was one of many commitments in Mott's life. Equally importantly, readers see that the Seneca Falls meeting did not necessarily loom as large for Mott as it did for Elizabeth Cady Stanton, the main creator of the conventional account of the movement in *The History of Woman Suffrage* (1881, 1882, 1886). An impressive array of detailed annotations accompanies each entry, and the comprehensive index allows researchers to navigate Mott's considerable body of work. Painstaking efforts have been made to proofread and cross-check multiple versions when available, and otherwise distracting grammatical and spelling errors are corrected.

Lucretia Mott Speaks is comprehensive, but it does not contain all of the approximately 190 lectures that the editors have located in a variety of sources. The editors explain that their selections avoid repetition and 'present critical themes and important events in Mott's long and distinguished public life' (pp. xi–xii). Perhaps more could have been said about these themes and the criteria that were applied in the process of selecting the most relevant works for the volume.

This book lays excellent groundwork for much-needed scholarship. Although Mott is well known in Quaker circles and by historians, scholars in other disciplines should also find *Lucretia Mott Speaks* to be a particularly rich source of material for analysis. General readers will be pleasantly surprised to find a lively, spirited, radical, complex woman who defies common stereotypes. Mott's tireless advocacy of freedom and equality for all of humanity, which emerges so vividly through her speeches and sermons, offers a compelling perspective in an often-troubled world.

Lisa Pace Vetter

Associate Professor of Political Science and Affiliate Associate Professor of Gender and Women's Studies, University of Maryland, Baltimore County (UMBC)

Anthony Urvina with Sally Urvina, *More Than God Demands: Politics & Influence of Christian Missions in Northwest Alaska, 1897–1918* (Fairbanks: University of Alaska Press, 2016), pp. xvi + 311. ISBN 9781602232938. Paperback, £37.50.

Enaya Hammad Othman, *Negotiating Palestinian Womanhood: Encounters between Palestinian Women and American Missionaries, 1880s–1940s* (Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2016), pp. xxiv + 271. ISBN 9781498509237. Hardback, £90.

Any history of Christian missions in the modern era is fraught with complications and contradictions. On the one hand, missionaries and their supporters at home felt divinely compelled by the Gospel call to ‘go ye ... and teach all the nations’—a sacred calling to ‘share the Good News’ of Christ’s atonement and gift of ‘eternal salvation’. On the other, notions of Western cultural superiority, bolstered by the West’s global economic hegemony and military prowess, seeped into the on-the-ground evangelising efforts. As Jean and John Comaroff in their 1991 seminal study of Christian missions and the European civilising enterprise in South Africa argue, ‘bearers of the religion of the book ... believed that, by teaching the natives to read, they would set them on the path of self-improvement and salvation, revelation and refinement, civilization and, finally, conversion’.¹ The near eradication of many of the customs and languages of indigenous peoples in the Americas, Oceania and elsewhere, often through Christian schools and health services, attests to the effectiveness of a cultural imperialism, whether intentional or not, that often accompanied mission work. Yet, in his 2012 study on the benefits of Protestant missions, Robert D. Woodberry suggests that some missionaries, ‘conversionary Protestants’ in particular,

were a crucial catalyst in initiating the development and spread of religious liberty, mass education, mass printing, newspapers, voluntary organisations, most major colonial reforms, and the codification of legal protections for non-whites in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.²

The two books reviewed here, the Urvinas’ *More than God Demands* and Othman’s *Negotiating Palestinian Womanhood*, both explore the drawbacks and possibilities of missionary civilising efforts—of cultural imperialism on the one hand, and the possibility of individual agency and empowerment on the other. More importantly for this review essay, each book draws from Quaker missionary endeavours as a lens through which to examine mission work in Alaska and Palestine, respectively.

Anthony Urvina’s study of Western missionaries’ efforts to assimilate the Iñupiat peoples of the north-western Alaskan frontier into American civilisation in the early twentieth century doubles as a deeply personal account about his mother,

1 Comaroff, J. and Comaroff, J., *Of Revelation and Revolution: Christianity, colonialism, and consciousness in South Africa*, Vol. I, Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1991, pp. 63–64.

2 Woodberry, R. D., ‘The Missionary Roots of Liberal Democracy’, *American Political Science Review* 106/2 (2012), pp. 244–45.

Bertha Cahill, who, born to an Irish father and Iñupiat mother and orphaned as a toddler, was raised in a Lutheran mission near Nome, Alaska. His mother's childhood was, in Urvina's retelling, 'harsh, even severe', but he knew very little about her early years until a larger story began to unfold within the 'Reindeer Files'. As natural resources manager for the Alaska region of the Bureau of Indian Affairs, Urvina had access to the Bureau's Alaska School Service and Alaska Reindeer Service documents, known collectively as the Reindeer Files. The information he gleaned created for Urvina not only 'a bridge to understanding the circumstances' surrounding his mother's life but also 'a better understanding' of his mother (p. 2). A number of Christian missions in Alaska are mentioned in the book, but the Reindeer Files yielded a particularly rich cache of documents related to California Yearly Meeting's mission schools in north-west Alaska.

If the documents on the Friends mission did not answer Urvina's specific questions about his mother's early years, they did offer context. Although California Friends were firmly situated within the Gurneyite wing of Quakerdom and espoused Holiness evangelicalism—a relatively radical form of Christianity quite unlike, for example, Lutheranism—Urvina argues that Quakers, like other missionaries, viewed Iñupiat culture as inferior, if not amoral. 'Within the religious territories where intolerance ruled, traditional language, traditional names, and traditional dancing were forbidden in an effort to transform Natives into Christianized Anglo-Americans.' In the case of Friends, he continues, 'Religious intolerance ... unquestionably marred the altruistic motivations of Quaker missionaries in their effort to transform Iñupiat culture and customs' (p. 87). While Urvina acknowledges that Friends and other missionaries were well-intentioned and adopted what they believed to be a strategy of benevolent moral uplift, he also submits that their disregard for the essential value of Iñupiat culture and their habit of othering indigenous peoples was not only harmful and destructive but a form of 'supreme hypocrisy' (p. 208). As Quaker missionary Otha Thomas observed, 'Sometimes, I think the church expects more of the Eskimo than God demands' (p. 84). More poignantly, Urvina wonders how his Iñupiat mother, raised by Anglo-American Christians, was never shown 'mercy or forgiveness' for her otherness (p. 211).

Urvina is not exploring new territory here. The Camaroffs and other students of Christian missions have suggested that the missionary enterprise was too often a calamitous form of cultural imperialism. This is evident, according to Urvina, in his own mother's painful story, and her personal suffering undoubtedly shaped Urvina's analysis.

Of course, missionaries are not the only culprits examined in Urvina's critique of Western imperialism. 'Capitalists'—particularly, missionary teachers who dabbled in trade, prospecting, and the nascent reindeer industry—and government bureaucrats are also held accountable for the marginalisation of Iñupiat peoples and the erosion of their culture. Urvina censures United States officials for the nation's failed treaty system, forced placement of Native peoples

on reservations, and attempts to implement variations of the 'British Columbia Plan'. This 'Plan' was a utopian Christian colony, Old Metlakatla, which was founded in 1862, located near the Alaskan–British Columbian border, and comprised of a First Nations people known as Tsimshian. The founder of the colony, Anglican missionary William Duncan, endeavoured to adopt a variation of Henry Venn's mission strategy, which emphasised indigenous leadership, inclusivity, and financial self-sufficiency while warning against paternalism and 'racialism'. Nevertheless, Urvina contends, Duncan's claims to extend a measure of agency to the Tsimshian at Old Metlakatla, as well as any government attempts at establishing similar colonies elsewhere, were thwarted by a deeply rooted intolerance for non-Western culture. Instead, the underlying intent of missionaries, businesspeople, and bureaucrats remained the same then and, Urvina asserts, even now: 'to strip Native peoples of their cultural identity and "vanish" them into white society' (p. 206).

Enaya Hammad Othman covers similar terrain in *Negotiating Palestinian Womanhood*. In her examination of the Ramallah Friends mission for Palestinian girls from the late nineteenth century to the mid-twentieth century, Othman likewise recognises the 'cultural baggage' and 'racist ideologies' of Western missionaries, in this case American Quaker women. These missionaries hoped to 'educate and uplift the womanhood of the land', yet they too tended to view Palestinian women in a 'negative light' (pp. 37–38). However, there are significant differences between the two books. An academic, Othman offers a more extensive, nuanced and measured study of the Ramallah mission, its teachers, and its students than does Urvina, thus maintaining a fairly dispassionate stance in her narrative. Perhaps most significantly, members of Othman's family did not suffer at the hands of Christian missionaries as did Urvina's mother. While Othman's older sister attended Friends Girls School (FGS) at Ramallah for a brief period, her experiences would have been quite different. Cahill was a penniless orphan, while students at FGS hailed from wealthier and intact families. Furthermore, while the exploration of California Friends missions in Alaska is a backdrop to the larger plight of Iñupiat and other aboriginal peoples, Othman places the Ramallah school and its students at the centre of her analysis. Finally, the students at the Ramallah mission were less passive victims and instead more likely to possess agency than were the historical actors in Urvina's accounting. Palestinian young women actively negotiated the tensions between the cultural discourses of their Muslim or Orthodox Christian roots and that of their Western teachers in ways that were purposeful and meaningful for them.

The overarching purpose of Othman's study is to examine the influence of Quaker and 'modern' education, in contrast to traditional forms of instruction, on 'Palestinian women's views of gender and nationalism' (p. xii). And, here, she suggests, Quaker missionaries were uniquely equipped to undergird Palestinian women's growing sense of womanhood, personal identity, nationalism, and civic responsibility, especially in the post-First World War era. Friends' enduring

commitment to altruism, internationalism, peace, and political neutrality enriched the social and intellectual milieu of the school, even if the missionaries were encumbered with Orientalist perceptions about the Palestinian girls. As a result, FGS students were more likely to pursue a college education and become teachers, Othman submits, than were their peers who attended other Palestinian schools.

Drawing from extensive FGS and other archival holdings, student-edited newspapers, and interviews with FGS alumni, Othman traces the history of the Ramallah School from its nineteenth-century beginnings until 1948, when the western swath of Palestine came under Jordanian control. She opens her study by offering a geohistorical background of the region, a glimpse of Eli and Sybil Jones' vision for a Quaker mission in Ramallah, and an overview of the subsequent founding of Friends' girls training homes. Like Urvina, she illuminates the paternalistic attitudes of American missionaries and their desire to rescue Arab women from what they perceived to be oppressive marriage customs and, later, in the case of Muslim women, the veil. Othman likens the Protestant missionary enterprise to 'spiritual imperialism', but she carefully frames Western biases that informed missionary practice at Ramallah (p. 29). Quaker missionaries, often nourished in fairly homogeneous and rural cocoons in the United States, typically lacked a sophisticated awareness of non-Western societies that might have facilitated a more sensitive appreciation for and seamless integration of Palestinian customs and mores at FGS. Instead, like their counterparts at other Christian missions, Quaker missionaries brought with them entrenched American notions of true womanhood, the cult of domesticity and female modesty, and a desire to convert even Orthodox Christians to the one true expression of religious faith, specifically Quakerism. In this, Othman contends, missionaries at the Ramallah mission failed (p. 46). Few of their students ever converted.

The years after the First World War brought a significant change, according to Othman, in missionary practice and attitudes about Palestine at FGS. The British, under the Mandate system, ended proselytising restrictions with the fall of the Ottoman Empire, and large numbers of Muslim students entered FGS classrooms, engendering a more diverse student population. At the same time, long-term missionaries, in particular, were changed by their immersive experiences in Palestine and increasingly recognised the need to develop more culturally sensitive educational strategies. During this post-war phase of cross-cultural engagement, female missionaries viewed Palestinians as 'more modern under British rule and romanticized aspects of Palestinian culture as authentically connected to Biblical times' (p. 77). While not all missionaries 'transcended their prejudices and misconceptions', their increasingly empathetic view of Palestinians led to a new approach to educational mission, one that tended to accommodate the religious beliefs and social circumstances of FGS students (pp. 70, 79). Thereafter, Quaker missionaries were more likely to adapt to Palestinian cultural traits and honour social customs in the classroom and beyond. While Othman cautions that misconceptions about Palestinian culture was not completely eradicated at

this time, she does acknowledge that ‘American Quaker women who served at the Ramallah Mission were more prepared mentally, culturally, and linguistically than their earlier generation ... to appreciate native culture and the norms of Palestinian society’ (p. 101).

Even so, the more culturally sensitive curriculum and a growing desire among young Palestinian women to ‘create and solidify a place for themselves in a rapidly changing society’ did not alter the school’s ‘central religious message that women were the guardians of household ethics’. Indeed, FGS students endorsed this idea. Like their missionary teachers, Palestinian students believed that an educational programme that emphasised domesticity accorded them authority as educated mothers at home and empowered them as ‘reformers and teachers in society’ (p. 149). FGS students were exposed to Western ideas, including Western-style feminism, but they modified American concepts and practices in ways that cohered with ‘Palestinian religious and cultural norms’ (p. 179).

Students of Quaker missionary practice will find both Othman’s and Urvina’s works of interest, although some may find Othman’s study provides a more thorough and expansive analysis. Like Urvina, Othman does not soften her criticism of Western misperceptions of Palestinian culture, but she does note that FGS alumni ‘became prominent in the Arab world by either providing direct influence in their careers or through their marriage’ (p. 177). Thus, her work echoes Woodberry’s contention that some missions were catalysts for empowering local peoples and equipping them for leadership roles in the home and beyond. Othman does not explore the role of evangelicalism and the Holiness Movement in the formation of early Quaker mission work, the growing fragmentation between different branches of the faith, or the fundamental differences between those Friends’ missions that continued to focus primarily on conversion and those, like FGS, that increasingly centred their efforts on educational uplift. Of course, these issues were beyond the scope of her study. Nevertheless, Othman’s astute study is a valuable contribution to the field of Quaker missionary practice.

Jacalynn Stuckey
Malone University